



universität
wien

MASTERARBEIT / MASTER'S THESIS

Titel der Masterarbeit / Title of the Master's Thesis

„Patterns of Consciousness Formation
among Women
belonging to the Dari-speaking Afghan Diasporas
of Austria and Pakistan.“

verfasst von / submitted by

Mechthild Geyer, BA MSc

angestrebter akademischer Grad / in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts (MA)

Wien, 2019 / Vienna 2019

Studienkennzahl lt. Studienblatt /
degree programme code as it appears on
the student record sheet:

A 066 805

Studienrichtung lt. Studienblatt /
degree programme as it appears on
the student record sheet:

Masterstudium Globalgeschichte und Global Studies

Betreut von / Supervisor:

Univ.-Prof. Dr. Margarete Maria Grandner

Acknowledgements

This is dedicated to all who have contributed to the realization of this project. Of course, I need to apologize that I cannot mention every person who participated in this research - especially, the 57 women in Austria and Pakistan who were content to fill my questionnaires. So, everyone mentioned down below represents some greater background and network. Although this work has tried to make obvious, that representations always fail to depict the reality, it needs to make use of these representations. Knowing that life is much more than that: more amazing, more colorful and more diverse than any of our representations can articulate. Thank you and tashakkor besior siod for supporting me learning this!

Kobra Gol Ahmadi, pharmaceutical assistant in Vienna, mother of one cheerful daughter, my friend, for her advice, the distribution of ten questionnaires and her energizing spirit.

Elaine Alam, Secretary General of FACES Pakistan, for her openminded attitude and for facilitating my entire research stay in Lahore.

Michael Fanizadeh, fellow of the Vienna Institute for International Dialogue and Cooperation (VIDC), director of the consortium Migration & Development of the umbrella organization Global Responsibility, for his advice and his support in networking.

Franz Geyer, doctor, my beloved father, for listening and supporting me financially.

Mir Ghousuddin, founder and head of the cultural association Afghanische Kultur, Integration und Solidarität (AKIS), social worker in Vienna, my friend, for his imperturbable belief in me, his strong support in networking and in the distribution of questionnaires.

Margarete Maria Grandner, professor at the University of Vienna, associate chairwoman of the Department of Development Studies there, supervisor of this thesis, for her wise counsel in many respects and her pragmatism that not rarely helped me to get my head out of the clouds.

Eva Maria Gromotka-Geyer, doctor, my dearly beloved mummy, for myriads of hours she spent listening and giving sage advice, not least for supporting me financially.

Korbinian Grünwald, doctoral candidate at the University of Vienna, my friend and supporter, for reading my groundworks and counseling.

Placidus Bernhard Heider, lecturer at the universities of Salzburg, Munich (LMU), Regensburg and Ulm, chaplain, my dear friend and teacher, for being prepared to debate, for answering every request, and for being there.

Ali Hosseini, chairman of the cultural association KATIB, for his openness and his spontaneous support of this research.

Tanya Kayhan, founder and director of the cultural association Interkulturelles Entwicklungszentrum, for her strong support and her many helpful assertions.

Nasir Khan, faculty member of the Department of Education at the International Islamic University Islamabad (IIU), my friend and brother, for encouraging me again and again to go for my dreams.

Yasir Khan, doctoral candidate at the University of Vienna, my friend and supporter, for the many hours he spent with organizing my research stay in Pakistan, for his wise counsel and for his encouraging spirit.

Jafar Khavari, skilled cameraman and human rights activist, for connecting me with many helpful persons and for encouraging me with his vitality.

Farhad Langari, fellow of the cultural association AKIS, my friend, for translating my questionnaire and counseling.

Herbert Langthaler, outreach director of the Asylkoordination, for accompanying all my activities benevolently and giving strong support in networking.

Amna Mahmood, professor and chairperson of the Department for Political Science and International Relations at the International Islamic University Islamabad, my friend and teacher, for her warm-heartedness and her willingness to discuss my project intensively.

Nabila Naseri Naebkhel, legal advisor from Kabul living in Vienna, mother of five, my friend and sister, for many translations she's made on my behalf, for her loving support and strong contributions to the study's issue.

Tehzeeb Nayyer, development assistant at FACES Pakistan, mother of one lovely daughter, my dear friend, for spending wonderful time with me in Lahore, for answering all my questions and seeing me to the refugee camp.

Nader Nazari, founder and head of the cultural association KATIB, for his willingness to cooperate and for his great hospitality.

Michael Platzer, fellow of the Academic Council on the United Nations System (ACUNS), for investing a lot of time in me and my project, and for advising me prudently.

Fazel Rahman, foundation member and director of the cultural association Afghan Wulas, my friend, for his advice and support.

Farhan Raza, educationist and human rights activist, my friend, for his belief in me and the spread of my concern all around Austria.

Syed Asad Abbas Rizvi, assistant professor at the International Islamic University Islamabad, my friend and colleague, for the myriads of hours he spent with networking, for facilitating my entire research stay in Islamabad and for conveying good advice steadily.

Afsar Rathor, fellow of the Academic Council on the United Nations System (ACUNS), for his hospitality and his sage advice.

Asif Safdary, member of the cultural association Interessensgemeinschaft Afghanischer SchülerInnen und StudentInnen (IGASuS), for his interest, his encouraging and innovative spirit and his support in distributing questionnaires.

Akhtar Hussain Sandhu, professor at the Department of History, University of Education Lahore, my friend and colleague, for welcoming me very warm-heartedly in Lahore, for his cordial hospitality, and his advice concerning my project.

Amadou-Lamine Sarr, lecturer at the Department of History, University of Vienna, subinvestigator of the defense of this project, for his willingness to invest time and advise me, and for living the spirit of equality.

Javaid William, director of FACES Pakistan, for welcoming me openly and facilitating my entire research stay in Lahore.

Andreas Zingg, taskmaster of the Austrian Caritas' Foreign Aid section Pakistan, for his strong support in networking with Pakistani institutions and his infectious capacity for enthusiasm.

On the next two pages, the acknowledgments are repeated in Dari.

Translation English – German: Mechthild Geyer.

Translation German – Dari: Nabila Naseri Naebkhel.

سپاس نامه

این شکر گذاری (سپاس نامه) به انعه اشخاصی اختصاص داده شده است که در اجرای این پروژه کمک نموده اند

ازینکه قادر به ذکر اسامی تمام همکاران این پروژه نمیباشم عذر خواهی مینمایم
یک تشکر خاص از (۵۷) تن زنایکه در اتریش و پاکستان
پرسشنامه مرا آماده و تکمیل نموده اند مینمایم

اسم های را که درین سپاسنامه ذکر نموده ام یک پس زمینه بزرگ و یک شبکه است اگر چه این کار تلاش کامل نموده نشان دهد که نماینده گی ها همیشه نامناسب برای نشان دادن تمام واقعیت ها است
من باید از این نماینده گی ها استفاده کنم
من این کار را با دانش کامل انجام میدهم که زنده گی جذاب تر ، رنگین تر ، متنوع تر و بیشتر از ان است که نماینده گی ما بیان میتواند است
سپاس زیاد از کمک شما به من در یادگیری اسامی ذیل به اساس الفبای لاتین
کبرا گل احمدی :

دستیار دارویی در وین مادر دختر روشنفکر ، دوست من برای مشاوره و توزیع (۱۰) پرسشنامه و نگرانی های پر ارژی ایشان
پاکستان برای نگرش باز ایشان و فراهم نمودن زمینه برای انجام **FACES** الیام آرام : دبیرکل تحقیقات من در لاهور پاکستان

ریس گروه کاری **VIDC** مایکل فانی زاده : کارمند موسسه وین برای گفتگو و همکاری بین المللی
مهاجرت و توسعه سازمان جهانی چتر برای مشاوره و پشتیبانی ایشان از این شبکه
فرانس گایر : پدر . عزیز . من برای حمایت مالی و گوش دادن به من
دوست من و کارمند اجتماعی در وین برای **AKIS** غوث الدین میر : بنیانگذار و مدی انجمن فرهنگی
اعتماد و ایمان بی قید و شرط به من و حمایت قوی ایشان در توزیع پرسشنامه و حمایت از شبکه
مارگاریت ماریا گاردنر : استاد در دانشگاه وین ، معاون موسسه بین المللی توسعه و کارشناس ان برای
مشوره های عاقلانه و مصلحت گرایی هایشان که اغلب به من کمک نمود تا سر خود را از ابرها
بیرون بیاورم

ایفا ماریا گروموتکا گایر : داکتر . و مادر دوستداشتنی من برا ساعت های بیشماری که به من گوش داده و مشوره های خوبی ارایه نموده و همچنان کمک های مالی ایشان
لوربینیان گرون والد : دانشجوی دوکتورا در دانشگاه وین دوست و حامی من برای خواندن کار و پیشگامی من و مشاوره های ایشان

پلاسیدوس برنهارد هایدن مدرس در دانشگاه سالزبورگ ، مونیخ . **رگسنبورگ و اولم** (شبان) دوست صمیمی و معلم من برای جواب دادن به سوال ها و تمایل رسیده گی بیشتر ایشان یعنی همیشه برای من حاضر بوده اند

علی حسینی : ریس انجمن فرهنگی کاتب برای باز بودن و حمایت شان برای این تحقیق
تانیا کیهان : بنیانگذار و مدیر مرکز فرهنگی توسعه فرهنگی برای پشتیبانی قوی و بیان نکات مفید
شان

ناصر خان : مدرس در دانشگاه وزارت آموزش و پرورش از اسلام آباد مدرس در دانشگاه اسلامی و وزارت آموزش و پرورش از اسلام آباد دوست و برادر من که همیشه به من **IIU** بین المللی جرعت داده است تا رویا های خود را تحقق ببخشم

یاسر خان دانشجوی دوکتورا در دانشگاه وین دوست و حامی من که ساعت های بیشماری را برای سازماندهی تحقیقات من در پاکستان صرف نموده و . همچنان مشاوره های عاقلانه و روان قوی ایشان

جعفر خاوری :فلمبردار .آموزش دیده و فعال حقوق بشر که بسیار ی از اطلاعات مفید را به من ارایه نموده و مرا با شور و نشاط خود الهام بخشیده است

دوست من و برای ترجمه پرسشنامه و رهنمایی **AKIS** فرهاد لنگری :کامند انجمن فرهنگی هربرت لنگ تاهلر :ریس روابط عمومی انحطاف پذیری محاجرین برای پشتیبانی قوی از همنوع خود فعالیت های من و شبکه،

آمنه محمود : .استاد و ریس موسسه علوم سیاسی و روابط بین المللی در اسلام اباد دانشگاه اسلامی . بین المللی دوست و معلم من برای گرما و تمایل شدید ایشان برای بحث در مورد پروژه من **اختر .حسین ساندو** :آموزگار در موسسه تاریخ دانشگاه آموزش و پرورش لاهور دوست و همکار من برای استقبال گرم و مهمان نوازی زیاد و توسعه پروژه من

آمادو لامینه سنار : .دانش آموز .در .موسسه تاریخ دانشگاه وین دفاع این کار برای مشورت شدید ایشان برای دیدن برابری روح همه انسانها

در .پاکستان برای استقبال گرم و فراهم سازی پروژه من در .پاکستان **FACES** جاویدا ویلیم :مدیر **اندریاس زینکل** :مدیر .پروژه برای کمک های خارجی در پاکستان

نبیله ناصری نایب خیل :مشاورحقوقی از کابل که در وین زندگی مینماید مادر .پنج فرزند ، دوست و خواهر من برای ترجمه و حمایت دوستداشتنی شانو همچنان سهم قوی شان در تمرکز این مطالعه پاکستان مادر دختر زیبا دوست صمیمی من برای اوقات **FACES** تهنید نایر: . امدادگر در بسیار زیبا در لاهور پاکستان و برای جواب دادن به سوالات من همچون راهنمایی های ایشان در کمپ پناهنده گان

برای تمایل به همکاری و مهمان نوازی **KATIB** نادر نظری :بنیانگذار و ریس انجمن فرهنگی ایشان

برای سرمایه گذاری و **ACUNS** **مایکل پلاتزار** :عضو شورای علمی در سازمان ملل متحد نگرانی هایش همچون مشاوره ایشان

فاضل رحمان : عضو بنیانگذارو ریس انجمن فرهنگی (افغان ولس (دوست من برای مشاوره و پشتیبانی ایشان

فرهان رضا :مربی و فعال حقوق بشر دوست من برای اعتقاد و گسترش نگرانی من در سراسر اتریش

سید اسد عباسی رضوی :استاد در دانشگاه اسلامی اسلام اباد دوست و همکار من برای ساعت های بیشماری کاری شبکه یی مشاورخوب منظو و همچنان فراهم سازی امکانات تحقیقات من در اسلام اباد پاکستان

برای مهمان نوازی و مشاوره **ACUNS** **افسر راتور** :کارکن شورای علمی در سازمان ملل متحد های عاقلانه شان

IGASS **آصف صفدری** :عضو انجمن فرهنگی گروه علاقه دانش آموزان افغان و دانش آموزان برای پشتیبانی و حمایت مشاوره های عاقلانه شان

A. Statutory Declaration

Herewith, I declare that I have compiled this master's thesis independently and exclusively by myself. It is the result of my own investigations and of insights facilitated by secondary literature. Hereof, I confirm having used solely the sources published with the list of references.

Moreover, I declare, that I have marked all sections which I have quoted out of the references either literally or according to their content, to the best of my knowledge and belief. Finally, I guarantee that this work has not been submitted previously to any other university to apply for an award, a publication or an academic degree.

Vienna, March 06th 2019



Mechthild Geyer

B. Table of Contents

A. Statutory Declaration.....	1
B. Table of Contents	2
C. List of Tables.....	6
D. Glossary.....	7
E. List of Abbreviations.....	8
G. Foreword	9
1. INTRODUCTION.....	10
1.1. Presentation of the hypotheses.....	10
1.2. A women's history of Afghanistan	13
2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	21
2.1. Definitions.....	21
2.1.1. Agency according to Judith Butler	21
2.1.2. Consciousness according to Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel.....	23
2.1.3. Diaspora.....	25
2.1.4. Ethnicity.....	26
2.1.5. Geopolitics of knowledge	27
2.1.6. Hegemony according to Antonio Gramsci	28
2.1.7. Locality according to Arjun Appadurai.....	29
2.1.8. Pashtunwali.....	30
2.1.9. Qawm.....	30
2.2. Approaching general patterns of consciousness formation.....	31
2.3. Self-localization of the author.....	34
3. METHODS.....	36
3.1. Comment on the methodological background	36
3.2. Capacities of the mixed methods approach.....	37
3.3. Quantitative inquiry: questionnaires	38

3.3.1.	Procedure of the questionnaire's distribution	39
3.3.2.	Disadvantage of this method	40
3.4.	Qualitative inquiry: semi-structured interviews.....	41
3.5.	Connecting with participants via Facebook	41
3.6.	Reasoning the criteria for the choice of participants.....	42
3.6.1.	Womanhood or female self-definition.....	42
3.6.2.	Dari as the or one of the main languages.....	42
3.6.3.	Permanent residence in Austria or Pakistan for maximum 20 years	43
3.7.	Literature review	44
3.7.1.	Search following the snowball principle	44
3.7.2.	Overview of existing literature	45
3.8.	Experiences from the field work in Pakistan compared to the work in Austria	46
3.9.	Methodological improvements for raising the potential of future research.....	47
3.9.1.	Cultural sensitivity.....	47
3.9.2.	Statistics program R.....	47
3.9.3.	The issue of translation.....	48
3.9.4.	Missing variable in the Declarations of Consent on interviews	48
4.	ANALYSIS	49
4.1	Introduction of the Austrian and the Pakistani questionnaire samples	49
4.2	Close analysis of the main hypothesis	52
4.3	Afghan women's preference of social units.....	54
4.4	Impact of the educational level on the shape of Afghan women's consciousness	56
4.5	The impact of religious belief on the shape of Afghan women's consciousness ..	57
4.6	Consciousness in dependency of the gender perception.....	60
4.7	Consciousness formation in accordance with environmental circumstances	61
4.8	First impressions of the participants' self-representations on Facebook	63
4.9	Literature review on the impact of poetry and oral history on consciousness.....	64
4.10	Lessons from Afghan women's self-consciousness: a challenge to <i>nationness</i>	66

5. DISCUSSION	71
5.1. The own family's crucial role and fathers' impact	71
5.2. The marriage market – negative influence of the bride price on women's consciousness	73
5.3. On the mutual influence of educational level and religiosity	76
5.4. Perception of the own gender's position differing between Austria and Pakistan	77
5.5. Aspects future research should grapple with	79
5.5.1. Complete commodification of women: sex work among Afghans	80
5.5.2. Collective consciousness, solidarity and the promotion of education.....	81
5.5.3. The role of family names and males as sons and heirs.....	82
5.5.4. The language system and its impact on consciousness formation.....	82
6. CONCLUSION	84
7. LIST OF REFERENCES	87
8. APPENDIX	96
8.1. Transcriptions of the interviews.....	96
8.1.1. Qualitative inquiry No. 1, impressions from the refugee camp in Lahore / Pakistan	96
8.1.2. Expert interview No. 1 with a representative of FACES Pakistan.....	99
8.1.3. Expert interview No. 2 with a professor of the Department of Political Science and International Relations, Faculty of Social Sciences, International Islamic University, Islamabad / Pakistan.....	101
8.1.4. Qualitative interview No. 2, students of the International Islamic University Islamabad (IIU)	106
8.1.5. Qualitative interview No. 3, student of the International Islamic University Islamabad (IIU)	111
8.1.6. Qualitative interview No. 4 with a former fellow of Medica Mondiale in Kabul / Afghanistan, now resident in Vienna / Austria	118
8.1.7. Qualitative interview No. 5 with a pharmaceutical assistant, Vienna / Austria	

8.1.8. Qualitative interview No. 6 with a former fellow of Voice of America in Kabul / Afghanistan, talk in the rooms of her cultural association in Vienna	135
8.2. Form of the Questionnaire in English.....	144
8.3. Semi-guided interviews: Questions and Declaration of Consent.....	149
8.3.1. Qualitative interview questions	149
8.3.2. Form for the Declaration of Consent on publishing the interview	150
8.4. Form for the Declarations of Consent of the project's participants on networking with the study's author	151
8.5. Abstract in English.....	152
8.6. Abstract in German	153

C. List of Tables

Table 1: Overlapping features of the terms <i>diaspora</i> and <i>ethnicity</i> . - Own compilation.....	47
Table 2: Austrian participants' characteristics. (n = 50) – Own compilation.	50
Table 3: Pakistani participants' characteristics. (n = 7) – Own compilation.	52
Table 4: Answers of the participants in Austria (n = 50) to question 4 of the questionnaire (most valuable group in daily life) as dependent of the educational level. – Own compilation.....	57
Table 5: Answers of the participants in Pakistan (n=7) to question 4 of the questionnaire (most valuable group in daily life) as dependent of the educational level. – Own compilation.	57
Table 6: Personal rating of religion as expressed by daily time for prayer among the participants in Austria (n = 50) in dependency of the years of schooling. – Own compilation.	59
Table 7: Personal rating of religion as expressed by daily time for prayer among the participants in Pakistan (n = 7) in dependency of years of schooling. – Own compilation.	59
Table 8: Personal perception of the own gender's disadvantaging social meaning as dependent of age. Answers given by the women in Austria, n = 50. – Own compilation.	60
Table 9: Personal perception of the own gender's disadvantaging social meaning as dependent of age. Answers given by the women in Pakistan, n = 7. – Own compilation.	60

D. Glossary

Islamists = according to the French sociologist Olivier Roy religiously motivated individuals and groups of whom the most are products of the government educational system and / or the madrasas. (Misdaq 2006, page 145)

Loya Jirga = grand assembly; the Afghan 'parliament' consisting of 1.550 politicians, which is still far from gender equality (Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 59)

Madrasa = Religious school teaching a living according to the Sharia law; available for boys and girls but strongly opposed to co-education; the educational network based on madrasas builds an ideological and social hub that crosses national borders and party-lines (Stahlmann 2018, page 63)

Mahram = concept to regulate the relationships of females and males; women are allowed to spend their time with a mahram who can either be their husband or their blood relative, the mahram has the duty to protect the woman (Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 18)

Namahram = concept to regulate the relationships of females and males and opposite of mahram; the namahram is neither the husband nor a blood relative, hence, a woman should not interact with the namahram (Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 18)

Purdah = Compulsory segregation and veiling of all women of a society, men control women completely under seclusion (Moghadam 2002, page 22)

Shabamah = night letters of the Taliban; death threats posted in mosques or slipped under doorways to everyone who cooperates with the United States of America or the Kabul government (Coll 2018, page 144)

E. List of Abbreviations

CIA = Central Intelligence Agency of the United States of America

DOAW = Democratic Organization of Afghan Women; established 1965

FATA = Federally Administrated Tribal Area; debatable semi-autonomous tribal region in the north-west of Pakistan with a border to Afghanistan, merged with the neighboring Pakistani province Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in 2018

ISI = Inter Services Intelligence; intelligence service of the Pakistani army

ISKP = Islamic State Khorasan Province; the Afghan franchise of the so-called Islamic State, locally mostly denoted with the Arabic acronym *Daesh*

NDS = National Directorate of Security; Afghan domestic intelligence service

NWFP = North-West Frontier Province; nowadays Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, province of Pakistan, renamed in 2010 to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa – Pakhtunkhwa meaning “the land of the Pashtuns”

PDPA = People’s Democratic Party of Afghanistan; communist party ruling Afghanistan from 1978 until 1992

RAWA = Revolutionary Association of the Women of Afghanistan; based in Quetta / Pakistan

SIGAR = Special Inspector General for Afghanistan Reconstruction

SPACH = Society for the Preservation of Afghanistan’s Cultural Heritage; established 1994

UNAMA = United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan; political mission of the United Nations Organization in Afghanistan based on Resolution 1401 adopted by the UN Security Council in 2002

WLUML = Women Living Under Muslim Laws, women’s rights organization; South Asian branch: Shirkat Gah, based in Lahore / Pakistan

G. Foreword

The professor of anthropology and distinguished connoisseur of Afghanistan Thomas Barfield introduces his seminal work *Afghanistan. A cultural and political history* with the assertion that accounts of outsiders belong to the most striking ones. This is the case, according to Barfield, because the authors of these accounts “cogently analyzed what their interlocutors took as boringly self-evident.”¹

I’m indeed an absolute outsider to the society I’m writing about: a white woman with German citizenship and Christian background interested mostly in that awe-inspiring country Afghanistan and its fascinating peoples; a convinced, secular European who has experienced everlasting peace studying a mostly Muslim society that has become used to a four decades lasting war. Along the following chapters, I will do my very best to neither deny nor overestimate the mentioned differences. I’m eager to avoid the pitfalls of ignorance and superficiality. Moreover, I’m a strong opponent of the exoticizing and idealization of a constructed homogenous *Other*. As I’ve inherited the philosophical legacy of transdisciplinary humanities at the University of Vienna, I’m a strong advocate of the principal of non-interference of outside observers into developmental processes. Therefore, I aim to compile a testimony of dialogue of equal partners rather than a top-down-analysis of the well-educated, prosperous, white woman. Hereof, I don’t feel in charge of judging any processes, but I’m prepared to observe them, and be they the most boringly self-evident to my project’s participants.

Bearing this in mind, I’m approaching the present issue employing quantitative inquiries and qualitative semi-guided interviews. The guiding intention is to catch an impression of the mindsets of women who had to escape their homeland Afghanistan and are now resident in Austria and Pakistan. The basic assumption runs that women take a special role in processes of consciousness formation among their peer groups, and that this consciousness has been shaped by experiences of *displacement* rather than by experiences of *belonging to a nation state*.

The introductory example of Thomas Barfield has also made obvious that the rating of circumstances might change tremendously, dependent on the observer’s former encounters, knowledge and practices of social learning. That’s why I’m heading to deliver thoroughly different views on the same issue: the development of social and cultural consciousness under the rough conditions in Afghanistan from both the point of the entangled person herself, and the point of the unconcerned observer that I – as the outsider to this world – really am.

¹ Barfield 2010, page 32.

1. INTRODUCTION

The present work aims to make patterns of consciousness formation visible. It considers women belonging to the Dari-speaking Afghan diasporas of Austria and Pakistan and catches their perception of the self and the own position within the surrounding social context. This text is based on the awareness that many of the former attempts to approach the mindsets of women from diverse war-torn countries have been “situated within an evolutionary hierarchy”² and is eager to avoid repeating this situation. As Maria Eriksson Baaz in her work *The Paternalism of Partnership. A Postcolonial Reading of Identity in Development Aid* has shown, the common perception of this evolutionary hierarchy and the respective sort of “development” within it, too often constitute a kind of truth which is based in the Western world and, consequently, prevent every substantial encounter.³ Hereof, the public discourse has historically turned into a discourse of saving Muslim women which had gone along with occupation and war, and it does so at present.⁴ This is what Leila Ahmed (1992) framed as colonial feminism.⁵ The present paper is compiled in opposition to colonial kinds of feminism and appreciates every encounter with its study’s subjects – evidently, on the potential expense of the one or the other hypothesis.

To approach the issue carefully, the framework of this thesis is introduced with the following sub-chapters: First, the hypotheses of this work will be presented. The second sub-chapter entails a women’s history of 20th century Afghanistan.

1.1. Presentation of the hypotheses

People from Afghanistan, apparently, identify with their communities rather than with the territory of their nation. This work contributes to a closer understanding of the nature of these different patterns. Therefore, the basic assumption for the following investigations runs that people from Afghanistan rather identify with experiences of coloniality and displacements than with the concepts of place and territory. (main hypothesis) This view is supported by Peter Finke’s investigations on the establishment of Afghanistan’s northern neighbor Uzbekistan with which the Afghan population has close genealogical ties: Contrary to its origin, Finke argues, the construct of Uzbekistan is nowadays relying on statehood legitimated by location.⁶ While “Uzbek identity”⁷ is based on a territorial concept, it has not much to do with the former

² Eriksson Baaz 2005, page 110.

³ Cf. Eriksson Baaz 2005, page 111.

⁴ Cf. Khan 2014, page 102.

⁵ Cf. Ahmed 1992 cited according to Khan 2014, page 102.

⁶ Cf. Finke 2006, page 126.

⁷ Finke 2006, page 127.

genealogical models of belonging.⁸ The Afghanistan-expert Elaheh Rostami-Povey comes to the same conclusion in her concise observation of Afghan women: According to Rostami-Povey, their salient capacity consists of performing different forms of identities and positions within the society “without being bound to a fixed location”.⁹

Moreover, and additional to the main hypothesis, women are assumed to be the key bearers of a society’s customs and morals. While fulfilling their classical gender roles, women are, furthermore, the driving forces of a society’s development because they are responsible for the education of the young generation. As a consequence, this paper focusses on women as the key agents of consciousness formation. Evidence for this assumption is delivered by the US-American Afghanistan scholar Nancy Hatch Dupree with decades of immediate experience in Afghanistan¹⁰ who has described Afghan societies as such:

*Honour is the rock upon which social status rests and the family is the single most important institution in Afghan society. Individual honour, a positive pride in independence that comes from self-reliance, fulfilment of family obligations, respect for the elderly, respect for women, loyalty to colleagues and friends, tolerance for others, forthrightness, an abhorrence of fanaticism, and a dislike for ostentation, is a cultural quality most Afghans share. The position of women is central to these values. In this patriarchal society women are the standards by which morality is judged, and they carry the responsibility of passing on the values of the society to younger generations.*¹¹

As the above quotation indicates, the social units of identification are probably smaller than a nation usually is. Therefore, assuming that the main hypothesis holds true, these other patterns of consciousness formation are expected to be composed of the family, the qawm and/or the village community. (Hypothesis 1)

Furthermore, especially women’s self-consciousness will differ widely along with the educational level: Well-educated women are expected to highlight different features of consciousness than less educated ones. (Hypothesis 2) These observations probably will relate to the rating of religious belief in women’s lives: More educated women will base their religious belief to another significance than less educated ones. (Hypothesis 3) This assumption is based on the evidence that nowadays many girls and young women from Afghanistan hide their actual identity when living abroad and, instead, prefer to be known as ‘the Sadat’ which means

⁸ Cf. Finke 2006, page 127.

⁹ Rostami-Povey 2007 a, page 299.

¹⁰ Cf. Mashal 2017, page B6.

¹¹ Hatch Dupree 2002, page 978.

‘descendent from the Prophet.’¹² This medley of identification units is said to be a legacy of Abdur Rahman Khan, who ruled Afghanistan between 1880¹³ and 1901¹⁴ and who regularly fused the defense of the nation with the defense of Islam.¹⁵

In general, the perception of the own gender will change over time, that means depending on their age women will judge their social positions differently. Gender and trained behavior will probably be the most sensitive to place and territory. (Hypothesis 4)

Following the Mediterranean social historian of the Middle Ages Ibn Khaldun, two different forms of the Afghan society’s constitution are assumed: the desert and the sedentary civilization.¹⁶ In reference to those, the main assumption runs that they are very influential to consciousness formation, not because of their different dispositions to place and territory, but because of the very different life-styles they entail. (Hypothesis 5)

Furthermore, the expression of individual consciousness within social media shall be approached with an initial step. As according to Hegel’s concept, consciousness is becoming and desire rather than the present state, the social media presentation of Afghan women is considered very meaningful for the investigation of consciousness, while it is expected to differ distinctly from the real-life personality. (Hypothesis 6)

The recitation and composition of poetry is one of Afghanistan’s most highly priced art forms. It is, evidently, expected to have a huge impact on consciousness formation. As the author of the present paper lacks sufficient language-skills, this hypothesis will be approached with secondary literature. (Hypothesis 7) Among the most important sources in this regard will be the study of Zuzanna Olzewska who examined the cultural expressions of Afghans living in Iran and the paper on sainthood by Nile Green who processed the hypothesis that tales of saints played an important role in maintaining customs and traditions in the Afghan diaspora. Green observed: “The saint often acted as a narrative reference point around which the memory of other episodes or persons could cluster.”¹⁷

Last but not least, it is expected that the vision of the overall applicability of the Western model of the nation state is challenged with this study, as Afghan societies have and continue to function along different values and social ties which are composed of smaller social units. (Hypothesis 8)

¹² Cf. Olzewska 2007, page 223.

¹³ Cf. Schetter 2010, page 68.

¹⁴ Cf. Schetter 2010, page 72.

¹⁵ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 235.

¹⁶ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 56.

¹⁷ Green 2008, page 189.

The present work is compiled given the awareness that knowledge about the ancestors and about inter-ethnic relations is vague among Afghans themselves - as Gabriele Rasuly-Paleczek has tellingly depicted taking the Afghan Chechka-Uzbeks as an example. Rasuly-Paleczek has proved that despite their limited knowledge of the genealogy of their ethnic belonging, the Chechka-Uzbeks consider themselves as one qawm.¹⁸ That means, the sense of belonging among people from Afghanistan may be based on feelings and emotional connections rather than on historical facts. This paper tries to grasp this emotional reasoning of belonging that is supposed to be independent of the nation state.

Moreover, as the work will show also the interviewed women themselves will not stick mainly to the Afghan burden of patriarchy. The work of Elaheh Rostami-Povey (2007 a) has shown that “many Afghan men oppose traditional ideologies of male superiority and dominance.”¹⁹ Following this tradition, the present paper refuses to accept the binary of the backward, patriarchal Afghan society and the progressive, enlightened European society. Simultaneously, it tries to avoid hasty conclusions about “the female Other” – who voluntarily veils herself from the hair-ends to the toes - as it was the case with the article of Khan and Hare (2004).

As a consequence, by investigating the *consciousness* of women from Afghanistan, the present paper aims to challenge the hegemonial concepts of the societies of the Western hemisphere, like female victimhood and the supremacy of the nation state. It does so by employing Gayatri Spivak’s deliberations on the creation of subalternity.

1.2. A women’s history of Afghanistan

Assuming that historical processes are to some extent constitutive of *consciousness*, the question arises which events of the past did probably shape the *consciousness* formation of women who had to escape their homeland between 1998 and 2018. Of course, this paper is limited in its grasp of the recent history, therefore for the introductory purpose, it is focused on a women’s history of 20th century Afghanistan. The guiding question hereof is, which historical processes – first – might have afflicted the objects of interest directly and which – secondly – concerned their parent generation, directly or indirectly.

So far, there is only one concise women’s history of Afghanistan which was compiled by Huma Ahmed-Gosh and published in the Journal of International Women’s Studies in 2003.²⁰

¹⁸ Cf. Rasuly-Paleczek 1998, page 218.

¹⁹ Rostami-Povey 2007 a, page 297.

²⁰ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003.

Ahmed-Gosh's history is concerned with the same time period as the present paper starting with the kind of state-building according to a Western model during the reign of Abdur Rahman Khan.²¹

In addition to this salient publication, there are many clusters concerning single aspects of a female course of history. As an example, Elaheh Rostami-Povey, an Iranian scholar living and teaching in London / UK, examines women under invasion. Besides one seminal article in the *Journal of Development Studies* (Rostami-Povey 2007 a), there is a book entitled *Afghan Women. Identity and Invasion*. (Rostami-Povey 2007 b) that sticks to similar arguments: Mainly, Rostami-Povey holds, women have been victims not only of the violent Taliban-regime but also of the US-led war against terrorism which has humiliated women's rights in a similar manner.²² The Canadian-Iranian professor emerita of anthropology Homa Hoodfar takes a rather different position in her comprehensive study published in 2004 and considering "the changing role of Afghan refugee women in Iran" (Hoodfar 2004): Hoodfar states that the control of women by men is historically a matter of persistence of the tribal system in Afghanistan, proving that the exercise of power over women is by no means an imported phenomenon.²³ With her work on patriarchy and the politics of public space in Afghanistan, Valentine M. Moghadam (2002) delivered a very concise analysis of the Afghan design of gender relations which identifies the honor-shame complex controlling women as the tool for satisfying material interests, "such as the marriage market and the exchange of women".²⁴ As these cited works, also the article of Shahnaz Khan (2014) and the article of Lida Ahmad and Priscyll Anctil Avoine (2018) are concerned with contemporary history or reach far back in favor of one single aspect of women's development as the work of Hoodfar does regarding refugee women in Iran. Out of these clusters, the following sections deliver at least a rough sketch of a women's history of 20th century Afghanistan.

The 20th century started in the hope of a future of high promise when Habibullah I. took the throne peacefully after the death of his father Abdur Rahman Khan in 1901²⁵ who had already started attempts to change customary practices in order to foster women's self-determination in advance and after marriage.²⁶ Habibullah was by his intention also a modernizer and even returned some exiles to the country who had encountered different life scripts abroad.²⁷

²¹ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 3.

²² Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 a, page 294.

²³ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, pages 144 & 145.

²⁴ Moghadam 2002, page 28.

²⁵ Cf. Schetter 2010, page 72.

²⁶ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 145.

²⁷ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 175.

The situation of women even improved with his successor Amanullah whose wife Queen Soraya was very active in promoting women's rights²⁸ and challenged the conservative Afghan clergy by appearing unveiled in the public.²⁹ Soraya's husband King Amanullah worked hard to break the power of the traditional clergy and to diminish their influence.³⁰ He abolished forced and child marriage and the bride price, and, in 1924, issued the women's right to choose their husbands according to their will.³¹ At the *Loya Jirga* (grand assembly) of 1928, Amanullah finally announced that Western veils must be worn in Kabul, that secularization is implemented and that polygamy and the seclusion of women (*purdah*) are abolished.³² The reply was not long in coming: Valentine M. Moghadam considers the uproar against the women's emancipation campaign as the major cause for the outbreak of violent conflicts in November and December 1928.³³ In 1929, an opposition overthrew Amanullah.³⁴ This marked the end of the course of women's liberation for the next decades.

Amanullah's successor Bacha-i-Saqao alias Habibullah Kalakani consciously presented himself as a counterpart of Amanullah: He declared himself a divinely ordained ruler.³⁵ Habibullah's II. reign lasted only a few months but under his successor Nader Khan (1929 – 1933) the situation of women didn't improve.³⁶

Nader Khan promptly renounced Amanullah's modernization movement and privileged mullahs, sufis and the clergy in his administration.³⁷ Although either belonging to the Musahiban dynasty like Nader Khan, his successor Zahir Shah (1933 – 1973) improved the situation of women distinctly: In 1964, he even granted women the right to vote.³⁸

In 1965, the People's Democratic Party of Afghanistan (PDPA) formed and put equal treatment of women on its agenda.³⁹ Also in 1965, six women established the Democratic Organization of Afghan Women (DOAW) to pursue their goals of outlawing forced marriages and the bride price and of eliminating illiteracy among women.⁴⁰ The king's cousin Mohammad Daoud Khan had been prime minister between 1953 and 1963 and ruled the country between

²⁸ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 21.

²⁹ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 188.

³⁰ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 189.

³¹ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 146.

³² Cf. Schetter 2010, page 76.

³³ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 21.

³⁴ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 146.

³⁵ Cf. Schetter 2010, page 76.

³⁶ Cf. Rasuly-Palczek 1998, page 209.

³⁷ Cf. Misdaq 2006, page 66.

³⁸ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 164.

³⁹ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 22.

⁴⁰ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 22.

1973 and 1978 as president.⁴¹ As a prime minister, Daoud's credit is a slight mode of modernization.⁴² For example, at the National Day parade of 1959, he demanded all wives of ministers and other officials to appear unveiled.⁴³

Daoud's influence was nevertheless limited: According to an account of the World Bank taken during his time as president, eight percent of the girls were in 1975 enrolled into primary education, compared to 44 percent of the boys in Afghanistan and one woman gave birth to eight children in average.⁴⁴ Despite that, Daoud managed to establish freedom and security for privileged women in urban areas, in the 1960s and 1970s.⁴⁵ But, only the privileged segments of the Afghan societies were affected by these development processes, as those in power did not represent the majority: ⁴⁶ People in rural areas as well as the urban poor were left behind.⁴⁷ A testimony of Miss Afghanistan in 1972 depicts the issues women were facing all over the country:

*Although all women had the right to vote, not all women were allowed to exercise this right. [...] Although theoretically every Afghan woman had a chance of an education, not all women could seize that opportunity. Islam wasn't keeping these women from moving forward; the traditionalists and their cultures were women's greatest obstacles in their quest for equality.*⁴⁸

The privileged among the women of Afghanistan in the 1970s felt an urgent need to resist the patriarchal structures of their homeland: In 1977, Meena founded the Revolutionary Association of the Women of Afghanistan.⁴⁹ What had started with King Amanullah I. and was re-confirmed with the constitution of 1964, was finally implemented by force through the PDPA government in 1978: compulsory education, especially for girls.⁵⁰ After the Saur Revolution during which the communist, Soviet backed People's Democratic Party had seized power in 1978, the well before compiled family law was enacted.⁵¹ The family law, known as Decree No. 7, among others set a minimum age for marriage of 16 years for women and 18 years for men.⁵² Moreover, the PDPA engaged the women of DOAW in a huge literacy campaign for

⁴¹ Cf. Rasuly-Palczek 1998, page 209.

⁴² Cf. Misdaq 2006, page 76.

⁴³ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 201.

⁴⁴ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 22.

⁴⁵ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 11.

⁴⁶ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 12.

⁴⁷ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 12.

⁴⁸ Zohra Yusuf Daoud, Miss Afghanistan of 1972, cited according to Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 12.

⁴⁹ Cf. Fluri 2008, page 38.

⁵⁰ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 23.

⁵¹ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 146.

⁵² Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 23.

women.⁵³ The new rules offended the ordinary Afghan public: Among the refugees arriving in Pakistan in the 1980s, the laws concerning co-education and compulsory education for girls were most frequently named as reason for leaving the country.⁵⁴ Moreover, tribal and religious leaders had good reasons to mobilize the public against the government.⁵⁵ The compulsory literacy classes were so fiercely opposed that three of its representatives were killed in Kandahar and two men killed all their female relatives to avoid “dishonor”.⁵⁶ Nevertheless, within the country the strategy worked: According to the official statistics, 65 percent of altogether 7.000 students of the Kabul university were female in 1985.⁵⁷ The Afghanistan-expert Conrad Schetter also holds that the programs *per se* were not opposed by the Afghan societies but that the manner of their implementation and the principal of coeducation were considered very critically.⁵⁸

Although, women apparently were quite equal during the Soviet occupation, Lida Ahmad and Priscyll Anctil Avoine (2018) argue that the Soviet invasion and its successive wars had a huge impact on the configuration of womanhood and masculinity and raised opportunities to instrumentalize women’s bodies in the future.⁵⁹

During the Soviet occupation, there is no evidence for systematic sexual and gender-based violence (SGBV), nevertheless women suffered from rape, brutal killings and tortures in Afghan prisons.⁶⁰ Altogether, women had but enjoyed some freedoms during the Soviet-backed PDPA regime (1978 – 1992), as, for example, the veiling was just a customary practice among rural women but urban women had not been mandated to veil since 1959.⁶¹ While before 1992, women had the freedom to dress as they liked,⁶² the Mujahedin era from 1992 onwards was the beginning of the systematic repression of women.⁶³ It was accompanied by the withdrawal of the international community from the country: The United States had no interest in Afghanistan any more, as the Soviet Union had dissolved and only Pakistan kept an eye on its progress.⁶⁴ First, some urban women began to veil in order to protect themselves during the Mujahedin fights for control and power, in a second step war crimes hit women dramatically:⁶⁵ Either

⁵³ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 23.

⁵⁴ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 148.

⁵⁵ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 147.

⁵⁶ Moghadam 2002, page 23.

⁵⁷ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 23.

⁵⁸ Cf. Schetter 2010, page 97.

⁵⁹ Cf. Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 90.

⁶⁰ Cf. Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 90.

⁶¹ Cf. Khan 2014, page 104.

⁶² Cf. Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 92.

⁶³ Cf. Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 90.

⁶⁴ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 251.

⁶⁵ Cf. Khan 2014, page 104.

Ahmad Shah Masud, the national hero of Afghanistan nowadays and leader of the Northern Alliance between 1996 and 2001,⁶⁶ is accused to have committed or at least tolerated rape crimes.⁶⁷

During the anarchic years of the beginning 1990s, the Taliban gained strength.⁶⁸ When they took power in 1996⁶⁹, they rapidly established serious customs regarding women – veiling, prohibition to work outside the house, and prohibition of girls' education – which were rather inspired by the Pashtunwali code than by the Sharia law.⁷⁰ As the Taliban were convinced that “women's faces corrupt men”⁷¹, they even issued a rule that prescribed the screening of windows of private houses in order to avoid women to be seen from the outside.⁷²

Illiteracy had already been a major problem before the rise of the Taliban and had afflicted 90 percent of the girls and 60 percent of the boys.⁷³ But, when the Taliban had seized Kabul in 1996, one of the first things they did, was to close schools and the Kabul University.⁷⁴ Hereof, women were deprived of their job opportunities and other freedoms of their social lives which is expressed with the decree on the Taliban's gender policy:

*Women, you should not step outside your residence. [...] In case women are required to go outside the residence for the purpose of education, social needs or social services they should cover their themselves in accordance with Islamic Shari'a regulation. If women are going outside with fashionable, ornamental and charming clothes to show themselves, they will be cursed by the Islamic Shari'a and should never expect to go to heaven.*⁷⁵

Nevertheless, Elaheh Rostami-Povey claims that women were better off during the Taliban regime than during the Mujahedin era, as sexual violence as a war-crime was much more common during the reign of the Mujahedin.⁷⁶ When the Taliban were finally forced back by the international community as a reaction to 9/11, Afghanistan was a failed state but still commanded over a strong sense of unity of its peoples.⁷⁷

⁶⁶ Cf. Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 91.

⁶⁷ Cf. Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 91.

⁶⁸ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 255.

⁶⁹ Cf. Barfield 2010, pages 259 & 260.

⁷⁰ Cf. Schetter 2010, page 132.

⁷¹ Moghadam 2002, page 26.

⁷² Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 26.

⁷³ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 25.

⁷⁴ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 25.

⁷⁵ Taliban decree cited according to Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 24.

⁷⁶ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 26.

⁷⁷ Cf. Barfield 2010, pages 277 & 278.

Moreover, both Shahnaz Khan (2014) and Lida Ahmad & Priscyll Anctil Avoine (2018) come to the conclusion that the US-led ‘war on terror’ after 9/11 was guided by wrong premises.⁷⁸ It raised the impression in western societies “that veiling is a major issue for Afghan women”⁷⁹ - a misinterpretation which made the entire mission of “‘liberation’ strongly debatable”.⁸⁰ Shahnaz Khan even frames the “desire to rescue Afghan women” emerging from this misinterpretation “another instance of colonial feminism”.⁸¹ The real issue lies beyond this perception: There is still less participation of women in the public and – especially – in the political sphere, although the constitution adopted by the *Loya Jirga* in 2004, warrants equal rights for women and men.⁸² For example, in only two out of 23 peace talks of the Afghan government with the Taliban, female representatives have participated.⁸³ According to Elaheh Rostami-Povey, the security situation in Afghanistan is even worse since 2004 than after the fall of the Taliban.⁸⁴ In the Bonn conference on Afghanistan following the fall of the Taliban, only three women participated: Sima Wali, Sima Samar, and Suhaila Seddiqi.⁸⁵ The thus established *Loya Jirga* consisted of 200 women compared to 1.350 men.⁸⁶

The interim president Hamid Karzai, whom the Bonn parties had agreed upon, had been re-elected in 2009.⁸⁷ In 2014, the Afghans went for the next time to the polls: with 6.6 million reported voters, they were more than 2009 but still less than 50 percent of the eligible voters.⁸⁸ After fraud accusations and hard negotiations, Ashraf Ghani was declared the president and Abdullah Abdullah the chief executive of Afghanistan.⁸⁹ The same year, the Daesh (Arabic denotation for the terror militia “Islamic State”) appeared for the first time on Afghan soil.⁹⁰ And also the Taliban gained strength under the rule of Ghani and Abdullah: By 2018, the TV sender BBC concluded that approximately 70 percent of the country’s area are under control of the Taliban.⁹¹

Nevertheless, there is reason to hope that the situation of women is going to improve within the upcoming years: The contemporary First Lady of Afghanistan, Rula Ghani, is involved in

⁷⁸ Cf. Khan 2014, page 105, & Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 92.

⁷⁹ Khan 2014, page 105.

⁸⁰ Ahmad / Anctil Avoine 2018, page 92.

⁸¹ Khan 2014, page 106.

⁸² Cf. Khan 2014, page 104.

⁸³ Cf. Schrott 2018, page 26.

⁸⁴ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 49.

⁸⁵ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 59.

⁸⁶ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 59.

⁸⁷ Cf. Coll 2018, page 648.

⁸⁸ Cf. Coll 2018, page 649.

⁸⁹ Cf. Coll 2018, page 660.

⁹⁰ Cf. Stahlmann 2018, page 67.

⁹¹ Cf. Stahlmann 2018, page 15.

the establishment of directives, participates in women's talks, travels a lot and takes a responsible role in the public.⁹² She is the first after the famous Queen Soraya, wife of King Amanullah I. (1919 – 1929), who appears at the public stage.

⁹² Cf. Schrott 2018, page 29.

2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Considering Afghanistan starts with the difficulty to locate it in the world: there are various reasonings for locating Afghanistan in Central Asia, as well as for locating it in South Asia. Culturally, it is even more difficult: While the region is today mostly Muslim, its customs reach far more back in history.⁹³ The Afghanistan-expert Thomas Barfield suggests to include only those to the Afghan community who celebrate the Nauroz, the Persian New Year, at the beginning of spring, as this tradition could not yet have been extinguished by the Taliban regime.⁹⁴ I tend to agree with his position with reference to the history of Afghanistan that shows a strong influence of pre-Islamic norms and values until nowadays.

With the following sub-chapters, a more concise insight into the background philosophy of science is given. First, central terms and concepts are introduced highlighting the concepts of consciousness and diaspora. The concept of consciousness is discussed more precisely in an additional section following the work of Georg Friedrich Wilhelm Hegel as his publications mark the disentanglement of philosophical thinking from metaphysics and its transition to concepts that are disengaged from space and concerned with time, instead, as they are captured by the ontological mode of history.⁹⁵ This transition is of great interest for the present work. These contemplations are followed by a self-localization of the author.

2.1. Definitions

With the following sections, key concepts will be introduced.

2.1.1. Agency according to Judith Butler

With the present definition of *agency*, I will renounce a concise genealogy of the term. It is perceived here as drafted by Judith Butler who, of course, referred massively to Michel Foucault's concept of 'subjectivation' and other theorists' concepts to define agency more precisely.⁹⁶

There is also a more philosophical approach to agency proposed by the Afghanistan-expert Elaheh Rostami-Povey which seems to be insufficient in the context of the present paper: Rostami-Povey frames the movement into a space of agency as *the social*

⁹³ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 54.

⁹⁴ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 55.

⁹⁵ Cf. Foucault 1974, page 272.

⁹⁶ Cf. McNay 1999, page 177.

emergence as an intelligent being, a move which Afghan women allegedly performed during the regime of the Taliban.⁹⁷

Judith Butler defines agency in short as follows: “‘an act with consequences’, an extended doing, a performance with effects.”⁹⁸ Of course, in depth, the term implies much more than that.

Agency in a metaphorical sense, points to the reciprocal relationship of environment and subject that is constituted as an actor by the *interpellation* that names her a subject.⁹⁹

There are different dimensions of agency like sexuality or socio-cultural contexts. In the political dimension, agency names the capacity of a subject to initiate change within a broader societal context.¹⁰⁰ In all these contexts, language and subject cannot be thought independently: The power of speech only spreads through the subject, and is consequently not sovereign, but the subject’s own power is simultaneously deflected and conveyed by her speech.¹⁰¹

In Butler’s conception, agency is closely related to biopolitics which are the powers that organize life to such a degree that they even devalue lives to precarious ones by governmental and non-governmental actions and which indicate a set of measures along with which “valuable lives” are differentiated from “non-valuable ones”.¹⁰² Agency obeys the logic of biopolitics, as agency is only admitted to those members of a society who are treated as “valuable members” – and this is exactly what biopolitics in Butler’s perception judges.¹⁰³ Nevertheless, as Homi K. Bhabha with his seminal work *The Location of Culture* indicates: The space that opens up in the intersubjectivist constitution of agency, renders the establishment of a subversive, subaltern authority possible that emerges in a space of directed movement without requiring a teleological aim.¹⁰⁴

The Gramscian concept of *social forces* is related to agency and puts emphasis on the historical conditions that enable specific parts of a society to present themselves as political subjects capable of acting.¹⁰⁵

⁹⁷ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 a, page 297.

⁹⁸ Butler 1997, page 7.

⁹⁹ Cf. Butler 1997, page 16.

¹⁰⁰ Cf. McNay 1999, page 178.

¹⁰¹ Cf. Butler 1997, page 39.

¹⁰² Cf. Butler 2012, page 10.

¹⁰³ Cf. Butler 2012, page 10.

¹⁰⁴ Cf. Bhabha 1994, pages 184 & 185.

¹⁰⁵ Cf. Hajek / Kinzel 2011, page 141.

2.1.2. Consciousness according to Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel

By referring to *consciousness* in a Hegelian sense, it is referred to Hegel's work *Phenomenology of Mind* (1807/1973). In the respective preamble, Hegel establishes an approach to the subject that – in a very immediate sense – reflects the ancient Greek philosophy of *παντα ρει*, everything flows: The mind, Hegel argues, is not complete as it is meant to be.¹⁰⁶ Hegel compares that insight with the birth of a child¹⁰⁷ and describes it as follows:

*Wo wir eine Eiche in der Kraft ihres Stammes und in der Ausbreitung ihrer Äste und den Massen ihrer Belaubung zu sehen wünschen, sind wir nicht zufrieden, wenn uns an Stelle dieser eine Eichel gezeigt wird. [...] Der Anfang des neuen Geistes ist das Produkt einer weitläufigen Umwälzung [...] Er ist das aus der Sukzession wie aus seiner Ausdehnung in sich zurückgegangene Ganze, der gewordene Begriff desselben. Die Wirklichkeit dieses einfachen Ganzen aber besteht darin, daß jene zu Momenten gewordenen Gestaltungen sich wieder von neuem, aber in ihrem neuen Elemente, in dem gewordenen Sinne entwickeln und Gestaltung geben.*¹⁰⁸

The striking feature here is, following Ernst Bloch's analysis of Hegel's *Phenomenology of Mind* within the scope of his *Leipzig Lectures* (1950 – 1956/1985), that Hegel is rather interested in the externalization of the mind and its consciousness than in its interior shape.¹⁰⁹ Consequently, the present paper and its follow-up studies will, according to the legacy of Hegel, either focus rather on the presentation and the representation of the self as *consciousness* than on its depth complexion.

Hegel defines *consciousness* as the way of the soul that - by seeking true knowledge - grows apart from itself, while – by this alienation – establishes itself as the mind, “indem sie durch die vollständige Erfahrung ihrer selbst zur Kenntnis desjenigen gelangt, was sie an sich selbst ist.”¹¹⁰ The second remarkable feature of consciousness is described here: It is a way of self-insight of the soul. A soul which is, of course, incomplete. Completeness would mean death.

A third striking feature of Hegel's concept of *consciousness* that is under consideration with the present work is, as William Edward Burghardt “W. E. B.” Du Bois has elaborated in his famous work of 1903 *The Souls of Black Folk* referring to ‘double-

¹⁰⁶ Cf. Hegel 1973, page 19.

¹⁰⁷ Cf. Hegel 1973, page 18.

¹⁰⁸ Hegel 1973, page 19.

¹⁰⁹ Cf. Bloch 1985, page 304.

¹¹⁰ Hegel 1973, page 72.

consciousness', some sort of constructed self that is, indeed, constructed by the look on it from another point of view.¹¹¹ This is what Ernst Bloch framed as alienation from the alienation, as "Entfremdung von der Entfremdung".¹¹² As such, consciousness is part of a social practice.

Du Bois' reading of Hegel might be a more practically oriented one than is employed in here. And this is the third striking insight of Hegel's *Phenomenology of Mind: Consciousness* implies the acknowledgement of the vanity of the discerned thing in-itself – as by the existence of *consciousness* and its grasp of the thing in-itself, the thing in-itself changes. The thing that, in advance, was in-itself will transform to the for-itself-being of the in-itself.¹¹³ This means – as Bloch drastically put it – the object will not only disappear in this procedure, but the object itself is the alienated subject.¹¹⁴ Being a reflection of a transcendental belonging, *consciousness* is neither spatial nor temporal, but a capacity outside time and space.¹¹⁵ - The fourth feature: Every sensual experience of the world is a reflection of self-consciousness.

With Hegel's elaboration of consciousness, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak argues in her seminal work *Can the Subaltern Speak?*, Hegel has implied systematical unlearning of the knowledge of power.¹¹⁶ And, in Spivak's reading, the ultimate task of the *Western* intellectual is "to keep the ethnocentric Subject from establishing itself by selectively defining an Other."¹¹⁷ As - in Spivak's interpretation - ,the Other' is inevitably a construction of the self. – That means for the fifth feature of consciousness: Consciousness is shaped by the entitlement to knowledge and one common elusion of building up self-consciousness utilizes the construction of an Other.

W.E.B. Du Bois in the *The Souls of Black Folk* has pointed to the sixth striking feature of consciousness by describing the establishment of consciousness of people of color in the USA as an historical course:

The history of the American Negro is the history of this strife,—this longing to attain self-conscious manhood, to merge his double self into a better and truer self. In this merging he wishes neither of the older selves to be lost. He would not Africanize America, for America has too much to teach the world and Africa. He would not bleach

¹¹¹ Cf. Du Bois 2015, page 7.

¹¹² Bloch 1985, page 320.

¹¹³ Cf. Hegel 1973, pages 78 & 79.

¹¹⁴ Cf. Bloch 1985, page 321.

¹¹⁵ Cf. Bloch 1985, page 322.

¹¹⁶ Cf. Spivak 1988, page 295.

¹¹⁷ Spivak 1988, page 292.

*his Negro soul in a flood of white Americanism, for he knows that Negro blood has a message for the world. [...] This, then, is the end of his striving: to be a co-worker in the kingdom of culture, to escape both death and isolation, to husband and use his best powers and his latent genius. These powers of body and mind have in the past been strangely wasted, dispersed, or forgotten. The shadow of a mighty Negro past flits through the tale of Ethiopia the Shadowy and of Egypt the Sphinx. Through history, the powers of single black men flash here and there like falling stars, and die sometimes before the world has rightly gauged their brightness.*¹¹⁸

Although, consciousness cannot be framed as a result of anything, it is at least shaped by history, this means, not only by the history of the single individual but also by the history of her communities of belonging. This is the sixth feature.

To summarize the six features of consciousness for the present paper:

1. Consciousness appears as an *externalization* to the sensually knowable world.
2. Consciousness is the *way of the human soul* which is – evidently – incomplete by the moment it is captured.
3. Consciousness is a *look on the self from another point of view* and is, therefore, part of a social practice.
4. It is *reflected* in all sensual experiences of the world.
5. The *power of knowledge* broadly determines consciousness, especially Western intellectuals tend to elude the consciousness-issue by constructing an Other.
6. Consciousness is *shaped historically*.

2.1.3. Diaspora

The term *diaspora* is founded on the Old-Greek words *dia* [through] and *sperein* [to scatter].¹¹⁹ Considered from the aerial perspective, there is a very problematic entanglement of the term *diaspora* to which Avtar Brah in her famous work *Cartographies of Diaspora. Contesting Identities*. points: The theoretical concept of *diaspora* is usually bound to the majority/minority dichotomy.¹²⁰ Brah expressly criticizes the “numerical referent” of this dichotomy as it implies the reduction of “the problem of power relations to one of numbers, with the result that the repeated

¹¹⁸ Du Bois 2015, page 7.

¹¹⁹ Cf. Brah 1996, page 181.

¹²⁰ Cf. Brah 1996, page 186.

circulation of the discourse has the effect of naturalizing rather than challenging the power differential.”¹²¹

To define a concept of diaspora, Robin Cohen has - by his own admission - compiled a list of common features of diaspora borrowing from the classical tradition and William Safran’s work¹²² and its revision of which he had all added up with his own point of view.¹²³ The following definition of diaspora in favor of the present paper will mainly refer to Cohen’s work and substitute it with the assertions of the US-American historian James Clifford who is professor emeritus of *History of Consciousness* at the University of California, Santa Cruz.

The seven common features of diaspora in the present perception are the following:

1. The diaspora is *not* located at its *original homeland*.¹²⁴
2. Hereof follows that the diaspora is *never*, in practice, exclusively *nationalist*.¹²⁵
3. Persons belonging to one diaspora share a *collective memory* about the lost homeland.¹²⁶
4. Members of the diaspora *tend to idealize* the real or imagined ancestral home.¹²⁷
5. The diasporic community practices *adjustment to and resistance* against the host country’s norms and values.¹²⁸
6. A *strong ethnic group consciousness* is maintained over a long time and based on a sense of distinctiveness from the host community.¹²⁹
7. Diasporic consciousness is related to *political struggles* to define the host community’s members as different.¹³⁰

2.1.4. Ethnicity

The concept of *ethnicity* is employed throughout this paper in an as far as possible impartial way. It is conspicuous and will be issued later in this text that many people from Afghanistan point to their “ethnicity”, especially as they are living in Europe. Either from Australia, serious tensions among the 35.000 strong Afghan community are

¹²¹ Brah 1996, page 187.

¹²² Cf. Safran (2005): The Jewish Diaspora in a comparative and theoretical perspective.

¹²³ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 16.

¹²⁴ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

¹²⁵ Cf. Clifford 1994, page 307.

¹²⁶ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

¹²⁷ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

¹²⁸ Cf. Clifford 1994, page 307.

¹²⁹ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

¹³⁰ Cf. Clifford 1994, page 308.

reported which are allegedly based on the issue of ethnicity.¹³¹ The delicate term is recently also massively abused, especially by Pashtun nationalists who claim that Pashtuns are “the only ‘true Afghans’”.¹³² This stems from their dominant position in Afghanistan’s politics since the mid-eighteenth century.¹³³ That is why the use of this term needs to be clarified.

The term ethnicity relies on six pillars with the level of emphasis differing between ethnicities:¹³⁴

1. a collective name.
2. a *presumed* common ancestry.
3. a *collective memory*.
4. a common culture that makes a *difference* to neighboring ethnic groups.
5. an association with a specific *homeland*.
6. some sort of solidarity with members of the respective ethnic group.

There is a famous distinction of the way of nation-building in Anthony Smith’s work *National Identity* which differentiates the sort of nation-building in a civic and an ethnic manner. Smith hereby highlights the freedom of choice for the individual which the civic form allegedly provides, while he points to some kind of coercion that the ethnic form enforces as the individual has to maintain the boundaries into which it has been born.¹³⁵ Avtar Brah reiterates Smith’s position very critically. Her main point is that Smith, without any doubt, linked the terms *civic* and *Western*, and *ethnic* and *non-Western*.¹³⁶ Instead, Brah argues, emphasis should be put on the background ethnic tensions which often lay the grounds for nation-building, as in the establishment of Great Britain with a dominance of the English over the Irish, the Scottish and the Welsh.¹³⁷

2.1.5. Geopolitics of knowledge

In his work on *Decolonizing Post-Colonial Studies and Paradigms of Political-Economy*, Ramon Grosfoguel, associate professor at the University of California / USA,

¹³¹ Cf. Abraham / Busbridge 2014, page 244.

¹³² Green 2008, page 172.

¹³³ Cf. Abraham / Busbridge 2014, page 244.

¹³⁴ Cf. Smith 2000 cited according to Saikal 2010, page 5.

¹³⁵ Cf. Smith 1991, page 11.

¹³⁶ Cf. Brah 1996, page 160.

¹³⁷ Cf. Brah 1996, page 161.

indicates the great importance of the subject's entanglement to her social environment and the surrounding culture.¹³⁸

This means that an objective point of view is by no means possible. What is possible, instead, is one position among many others from one point of view of the writing subject. This *point of view* names the position of the writing subject *within the Geopolitics of Knowledge*. Donna Haraway put it this way:

*Positioning is, therefore, the key practice in grounding knowledge organized around the imagery of vision, and much Western scientific and philosophic discourse is organized in this way. Positioning implies responsibility for our enabling practices. It follows that politics and ethics ground struggles for and contests over what may count as rational knowledge. That is, admitted or not, politics and ethics ground struggles over knowledge projects in the exact, natural, social, and human sciences. Otherwise, rationality is simply impossible, an optical illusion projected from nowhere comprehensively.*¹³⁹

This is the entanglement into discourse and power which – as Foucault admitted with *The Order of Things*¹⁴⁰ – the thinking of a theorist socialized in the Global North cannot escape.¹⁴¹ It is a relation of power/knowledge that appears to provide hierarchical forms of rationality and universality, marginalizing the Global South.¹⁴² What might moderate the distorting effects of this power/knowledge, is an honest reflection on the own position and the return to the ternary origins of the occidental mode of thinking which – until the seventeenth century – structured the system of signs into the naming (signans), the named (signatum) *and the conjunction*.¹⁴³ An at least attempted objective positioning of me as the writing subject, would establish herself as the conjunctive function.

2.1.6. Hegemony according to Antonio Gramsci

The positioning as a writer raised and socialized in the Global North – as the arguments of theorists of the Geopolitics of Knowledge postulate - is necessary to highlight the underlying spheres of power/knowledge that shaped my thinking as the writing subject.

¹³⁸ Cf. Grosfoguel 2011, page 4.

¹³⁹ Haraway 1988, page 587.

¹⁴⁰ In the present paper, the German translation of the original “Les mots et les choses” (1966), “The Order of Things”, respectively “Die Ordnung der Dinge. Eine Archäologie der Humanwissenschaften.”, translated by Ulrich Köppen, is quoted; cf. Foucault 1974.

¹⁴¹ Cf. Foucault 1974, page 307.

¹⁴² Cf. Bhabha 1994, page 237.

¹⁴³ Cf. Foucault 1974, page 74.

As – in a Gramscian sense – within the capitalistic mode of production, the entire society is interwoven by a *super-structure* that helps maintaining the ruling conditions.¹⁴⁴ This super-structure establishes intellectual and moral leadership of the dominating group which Gramsci called *hegemony*.¹⁴⁵

The conditions, although they are structured in favor of the (capitalist) ruling class, reach out from the economic sphere into other spheres of the society – Gramsci concretely names the political, the intellectual, and the “moral” sphere – and change the *consciousness* of members of the subordinated groups to make them believe, the ruling conditions were for their own welfare.¹⁴⁶

The crucial point here is the role of intellectuals in Gramsci’s perception: The intellectuals are key for the maintenance of the ruling conditions:

*Die Intellektuellen haben die Funktion, die gesellschaftliche Hegemonie einer Gruppe und ihre staatliche Herrschaft zu organisieren, das heißt, den durch das Prestige der Funktion in der Produktionssphäre gegebenen Konsens und den Zwangsapparat für diejenigen Gruppen, die weder aktiv noch passiv ,zustimmen‘, oder für diejenigen Momente einer Befehls- und Führungskrise, in denen der spontane Konsens eine Krise erleidet.*¹⁴⁷

Hegemony is thus based on a set of “cultural and ideological belief systems whose teachings are accepted as universally valid by the general population.”¹⁴⁸ Therefore, Antonio Gramsci considered educational institutions as hubs of the spread of the hegemony.¹⁴⁹

2.1.7. Locality according to Arjun Appadurai

The definition of the term *locality* according to Arjun Appadurai is essential for the theoretical framework of this entire work. As the perception of locality is a pre-condition of thinking the consciousness of Afghan women as independent of their national territory. Appadurai classifies locality as a “complex phenomenological quality”¹⁵⁰ which is rather relational and contextual than spatial.¹⁵¹

¹⁴⁴ Cf. Gramsci 1992, page 496.

¹⁴⁵ Cf. Fontana 1993, page 140.

¹⁴⁶ Cf. Gramsci 1992, page 496.

¹⁴⁷ Gramsci 1992, page 515.

¹⁴⁸ Fontana 1993, page 140.

¹⁴⁹ Cf. Fontana 1993, page 108.

¹⁵⁰ Appadurai 1996, page 178.

¹⁵¹ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 178.

In this understanding, locality must be maintained by the steady and compulsory reproduction of *rites of passage* which are inevitable for the production of local subjects.¹⁵²

2.1.8. Pashtunwali

The *Pashtunwali* is a non-religious legal code in Afghanistan.¹⁵³ It is a code of conduct practiced among ethnic Pashtuns which prescribes the men's participation in the community and subsumes women among the community's "resources".¹⁵⁴ The prescriptions of the Pashtunwali had and have huge impacts on the lives of women in Afghanistan. The feature of the Pashtunwali that will be most important with reference to the results of the present study, is that it regulates the organization of the entire society according to a *paternal lineage*.¹⁵⁵

Historically, the Pashtunwali has been invoked by opponents of top-down attempts to modernize Afghanistan, as could have been observed during the resistance against the government of Amanullah Khan (1919 – 1929): The Pashtuns, used to relying on the Pashtunwali which highlights personal autonomy and condemns state interference into private issues (like the social status of women), felt strongly offended by Amanullah's reforms and set up a front against his government.¹⁵⁶

According to the Pashtunwali, men must in any case protect the honor of women as well as the integrity of their homeland.¹⁵⁷ Moreover, the Pashtunwali is based on a principal of equality among men.¹⁵⁸

2.1.9. Qawm

The most important division of Afghan societies is the qawm of which there exist numerous on the local level.¹⁵⁹ It is often referred to as solidarity group¹⁶⁰ or as solidarity unit.¹⁶¹ Gabriele Rasuly-Paleczek emphasizes the constructive character of

¹⁵² Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 179.

¹⁵³ Cf. Raqib / Barreto 2014, page 21.

¹⁵⁴ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 20.

¹⁵⁵ Cf. Thiel 2012, page 90.

¹⁵⁶ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 185.

¹⁵⁷ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 4.

¹⁵⁸ Cf. Thiel 2012, page 90.

¹⁵⁹ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 18.

¹⁶⁰ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 a, page 296.

¹⁶¹ Cf. Rasuly-Paleczek 1998, page 211.

the qawm which might will be employed if it's useful but will be denied as soon as it has lost its utility.¹⁶²

2.2. Approaching general patterns of consciousness formation

The abuse of the term *identity* by far-right political movements entails the refusal of this term concerning the present text. By asking questions about the *consciousness* of women, I, consequently, refer to Hegel's *Phenomenology of Mind* in which *consciousness* develops by itself and for itself.¹⁶³

Evidently, the term *identity* has been used equally by many theorists. It is described as "das was bleibt, wenn etwas sich verändert."¹⁶⁴ Therefore, the present paper will, of course, rely on an enormous stock of literature on *identity* and derive parts of its approach to *consciousness* from the theoretical concept of *identity*. Simultaneously, this work is meant to contest notions of *identity* as omitting and misleading. The crux of the concept shall be portrayed as a framing that by calculating one individual *identity* renders invisible the other manifestations of one person's *identity*.¹⁶⁵ It is the simplification of the expression and the rationale that renders these terms easy instruments of political agendas of difference and exclusion. Especially because, identity as a concept operates in the name of the validation of social actions.¹⁶⁶ This paper is by no means supposed to serve these ideologies.

Instead, the principal assumption regarding the broader term *consciousness* runs that consciousness (of Afghanistan's peoples in particular) is not mainly dependent on spatial experiences, but on historical influences.¹⁶⁷ While this assumption abstracts the concept of *consciousness* from locality, it needs other features that help establishing a framework in which *consciousness* is analyzed. There have been numerous attempts to approach such a framework of *consciousness/identity* of which the main ones are presented with the literature review in chapter 3.7. The key consequence of the principal assumption is that the nation state in its Western shape doesn't seem to be suitable for Afghan societies as these don't reason their cohesion (or also their eventual conflicts) by the region under their rule, but by a bulk of different features. Nabi Misdaq, himself an Afghan researcher,¹⁶⁸ asserts that people from Afghanistan are, moreover, not substantially driven by ethnicity, but that ethnicity was rather

¹⁶² Cf. Rasuly-Palczek 1998, page 212.

¹⁶³ Cf. Bloch 1985, page 321.

¹⁶⁴ Heider 2014, page 165.

¹⁶⁵ Cf. Brah 1996, page 3.

¹⁶⁶ Cf. Charusheela 2010, page 1149.

¹⁶⁷ Whereas the philosopher and Hegel connoisseur Placidus Bernhard Heider asserts that consciousness in Hegel's sense is neither historical nor spatial.

¹⁶⁸ Cf. Misdaq 2006, page xvii.

instrumentalized by foreign powers to serve their purpose of gaining control over the country.¹⁶⁹ As a counter-concept, he names aspects of ethnicity to avoid the ethnic pattern: “origin, language, culture, creed and locality.”¹⁷⁰ Apparently, in order to provide an analysis of the issue that meets its root, one needs to delve deeper into the subject, one needs to make the shift from the admiration of its phenomenology to the analysis of its inner organization.

That is why, this paper aims to observe the implicitness and – as Thomas Barfield has put it – the “boringly self-evident”¹⁷¹ aspects of the daily lives of Afghan women to draw conclusions from these observations to the overarching sort of *consciousness* in Hegel’s sense. Accordingly, this study is based on empirical evidence from the field work. But, regarding the present paper, this is only half of the story because it is augmented by a bulk of theory that already has been framed in the past.

To name one of the most striking examples of this pioneer literature, it is, indeed, the work of Samuel P. Huntington *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order* that provides the basis for all now following investigations: “In Central Asia historically, national identities did not exist.”¹⁷² Huntington zealously continues to point to substitutes of this typical Western sort of identification and names the tribe, the extended family and Islam.¹⁷³ Of course, Huntington’s work – first published in 1996 – polarized the scientific community and there are many critiques on his work, not all of them untenable. The Afghan-American writer Fariba Nawa, for example, notes regarding *The Clash of Civilizations* that the imagination of a *clash* reduces the complexities and the diversities of humankind.¹⁷⁴ To avoid the classical pitfall of superficiality, the present paper narrows the research object down by focusing on *women* from Afghanistan who speak Dari, one of Afghanistan’s main languages. And again, it aims to draw its conclusions from observations of the daily lives of these women to avoid superficial conclusion by focusing on the smallest units of social life.

This is the reason why, the approach is based on a mixed methods research consisting of both qualitative semi-guided interviews and quantitative inquiries by altogether 57 questionnaires. The underlying disposition is a constructivist one, while constructivism is perceived as a loose term that consists not only of the principal doubt in essentialist positions but is eager to provide arguments for the way of norms’ functioning in the construction of

¹⁶⁹ Cf. Misdaq 2006, page 202.

¹⁷⁰ Misdaq 2002, page 202.

¹⁷¹ Barfield 2010, page 32.

¹⁷² Huntington 2003, page 175.

¹⁷³ Cf. Huntington 2003, page 175.

¹⁷⁴ Cf. Nawa 2002, page 187.

“identity”, “culture” and so on.¹⁷⁵ This way of functioning will be considered borrowing from Stuart Hall’s vision of *multi-culturalism* which indicates that the recognition of every community’s particularity requires a surrounding context of a wider norm that allows the measurement of numerous kinds of differences.¹⁷⁶ The *particularity* which must be embedded within a wider norm, is a substitute of the term *identity* in the present paper’s perception. Identity again is the concept which can – according to Hall – neither be superseded dialectically nor be replaced by another concept.¹⁷⁷ Therefore, Hall continues, the concept of identity cannot be abolished but can simultaneously not be thought in its original definition.¹⁷⁸ As Stuart Hall does,¹⁷⁹ so also the communication scientist Lawrence Grossberg points to Jacques Derrida’s *différance*, and – by linking it with the term *identity* – also explains that identity is *per se* not in position to be defined.¹⁸⁰ His exciting explanation is, traced to its roots, based on Hegel’s famous image of the master and the slave (‘Herr und Knecht’ in German) whose legacy is the sublation of binary by explaining the dialectic dependence of the master on the slave.¹⁸¹ The formation of *consciousness* starts, according to Hegel, with the *ataraxia* concerning this unresolvable dependency.¹⁸² In the words of Lawrence Grossberg, “the subaltern represents an inherent ambiguity or instability at the centre of any formation of language (or *identity*) which constantly undermines language’s power to define a unified stable *identity*.”¹⁸³ This definition of *identity/consciousness* allows a resolved view on the hardened discourse on the potential experience of losing the self in the interrelation with others.¹⁸⁴ Even to the contrary, *the Other* is not merely the *conditio sine qua non* of individual *consciousness*, it is even *inherent to the Self*.

Moreover, Grossberg points to the post-structuralist progress of textuality and, subsequently frames *identity* as “entirely an *historical* construction”¹⁸⁵. This perception is also part of Hegel’s philosophy on *consciousness* according to the reading by the Asian expert Leo T. S. Ching: “Consciousness in this case, following Hegel, is a function of knowing rather than

¹⁷⁵ This definition of constructivism is based on the perception outlined by the International Relations Research Fellow Heather Rae in her work *State Identities and the Homogenization of People*, herein cf. especially, Rae 2002, page 17.

¹⁷⁶ Cf. McRobbie 2005, page 30.

¹⁷⁷ Cf. Hall 1996, page 1.

¹⁷⁸ Cf. Hall 1996, page 2.

¹⁷⁹ Cf. Hall 1996, page 3.

¹⁸⁰ Cf. Grossberg 1996, page 90.

¹⁸¹ Cf. Bloch 1985, page 313.

¹⁸² Cf. Bloch 1985, page 313.

¹⁸³ Grossberg 1996, page 90.

¹⁸⁴ For that discussion, confer the outline of Simon Strauß: “Gemeinschaftsverlust als Selbstverlust”, cited according to Nimmervoll 2018 a, page 8.

¹⁸⁵ Grossberg 1996, page 100.

a quality of being; identity is static and determined existence, whereas consciousness is becoming and desire. In short, consciousness is historical (not to mention spatial).”¹⁸⁶

The quotation confirms the multiple usage of Hegel’s concept, as according to the Hegel-connoisseur Ernst Bloch Hegel’s *consciousness* is by no means temporal (and, therefore, probably not historical).¹⁸⁷

As the Afghanistan-expert Gabriele Rasuly-Paleczek has proved with a comprehensive presentation of various literature on Afghan *identity* formation, the perception of its formation according to the three variables mazhab (sect group), qawm (solidarity group) and watan (homeland) is highly flexible among Afghans.¹⁸⁸ Especially regarding the latter, watan, the perception “is highly ambiguous, as to both scope (village, valley, district, province, region, nation) and time (place of origin, or place of residence).”¹⁸⁹

The assessment of the ambiguity of variables serving some sort of *consciousness* formation confirms the assumption most distinctly expressed by Benedict Anderson in his seminal work *Imagined Communities. Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*: “It [the nation] is imagined because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion.”¹⁹⁰

Consequently, peoples of Afghanistan serve as role models for the following considerations because they challenge – perhaps by the help of other imagined variables – the concept of nationalism, as a mere invention of 18th century Europe from which religious belief disappeared.¹⁹¹

2.3. Self-localization of the author

As I have tried to make clear with chapter 2, all assertions of the present study on Afghan women are made under certain premises resulting from my entanglement into the global power/knowledge system. In order to minimize the distorting impact of my position as writing subject, I decided to perform at least these two actions: First, the present chapter is a precise reflection on the issue and this sub-chapter depicts the reflection on myself. Secondly, I opted

¹⁸⁶ Ching 2001, page 195.

¹⁸⁷ Cf. Bloch 1985, page 322.

¹⁸⁸ Cf. Rasuly-Paleczek 1998, page 211.

¹⁸⁹ Rasuly-Paleczek 1998, page 211.

¹⁹⁰ Anderson 1991, page 6.

¹⁹¹ Cf. Anderson 1991, page 11.

for an eye-level approach to my study's "objects" to enable them to "turn into subjects of their history and experience."¹⁹²

I do so following Homi K. Bhabha's track that creates a new sort of approaching issues of cultural difference: the acknowledgement of *disjunctive temporality* that develops by the re-valuing of customary, traditional practices that have no *a priori* – and by doing so within situations of social crises and agonistic behavior.¹⁹³ This new approach establishes "signifying time for the inscription of cultural incommensurability where differences cannot be sublated or totalized because *they somehow occupy the same space*."¹⁹⁴

With reference to women of the Afghan diaspora in Austria, we not only occupy spaces together in an immediate, physical sense. We also do so metaphorically, in the resistance against suppressive structures that try to subordinate women because of their socially inscribed gender roles. – Nevertheless, the appearance of the contestable gender roles as well as the means we will choose for our struggles of resistance might remain incommensurable. That's why, I consider Bhabha's approach very convincing to leave the epistemological narrative of culture consciously in turning to an *enunciative concept of culture*. As the latter "is a more dialogic process"¹⁹⁵, it invites me to learn, while I'm doing research, from women whom I treat *as subjects of their own history*.

This careful approach is necessarily bearing in mind my German descent: As Avtar Brah has impressively elaborated already in 1996, Europe has "constructed itself and its others"¹⁹⁶ and exercised hegemony as colonizing power on a global scale. Being aware of all negative implications of the European Union's project, I feel happy to have been raised and educated within the European Union. I've studied its origins and values within the past three years and I guess that it is the world's best place to live.

Nevertheless, this wonderful European descent has inculcated me with promises of objectivity and universality. Promises which, indeed, follow the disjunctive and binary ideologies that govern the capitalist Western world. According to Donna Haraway, these ideologies form binaries of mind and body, distance and responsibility, subject and object.¹⁹⁷ This is a heritage which I cannot unlearn. But I'm aware of it and prepared to acknowledge different traditions of thinking.

¹⁹² Bhabha 1994, page 178.

¹⁹³ Cf. Bhabha 1994, page 177.

¹⁹⁴ Bhabha 1994, page 177.

¹⁹⁵ Bhabha 1994, page 177.

¹⁹⁶ Brah 1996, page 153.

¹⁹⁷ Cf. Haraway 1988, page 583.

3. METHODS

This chapter serves to highlight the methodological features of the present work. Chapter 3.1 draws on the overall methodological background. Chapter 3.2 provides remarks on the choice of a mixed methods approach to the paper's issue. Chapter 3.3 (questionnaires) and chapter 3.4 (semi-structured interviews) are concerned with the modes of realizing the mixed methods approach. With chapter 3.5, the choice of the present study's participants is reasoned. Chapter 3.6 provides an overview over the respective literature. With chapter 3.7, I will highlight some characteristics of the field work in Pakistan compared to the field work in Austria. Chapter 3.8 draws conclusions from the present work to opportunities for improving the methodological approach.

3.1. Comment on the methodological background

The choice of methods follows a constructivist approach. Consequently, it is assumed that identities constitute the material world and that the structures of the material world mutually constitute identities.¹⁹⁸ This paper is focused on the individual identity in psychologist terms, framed here as consciousness. While social identity means the part of the self which is socially shared with others,¹⁹⁹ an individual's personal identity is – in psychologists' terms – defined as the aspects which the individual considers as important within her own life.²⁰⁰

Between July and October 2018, 57 questionnaires have been filled out by female participants in Austria and Pakistan. These questionnaires have been available in Dari, English and German. Out of the answers of the first questionnaires that have been returned, questions for semi-structured interviews have been prepared.

My personal and professional background was essential for achieving the filling out of the questionnaires as well as the appointments for qualitative interviews: In Austria and in Pakistan, I had to network extensively for getting access to women.

As deputy of the head of the Afghan cultural association AKIS (Afghanische Kultur, Integration und Solidarität) in Vienna / Austria, I had a strong starting point for contacting potential project participants. In Vienna, there exist around one dozen Afghan cultural associations. Every association represents a specific position within the ideological and political formations of 'Afghan culture'. In order to avoid the production of biased results caused by my

¹⁹⁸ Cf. Rae 2002, page 22.

¹⁹⁹ Cf. Turner-Zwinkels et al. 2015, page 3.

²⁰⁰ Cf. Turner-Zwinkels et al. 2015, page 4.

personal entanglement into one of these formations, connections to the other associations, namely *Afghan Wulas*, *IGASuS* (Interessensgemeinschaft afghanischer SchülerInnen und StudentInnen), *Interkulturelles Entwicklungszentrum* and *KATIB*, have been established. Besides that, I maintain vital connections with the Vienna Institute for International Dialogue and Cooperation (VIDC)²⁰¹ and the Viennese Asylkoordination.²⁰² Both institutions contributed very valuable recommendations to the present work. The outreach director of the Asylkoordination, provided an irremissible contact with the Foreign Aid section of the Austrian Caritas and its in-charge for Pakistan.²⁰³ The contact with the Caritas' Foreign Aid section meant a major step forward for the present study: The Austrian Caritas connected me with FACES Pakistan, a project co-funded by the Caritas and the European Commission among others, that promotes social progress in Pakistan. FACES Pakistan maintains a project in Lahore, capital of the Pakistani province Punjab, to strengthen the livelihoods of refugees from Afghanistan and their host communities there.²⁰⁴ Via e-mail, I agreed with representatives of FACES to visit the Lahore-project of FACES Pakistan in September 2018.

Besides, by that time I had already established connections with the International Islamic University Islamabad (IIU) in Pakistan's capital. This contact was made via my personal friends, two brothers, whom I got to know in the course of our studies at the University of Vienna in 2014. The International Islamic University Islamabad would then serve as a second hub of project participants in Pakistan.

My research stay in Pakistan took place between September 1st and September 8th 2018.

3.2. Capacities of the mixed methods approach

Following the basic assumption of mixed methods research representatives, I assume that the complexity of human lives can only be depicted adequately while approached in both ways, with a qualitative and with a quantitative method as well. The mixed methods approach enables the researcher to incorporate this complexity by equipping the lived experiences of individuals (qualitative inquiry) with generalizable results (quantitative inquiry).²⁰⁵

According to the common usage of mixed methods research, I've derived the methodology for the qualitative investigation (semi-structured interviews) from the first quantitative results

²⁰¹ For further information on the VIDC, please refer to the website: <http://www.vidc.org/en/> (February 3rd 2019).

²⁰² For further information on the Asylkoordination, please refer to the website which is, unfortunately, only available in German: <https://www.asyl.at/de/> (February 3rd 2019).

²⁰³ Learn more about the Caritas projects in Pakistan from the website: <https://www.caritas-stpoelten.at/hilfe-angebote/auslandshilfe/unsere-projektlaender/pakistan/> (February 3rd 2019).

²⁰⁴ For further information on FACES Pakistan and its projects, please refer to the website: <https://www.facespakistan.com/> (February 3rd 2019).

²⁰⁵ Cf. Guetterman et al. 2017, page 2.

(questionnaires).²⁰⁶ This enabled me to consider “both microlevel (i.e., individual) and macrolevel (i.e., historical, political, social, environmental) variables.”²⁰⁷

Consequently, the mixed methods approach was highly useful to grasp the complexities of Afghan women’s lives: the quantitative inquiry delivered an impression of the *societal expectations* Afghan women usually face, while the qualitative investigations unearthed opportunities and realities of *subversion of these expectations*.

3.3. Quantitative inquiry: questionnaires

On July 26th 2018 I started distributing questionnaires in Vienna. At the closure of the survey by mid-October 2018, their ultimate amount should run to 57 pieces. 50 questionnaires had been filled out by Afghan women living in Austria, while seven questionnaires had been filled out by Afghan women living in Pakistan.

I’ve compiled the English and the German version of the questionnaires myself.²⁰⁸ For the Dari version of the questionnaire I mandated a translator. The first translator belongs to the Afghan cultural association AKIS: He lives in Austria since December 2015 as an asylum seeker. He has completed a secondary school in his homeland and has started studying law before his escape. Having a proper knowledge of English and, meanwhile, a good knowledge of German, he was eligible for the task of translation. The asylum seeker has translated the questionnaires into Dari. Unfortunately, as an asylum seeker in Austria, he had restricted access to the necessary devices which sometimes hampered him completing his tasks. It is my serious concern to mention these specific constraints here.

Altogether, the first of my translators provided me with very reliable work. Nevertheless, when I made my final decision to focus on Afghan women only, I had to decide for a new, female translator. I’ve got to know my second translator also during my work at the Afghan cultural association. She had arrived in Austria in 2011. Before she had worked as a legal advisor with a mandate of Medica Mondiale in Kabul.²⁰⁹ She had studied law at Kabul University, but has never completed her degree. The mother of five lives as a recognized refugee with her family in Vienna. The second of my translators agreed on July 18th 2018 to support my study on Afghan women. From that moment on, she hovered over me. She has revised the Dari version of the questionnaire, retranslated all questionnaires which had been filled out in

²⁰⁶ Cf. Teddlie / Tashakkori 2009, page 189.

²⁰⁷ Creamer 2018, page 921.

²⁰⁸ The English template of the questionnaire is attached to the present paper with chapter 8.2.

²⁰⁹ For further information on Medica Mondiale, please refer to the website: <https://www.medicamondiale.org/en.html> (February 5th 2019).

Dari into German and accompanied me to numerous meetings at a few Afghan cultural associations. As recognized refugees, she and her family command over an own computer which alleviated her work considerably.

From the questionnaires, I've drawn the main conclusions on the basic characteristics of my participants like age, years of schooling and types of graduations. Moreover, I got concise data on the social units of identification by asking for the *presence of social units in daily life* on the one hand and asking for *the most valuable social units* on the other hand.

3.3.1. Procedure of the questionnaire's distribution

The distribution of the questionnaires started on July 26th 2018 at the AKIS cultural association. Altogether, I distributed 78 hard copies of the questionnaires in Vienna / Austria. On request of a representative of the Afghan cultural association IGASuS, I've additionally compiled an online questionnaire of the same content via [soscisurvey.de](https://www.soscisurvey.de).²¹⁰ The survey was published online on August 14th 2018 and I sent the link to three Afghan cultural associations as well as the Viennese Caritas immediately that day. The online survey was closed by September 30th 2018.

At the end, I received 43 hard copies of the questionnaire in return from Afghan women in Austria and seven women filled the online survey in German. Nevertheless, the data collection was accompanied by periods of deep frustration: Within the first two weeks, I distributed 48 hard copies mainly personally and got none in return.

By August 8th 2018 it was ready at last and the first five questionnaires in Dari and five questionnaires in German were returned.

The questionnaires have been distributed at various events of the cooperating Afghan cultural associations: For example, at a swimming course graduation with 16 Afghan women (August 12th 2018), at an Afghan mosque in Vienna (August 17th 2018) and at a women's cycling course (August 20th 2018).

To ensure the return of the distributed forms, I went to most of these occasions personally and chose partially unconventional methods: For the distribution at the mosque, I had to take into consideration, that the mosque is not the convenient place to fill out a questionnaire and that the women would ask me, if they could take the questionnaires home. After my negligence during the first distributions at diverse Afghan cultural associations, I was prepared this time: I had bought extra envelopes

²¹⁰ Learn more about so-sci-survey from their website: <https://www.soscisurvey.de/> (February 5th 2018).

which I equipped with my Viennese home address, in advance, in addition to the envelopes, wherein the questionnaires could be packed anonymously. I put the stamps on the envelopes immediately during the distribution.

The women were asked to take the questionnaires home and to send it to my home via post. To this mosque action, I was accompanied by a very engaged young Afghan woman, mother of one daughter, whom I had got to know in the course of my research. She gave me advice in advance of our visit regarding the suitable veiling – and helped within the mosque by translating my explanations into Dari. Nevertheless, this method didn't work out at all: None of the eight questionnaires distributed in envelopes and marked with my Viennese home address have been returned via post.

The procedure in Pakistan was similarly difficult: I arrived in Lahore, Punjab province, and after a four days stay took the bus to travel to Islamabad. My main contact in Lahore was provided by FACES Pakistan whose in-charge had agreed in advance to take me to one of the huge refugee camps in Lahore's outskirts. Evidently, none of the adult Afghan female inhabitants of the camp I encountered, has been able to read and write. In a two and half hours occasion, I've filled four questionnaires myself, with the inevitable assistance of two interpreters: one woman from Afghanistan, whose mother tongue is Pashto, translated into Urdu, the first official language of Pakistan, and my Pakistani colleague, representative of FACES Pakistan, translated from her mother tongue Urdu into English.²¹¹

In Islamabad, from where I took the return flight, I've met students from Afghanistan, only a few years younger than me. Two of them have been registered for a bachelor's degree program and one was busy with compiling her own master's thesis. These students filled the questionnaires easily and completely.

3.3.2. Disadvantage of this method

The most remarkable reason, why the survey via questionnaires turned out to be very debilitating and time-consuming, is that many of the participants are illiterate. The illiteracy is accompanied by a deep shame. I've learned this during my personal presence at questionnaire distribution occasions: Often women refused to fill out the questionnaire, when they were there without any confidant. When they had a confidant among the present, they often asked her to help them filling out the questionnaire.

²¹¹ Please find the protocol of this occasion in chapter 8.1.1 of the present paper.

A survey via questionnaires among Afghan women *must* take this situation into consideration. One possible solution could be to issue specific invitations to the distribution events and to make sure, that the participants are prepared to fill out questionnaires – and accordingly bring a literate friend. Unfortunately, this bears the risk to foreclose the participation of illiterate women. But I personally could maybe compensate this negative aspect of the method thanks to my stable Afghan network in Vienna.

3.4. Qualitative inquiry: semi-structured interviews

In addition to the questionnaires, six qualitative interviews with Afghan women and two expert interviews with Pakistani women were conducted. These interviews served, first, to underline impressions which have been derived from the responses of the questionnaires, secondly, they served to offset issues which I had entirely overseen when compiling the questionnaires. The central issues of the interviews were, therefore, the concept of honor and the structure and the power-relations of the women's families.²¹²

At first, I asked three women in Pakistan for interviews.²¹³ After my return from Pakistan, I asked three women in Vienna / Austria for interviews.²¹⁴ The two female experts were requested to deliver information, spontaneously. I met them both during my stay in Pakistan and - after spending some time with them – realized, that they would contribute a lot to the overall pattern of the present study.

All semi-structured interviews in Pakistan have been conducted in English, all semi-structured interviews in Austria have been conducted in German.

3.5. Connecting with participants via Facebook

In order to answer hypothesis 6, I connected with six participants via Facebook. Hypothesis 6 of the present paper runs that the self-representations on Facebook are narrative representations, which differ from the real life personalities.²¹⁵

Again, three Afghan women living in Pakistan and three Afghan women living in Austria have been chosen for this purpose. The connections were established on mutual agreements

²¹² For the draft of the generalized questions, please refer to chapter 8.3.1 of the present paper. These questions have been used as template and were adjusted according to the individual interviewee. Mostly, some questions have been added to the template.

²¹³ Please, refer to chapter 8.1.4 and chapter 8.1.5 for the full transliterations of the interviews.

²¹⁴ Please, refer to chapter 8.1.6, chapter 8.1.7 and chapter 8.1.8 of the present paper for the full transliterations.

²¹⁵ The analysis of this hypothesis follows with chapter 4.8 of the present paper.

over the terms of this connection. The respective Declaration of Consent is attached with chapter 8.4 of the present paper.

3.6. Reasoning the criteria for the choice of participants

For all examinations of the present paper, only a part of Afghanistan's female population was addressed. Nevertheless, I followed the principle to repel no one and have depicted all Afghan women, who had answered some of my questions.

Still, the articulated preference was based on three pillars:

- a. womanhood or self-definition as female.²¹⁶
- b. Dari as the main or one of the personal main languages.
- c. Permanent residence in Austria or Pakistan for maximum 20 years.

3.6.1. Womanhood or female self-definition

This selection criterion was taken due to a hint of an UNO-diplomat. He had travelled to Pakistan in April 2018 and returned with the impression of a highly gender-segregated society. One of the most striking examples is the Islamic University of Islamabad: There are two campuses, which are strictly segregated, the "female" campus and the "male" campus. On the female campus, one meets almost exclusively women students and few male lecturers, though many lecturers deliver speeches on both campuses.

Based on his own experiences in Islamabad, the UNO-diplomat recommended urgently to focus on women only. As a female researcher, he impressed on me, I would hardly get access to the males' feelings and opinions.

3.6.2. Dari as the or one of the main languages

Most Afghans have grown up bilingually, many even with three languages. Many speak Dari, which is very similar – but not identical – with the Iranian Farsi, as many speak Pashto which has some similarities with the Urdu-Arabic of Pakistan, and also many speak Uzbek, which shows similarities with languages that appear north of Afghanistan. Of course, language is one of the most important features of identification. In

²¹⁶ Due to the sceptic attitude of Afghan societies towards transgender personalities, based on apparently religious and especially traditional norms and values, a non-biologically reasoned conception of the self is rarely found among people from Afghanistan. Nevertheless, transgender personalities are expressively not excluded from the present study. – Remarkably, Pakistan has a considerably huge transgender community.

Afghanistan, the issue of language is also ethnically charged and, therefore, a very sensitive matter.

As there has never been a reliable census in Afghanistan²¹⁷, assertions about the majority of language speakers are as hard to make as assertions about the ethnic majority. The Afghanistan-expert Thomas Barfield assesses this issue by the following tongue-in-cheek account:

*In the absence of real data, Pashtun-dominated governments have always asserted that Pashtuns constitute an absolute majority in Afghanistan. [...] More recently, Hazaras have entered the numbers game to make themselves equal to the Tajiks. [...] If one were to give equal weight to all of these partisan estimates and offer offense to none, it would be safe to say that the five largest ethnic groups in Afghanistan comprise approximately 185 percent of the country's total population with smaller groups accounting for another 15 percent.*²¹⁸

Against this background, I made mainly deliberations of simplification: Among others, the questionnaire had to be translated into the chosen language Dari. If the choice would have been made for a couple of Afghanistan's languages like Pashto, Uzbek and Dari, this would have entailed a huge expense in administrative and financial terms. Moreover, Dari as a mother tongue encompasses numerous groups of Afghanistan, such as the Tajiks, the Hazara, and the Aimaq,²¹⁹ as well as the Quizilbash and the Arabs of Afghanistan.²²⁰ It is, furthermore, the official court language and has a high reputation.²²¹ The Hazara and the Tajiks have focused on education and are, subsequently, highly represented in the administration of the state, while the Pashto speaking groups have played an important role in unifying tribes.²²²

3.6.3. Permanent residence in Austria or Pakistan for maximum 20 years

The period of 20 years for the residence in the welcoming country as a pre-condition, should simply ensure, that there are still vital memories of the life in Afghanistan available.

²¹⁷ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 23.

²¹⁸ Barfield 2010, page 24.

²¹⁹ Cf. Rasuly-Palczek 1998, page 205.

²²⁰ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 29.

²²¹ Cf. Rasuly-Palczek 1998, page 205.

²²² Cf. Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 407.

3.7. Literature review

The literature review had to encompass two different major fields of science: historical science concerning Afghanistan, and various branches of the humanities focusing on consciousness and identity. Following these prescriptions, terms like ‘Afghan women’, ‘Afghan diaspora’, ‘Afghan identity’ and ‘history of Afghanistan’ have been employed in the search engine of the University of Vienna library equally with ‘consciousness’ and ‘self’, at first.

In the course of reading, specific fields of interest became apparent, which led to redefined terms of search. Regarding the first field, historical science, the terms of search changed to ‘bride price Afghanistan’, ‘Revolutionary Association of Women of Afghanistan’ and ‘Afghan refugee women’. Furthermore, there are salient scientists among the Afghanistan connoisseurs whose names as authors have, consequently, been inquired: Huma Ahmed-Gosh, Homa Hoodfar, Valentine Moghadam, Elaheh Rostami-Povey, Thomas Barfield and Stefan Schütte to name just a few. Within the second field, the consciousness-approach, certain theorists appeared to be very valuable, in the course of the search. The most important are Judith Butler, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Benedict Anderson, Homi K. Bhabha, Jacques Derrida and Michel Foucault.

3.7.1. Search following the snowball principle

For the natural sciences and medicine, there is a database called *scopus* which provides users with a list of the employment of a scientific article by future authors. Although, *scopus* claims to provide also articles of the social sciences, this tool is upgradable to some extent. I’ve unsuccessfully tried to utilize *scopus* with a couple of the terms of search concerning the Afghanistan issue. Besides this, the social sciences are – as far as I’m concerned – lacking this tool.

Therefore, I employed a reversed snowball principle: I read several recent publications and out of their lists of references selected older valuable publications. By doing so, I reached back even to the work of the medieval historian Ibn Khaldun (1332 – 1406). I read about his opus first in Barfield (2010),²²³ and then borrowed his book in the abridged version first published 1967.²²⁴ This method also unveiled a certain tradition of feminist thinking, whose representatives are engaged with Afghanistan and follow a post-colonial track. These are the authors named above as distinguished Afghanistan connoisseurs.

²²³ Cf. Barfield 2010, pages 56, 58, 59 & 61.

²²⁴ Herein, the 2005 edition of Khaldun’s work is cited. Cf. Khaldun 2005.

3.7.2. Overview of existing literature

Besides scientific literature, I have also quoted journalistic works. To there belong the interviews published in the Austrian daily newspaper *Der Standard*.²²⁵ There is also the US-American journalist Steve Coll (2018), who contributed a lot to the knowledge of Afghanistan's contemporary history. Of course, these publications are utilized with regard to single events which are, therein, considered isolatedly. Such publications do not serve to analyze the broader context.

For the latter ends, there are other useful publications: The Iranian Afghanistan-expert Elaheh Rostami-Povey focusses on the same nexus as the present work, i.e. Afghanistan and women's identity.²²⁶ Also, Zuzanna Olszewska (2007) contributed considerably to a better understanding of Afghan women's self-definition, approaching this issue via poetry analysis.

Contributions from non-feminist points of view are, of course, not less valuable: The Afghanistan scientist Nabi Misdaq has published a very convincing work on Afghanistan, its political frailty and external interference.²²⁷ Thomas Barfield (2010) and Olivier Roy (1994) belong to the well-known Afghanistan connoisseurs. While I have newly discovered Stefan Schütte's (2009 & 2014) works during the course of this research. Remarkably, Stefan Schütte wrote a very sensitive account of Afghan women's agency and gender relations in Afghanistan.²²⁸

It is noteworthy, that many non-governmental organizations and Think Tanks on Afghan women have formed in the USA. There is the association *Women for Afghan Women* which was established in November 2001 in New York.²²⁹ There is, furthermore, a publication of the University of California Press which is funded by the Anne G. Lipow Endowment Fund for Social Justice and Human Rights of this university press.²³⁰

In addition, I relied on other specialist literature like the assessment by Friederike Stahlmann running to 414 pages and mandated by a German court.²³¹ Moreover, I took the *Fact finding mission report* of the Austrian Thomas Schrott (2018) as reference. Last

²²⁵ Cf. Nimmervoll 2018 a & Nimmervoll 2018 b.

²²⁶ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 a & Rostami-Povey 2007 b.

²²⁷ Cf. Misdaq 2006.

²²⁸ Cf. Schütte 2014.

²²⁹ Cf. Mehta 2002, page X.

²³⁰ Cf. Heath / Zahedi 2011.

²³¹ Cf. Stahlmann 2018.

but not least, the travel guide on Pakistan written by Susanne Thiel (2012) was an inspiring and helpful book, also for approaching the Afghan culture.

It is my concern to disassociate myself expressly from one publication: The book of Hafizullah Emadi is the work of a Pashtun nationalist, as the first pages of the main text prove. Lacking a sufficient census, it is impossible to draw conclusion on the ethnic majority among the Afghan peoples.²³² Nevertheless, Emadi does so without reflecting on it and claims – as Pashtun nationalists are used to – the Pashtuns provided the majority of the country.²³³ Shortly after, Emadi refers to “Aryana”²³⁴ which is a myth employed either traditionally by Pashtun nationalists to “prove” “the superiority of Pashtuns”. Also, I don’t share these attitudes at all, I employed Emadi’s treatise as it provides a deep insight into the status of women of Afghanistan. It is very fruitful in the latter regard but it is important for me to articulate that I don’t share Emadi’s opinions.

3.8. Experiences from the field work in Pakistan compared to the work in Austria

The key difference in the disposition towards the world between Afghan women living in Pakistan and Afghan women living in Austria is, that ethnicity for Afghan women in Pakistan doesn’t play a role at all, while for Afghan women in Austria their ethnic belonging is one of the most determining aspects. My assumption concerning this observation runs as follows: In Pakistan, Afghan women do not lead typical diaspora lives as they remain within their cultural circle. Both, Afghanistan and Pakistan, are Islamic republics.

In Austria, there is much more concern among members of the Afghan communities to identify as different from the secularized and hedonistic welcoming society. That is why, the many overlapping features of the concept of diaspora on the one hand, and the concept of ethnicity reinforce each other in the Afghan diaspora in Austria.

This is illustrated by the following juxtaposition of both concepts. Four out of seven (diaspora concept as described with chapter 2.1.3 of the present paper) respectively four out of six (concept of ethnicity as described with chapter 2.1.4 of the present paper) build a perfect match:

²³² Cf. Barfield 2010, pages 23 & 24.

²³³ Cf. Emadi 2002, page 1.

²³⁴ Emadi 2002, page 2.

Diaspora	Ethnicity²³⁵
Not located at its <i>original homeland</i> ²³⁶	Association with a <i>specific homeland</i>
<i>Collective memory</i> about the homeland ²³⁷	<i>Collective memory</i>
Idealization of a real or <i>imagined ancestral home</i> ²³⁸	<i>Presumed common ancestry</i>
Political struggles to define the host community's members as <i>different</i> ²³⁹	Common culture that makes a <i>difference</i>

Table 1: Overlapping features of the terms *diaspora* and *ethnicity*. - Own compilation.

3.9. Methodological improvements for raising the potential of future research

3.9.1. Cultural sensitivity

The Pakistani culture allows less openness. As Pakistanis are used to delay decisions,²⁴⁰ one needs to plan a lot of time and be very patient. Steady contact in this waiting time for a decision is necessary, it is important to discuss a lot before the decision is made.²⁴¹ - The first letter of support was sent by my supervisor to the Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences of the International Islamic University Islamabad (IIU) on April 10th 2018. More than four months passed until I got the permission to stay at the IIU. This taught me to plan my next research stay in Pakistan or Afghanistan with a very long lead time.

3.9.2. Statistics program R

With the proposal of the present project, the use of the statistics program R has been announced. Finally, I've decided to renounce the use of R to avoid generalizing where it isn't necessary. Nevertheless, with reference to a future sample that is going to encompass more individuals, the employment of R will probably make sense.

This requires but a better preparation in terms of defining dependent and independent variables. As a model, I consider the work of the sociologist of religion Philip Schwadel.²⁴² For the present paper, I took the publication on *Care Seeking Patterns* among Afghan women by Sonya Stokes, Andreea L. Seritan and Elizabeth Miller (2016)

²³⁵ For all features of ethnicity cf. Saikal 2010, page 5.

²³⁶ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

²³⁷ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

²³⁸ Cf. Cohen 2008, page 17.

²³⁹ Cf. Clifford 1994, page 307.

²⁴⁰ Cf. Thiel 2012, page 185.

²⁴¹ Cf. Thiel 2012, pages 184 & 185.

²⁴² Cf. Schwadel 2015 & 2017.

as an example for the presentation of quantitative data. It is very convincing due to its clarity.

3.9.3. The issue of translation

Lacking sufficient language skills, I had to make use of translators in order to conduct this research project. Translation – be it as good as it can be – always distorts the results. Moreover, the empathic access to the respective counterpart is limited, when there is no common language. Consequently, I will improve my language skills in Dari to work more self-sufficiently in the future.

3.9.4. Missing variable in the Declarations of Consent on interviews

The Declarations of Consent on the qualitative interviews lack one important variable: At the beginning of the commitment text, the full name of the filling person must be entered because signatures are hard to identify in relation to the respective interviewee later. Please, refer to chapter 8.3.2 of the present paper to review the deficient template.

4. ANALYSIS

With chapter 4, the hypotheses of this work are made subjects of close analysis. In a first subchapter, the participants of the questionnaire-interviews will be introduced presenting their basic characteristics.

Subsequently, the main hypothesis (consciousness shaped rather by historical experiences of displacement than by place and territory) is examined based on field work experiences supplemented by literature. Hypotheses 1 – 4 (1: reliance on small social units, 2: impact of education on consciousness formation, 3: mutual impact of educational level and religiosity, 4: perception of own gender) are processed referring first and foremost to the results of the 57 questionnaires. Hypothesis 5 (environmental impact on consciousness formation) is explored relying mainly on the opus of the medieval historian Ibn Khaldun. Hypothesis 6 (checking the Facebook accounts of selected participants for differences from the real life personality) functions to introduce the issue of the use of new media in consciousness examination, grounding it on very recent literature on story telling. Hypothesis 7 (impact of Afghan poetry on consciousness) triggers a close reading of existing literature on the issue and is partly backed by the results of the questionnaires. Last but not least, hypothesis 8 (regional boundaries versus the nation state concept) works as a synthesis of the empirical and theoretical work.

4.1 Introduction of the Austrian and the Pakistani questionnaire samples

The samples of Austria and Pakistan are processed separately, as there are major differences between the two which are discussed in greater detail with the following subchapters. The following rough introduction of the participants' basic data renders an overview over the basic characteristics of both samples possible. At first, the Austrian sample is introduced whose total number $n_{\text{Austria}} = 50$. Secondly, the sample from Pakistan is depicted whose total number $n_{\text{Pakistan}} = 7$.

Participants' characteristics, total: $n_{Austria} = 50$.

Age in years		Ethnicity	
15 – 18	3	Hazara	14
19 - 28	13	Pashtun	1
29 - 39	13	Tajik	8
40 - 49	4	others	3
50 - 59	2		
Not specified	15	Not specified	24

Mother tongue	
Dari	43
Pashto	2
Not specified	5

Years of schooling		Type of school graduation	
No school	7	none	25
0 – 4 years	7	elementary	5
5 – 8 years	7	Middle school	2
9 – 12 years	19	High school	14
Not specified	10	Not specified	4

Profession outside the house	
none	32
Bank assistant	1
Course visit	4
Hair dresser	1
Islam teacher	1
Lawyer	1
Seller	1
Teacher	3
Not specified	6

Table 2: Austrian participants' characteristics. ($n = 50$) – Own compilation.

Remarkably, 25 of 50 women elaborated to have no school graduation. Simultaneously, seven of 50 women have never attended a school, additional seven women only achieved very elementary education within a period of 0 to 4 years of schooling. It is also conspicuous that 32 of 50 women stated they had no profession outside the house in Afghanistan. For an explanation of this huge number, one must take the traditional Afghan customs into consideration: To have no profession outside the house, doesn't mean to be unemployed at all. To illustrate this: One participant, aged 35, who had attended a school for four years and left this school without any graduation, answered the respective question 10 of the questionnaire ("Within the last two years you spent in Afghanistan, did you exercise a profession outside the house?") with No. The same woman pointed out to have worked at home as a sewer within the past two years she spent in Afghanistan. This was, of course, mandated and paid work but rather within the "female sphere" of the private house than in "the male", public sphere.

Regarding the sample compiled in Pakistan – depicted with the following table 4 -, a huge gap between two groups opens up with reference to the educational level: There are four women who have never attended a school and consequently do not possess any kind of school graduation, while three further women have gone to school for twelve years each and left it with the high school graduation. Although this work aims to challenge concepts of place and territory, in this case these women were actually resident in different parts of Pakistan: the four illiterate women without school graduation live in Lahore (province Punjab) in a refugee camp, the three high school graduates live in Islamabad (capital province) in order to continue their education at the International Islamic University. Nevertheless, there are differences in the societal background that reach much deeper than the actual place of residence. As this work tries to show, the place of residence is rather *the expression of a deeper meaning* than its origin.

Of course, one could conclude from this biased sample that a few customs and traditions of Afghan societies reach even beyond the benchmarks of education and social background: six out of seven women particularized not to have had a profession outside the house in Afghanistan.

With the following table 3, you see the Pakistani participants' characteristics in detail.

Participants' characteristics, total: $n_{Pakistan} = 7$.

Age in years		Ethnicity	
19 - 28	4	Pashtun	2
29 - 39	1	Tajik	3
40 - 49	0	Not specified	2
50 - 59	1		
60 - 69	1		
Mother tongue			
Dari	4		
Pashto	3		
Years of schooling		Type of school graduation	
No school	4	none	4
9 – 12 years	3	High school	3
Profession outside the house			
none	6		
Lecturer	1		

Table 3: Pakistani participants' characteristics. ($n = 7$) – Own compilation.

4.2 Close analysis of the main hypothesis

The key assumption for starting this project ran that the establishment of consciousness is based rather on historical experiences, especially displacement, than on place and territory. (main hypothesis) Retrospectively, the underlying question should might have been asked differently: The individual consciousness which this paper aims to unearth, is not yet distinctly developed. This is the striking insight, the field work both in Austria as well as in Pakistan unveiled.

This new understanding appeared to me at the beginning of August 2018 when the first questionnaires were returned by women living in Austria. A Hazara woman, aged 24 years, had answered the question if she had ever felt disadvantaged because of her gender with Yes. She had subsequently reasoned: "I often heard that I am not wanted, and it would be better, if I was

a boy. Don't allowed to do some things like boys. Heard often, that girls are the honor of the family and I should [pay] attention what to do.”²⁴³

This assertion bothered me a lot: If the term and the concept of “honor”, I wondered, are very strong and meaningful,²⁴⁴ how can the woman as the holder of this great meaning (“girls are the honor of the family”) simultaneously be marginalized to such a huge extent (“not wanted [...] would be better, if I was a boy”)? My deliberations on this strange link meandered until I returned to an interview published by the newspaper *Der Standard* one day before, entitled: “Das Kopftuch ist ein Unterdrückungsmechanismus”, in English: “The headscarf is a mechanism of suppression”. – The well-experienced interviewee therein states that she had worked with women in an advisory board and describes her experience as follows: “Die Frauen, die zu uns gekommen sind, konnten mit dem Thema Selbstbestimmung zunächst überhaupt nichts anfangen. Ihnen war zum Beispiel nicht bewusst, dass sie zwangsverheiratet sind.”²⁴⁵

Moreover, the interviewee highlighted many times that she attaches value to collectivistic societies only. This differentiation is key to understand, why the concept of individual consciousness cannot fully apply to women belonging to these societies. The respective insight can again be portrayed using the illustrative example of our 24-years-old anonymous person: The honor she holds, is the honor of a *collective consciousness* to which she as a young woman or girl *isn't the subject, but the object*. All the hypotheses of the present paper have then been examined in front of this newly gained, basic assumption.

Furthermore, the assumption that Afghan women are coined by experiences of coloniality and displacement rather than of place and territory, was too short-sighted by employing the concept of “displacement” without any reflection of the term. After the examination of the gained material, the term “dislocation” appears to be more suitable for the description of the situation of Afghan women all around the world.

As “displacement” commonly refers to the conditions of internally displaced people in a war-torn country, it also implies subtly the relation with national borders that is distinctly challenged with the present work. Dislocation, instead, refers to a home-based experience of dislocation which depicts the immediate fortune of many Afghan women: They are, indeed, *dislocated* rather than displaced – namely from their homes instead of their homelands. A comprehensive description of this form of *dislocation* is given by two of the interviewees who provided qualitative talks: Interviewee No. 4 described her own course of life as massively

²⁴³ Cited verbatim from the English original.

²⁴⁴ Cf. Hatch Dupree 2002, page 978.

²⁴⁵ Nimmervoll 2018 b, page 6.

determined by her husband's family,²⁴⁶ and interviewee No. 3, a student at the International Islamic University in Islamabad / Pakistan precisely describes how she managed to escape the dependent course of life by convincing her future husband to break with the patrilocal tradition and to move to her family's home.²⁴⁷

The sort of dislocation described above, implies an understanding of locality as rather relational than spatial.²⁴⁸ According to the inventor of the concept of locality, Arjun Appadurai, locality is in every case historical.²⁴⁹ The production of the subjects to locality, the local subjects, obeys a logic dialectic with time and space: The production of a local terrain of habitation, norms and values only achieves its sense through the existence of local subjects.²⁵⁰ And vice versa, only the existence of such a terrain of customs makes sense of the ritual techniques employed for producing local subjects.²⁵¹ With reference to Afghan women, the surrounding familiar to them is their family of origin. This is where they are used to norms and values of the social space. This is, where – as Charles Taylor put it in his work *Sources of the Self. The Making of the Modern Identity*. (1989) – *orientation* within the social space is possible.²⁵² With the marriage, they leave this familiar surrounding and enter a new set of norms and values, they enter a new set of locality, defined as a structure of feeling and a property of social life that is shaped by history.²⁵³ Given that consciousness is understood as a reflection,²⁵⁴ the experiences of dislocation of Afghan women are – in many cases – an important constitutive aspect of their consciousness. This is especially true for these women as they are socialized in a collectivistic society as unveiled with the analysis of the above sections. Therefore, the main hypothesis that the consciousness of Afghan women is shaped by historical experiences rather than by place and territory is in this respect valid.

4.3 Afghan women's preference of social units

Assuming that the main hypothesis holds true, hypothesis 1 has been set up as follows: Consciousness formation must be shaped by social units that are much smaller than a nation usually is and women – as, according to their traditional gender role, key agents of the society's

²⁴⁶ See the complete transcription of the interview in the appendix of the present paper, chapter 8.1.6.

²⁴⁷ See the complete transcription of the interview in the appendix of the present paper, chapter 8.1.5.

²⁴⁸ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 178.

²⁴⁹ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 188.

²⁵⁰ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 181.

²⁵¹ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 181.

²⁵² Cf. Taylor 1994, page 56.

²⁵³ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 189.

²⁵⁴ According to the definition of Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel as presented with chapter 2.1.2 of the present paper.

development – will be the holders of these aspects of consciousness which are assumed to be composed of smaller units of the Afghan society, namely the family, the qawm and/or the village community. (Hypothesis 1)

The usual social surrounding of the women and their rating was explored with the questionnaires by questions like “Which were your daily main tasks in the household?”, “Which of the following social units was the most present in your daily life?” and “Which of the following social units was the most valuable to you?” – with the answering options “family”, “qawm”, “village community”, “ethnic group”, “Afghans in general”, and “none of these”.

The first of the questions for the daily tasks in the household wasn’t answered by many and the few who answered often expressed confusion about this question. Remarkably, one participant simply wrote “nothing special”. This is the key statement in that regard. As depicted with tables 3 and 4 in chapter 4.1, more than the half of the women asked haven’t ever exercised a profession outside the house.²⁵⁵ Housekeeping and caring for children and elderly family members are, consequently, considered traditional daily tasks of female family members. This tradition is neither challenged by the male members of the society nor by the female members. Again, as depicted with chapter 4.2 and the broad indication of the collectivistic tradition of thinking, women are mostly not aware of an alternative to being responsible for the household and the raising of the children. Interestingly, interviewee No. 5 has related this lack of awareness to the lack of education.²⁵⁶

Unsurprisingly, 36 out of 50 women asked with the Austrian sample, stated the family was the most present social unit of their daily life. 25 of them considered the family as the only present unit, while eleven added further social units to the family. Only three out of 50 women couldn’t identify with any of the options, while five out of 50 didn’t answer this question at all.

For the Pakistani sample, the portion is different as only three out of seven women under consideration called the family the most present social unit while for two women living in the refugee camp of Lahore their surrounding village community appeared to be the most present in daily life. One woman of the Pakistani sample wasn’t able to identify with any of the supplied options, and one woman with high school graduation considered “Afghans in general” as the most present group of her daily life.

For the rating of this obvious difference of the two samples, the women in Pakistan must be approached as women in special situations. Those of Lahore are in very delicate conditions

²⁵⁵ The answers precisely resulted in 32 without a profession outside the house with reference to the Austrian sample (n Austria = 50) and 6 women without a profession outside the house with reference to the Pakistani sample (n Pakistan = 7).

²⁵⁶ Cf. Interviewee No. 5, 2018, please refer to chapter 8.1.7 for the complete transliteration of this interview.

because of their extreme poverty, those of Islamabad have been sent by their families to study abroad which means they are lifted out of their traditional environment. Notably, all three students who delivered a qualitative interview, named therein their families as the most important points of reference in their lives. But, due to their student lives abroad this relationship is interrupted for a limited time period.²⁵⁷

With reference to hypothesis 1 that social units smaller than the nation will center to the daily lives of women, it can be asserted that this hypothesis holds true. As while 36 women of the Austrian sample (n = 50) and at least three women of the Pakistani sample (n = 7) called the *family* the most present group of their daily lives, only three women of the Austrian sample and one woman of the Pakistani sample felt presence of the “Afghans in general”-suggestion.

With chapter 4.4, the rating of the social unit *family* by the women is put under concise consideration.

4.4 Impact of the educational level on the shape of Afghan women’s consciousness

Hypothesis 2 was set up with reference to the educational levels of women: It was assumed that well-educated women will highlight different features of consciousness than less educated do. With reference to the rating of the social groups, hypothesis 2 does not hold true: The distinct result of the questionnaires, instead, is that there is indeed no difference in the value attaching behavior of less and well-educated women.

To deepen the result of chapter 4.3 referring to hypothesis 1, the women’s rating of their surrounding social units was concisely examined. While we do already know that the majority of women feels the family as the most present group of their ordinary lives, with the question of *valuing*, they were asked how they feel about the presence of this unit. The answers were set into dependence of the years of schooling to examine the difference in value attaching behavior of less educated and well-educated women. As the below matrix shows, there is indeed no difference with reference to the years of schooling.

²⁵⁷ Cf. Transliterations of all semi-structured interviews, chapter 8.1 of the present paper.

Austrian participants' rating of their surrounding social groups in dependence of their educational level.

<i>Most valued social units</i>	<i>Years of schooling</i>				
	<i>No school</i>	<i>0 – 4 years</i>	<i>5 – 8 years</i>	<i>9 – 12 years</i>	<i>Not specif.</i>
Family	3	4	6	8	5
Family & qawm				2	
Family & village community	1	1			
Family, qawm & village community	1				
Family, qawm & Afghans				1	
Family & Afghans				3	1
Qawm	1	2	1	1	
Afghans in general				1	
Not specified				4	4

Table 4: Answers of the participants in Austria (n = 50) to question 4 of the questionnaire (most valuable group in daily life) as dependent of the educational level. – Own compilation.

<i>Most valued social units</i>	<i>Years of schooling</i>	
	<i>No school</i>	<i>9 – 12 years</i>
Family	2	3
Village community	1	
None of these	1	

Table 5: Answers of the participants in Pakistan (n=7) to question 4 of the questionnaire (most valuable group in daily life) as dependent of the educational level. – Own compilation.

4.5 The impact of religious belief on the shape of Afghan women's consciousness

Hypothesis 3 on the mutual impact of religious believe and consciousness, runs as follows: More educated women will base religion to another significance than less educated ones. (Hypothesis 3) The validity of hypothesis 3 was expected to be investigated with question 12 ("How much time did you have for prayer each day?") and question 13 ("How many times per

week did you go to the mosque?") of the questionnaire. The results are relatively weak as – depending on their cultural and familial backgrounds – many women haven't been allowed to go to the mosque at all during their time in Afghanistan. Therefore, question 13 cannot be used to explore the validity of hypothesis 3, as its answers are distorted by prohibitions imposed on the women.

The questions had to be answered by multiple choice options. The options for answering question 12 ("How much time did you have for prayer each day?") ran:

- Altogether 25 minutes
- Approximately 1 hour
- More than 1 hour

These options have been developed based on the following deliberation: Islam requires that believers pray five times per day, the worshipping is usually performed in a segregated room during the ordinary daily life. To name an illustrative example, the cultural association where I'm employed holds eight prayer carpets in its office to borrow it to guests for their prayers. Guests tend to accept this offer, borrow a carpet and choose a calm room to pray. Taking these experiences into account, the assumption that women invest 25 minutes per day into prayer means that they won't do more than fulfilling the absolute duty. As they need to prepare a carpet, segregate themselves from ordinary life, sit down facing Mecca and then start worshipping. Given that they perform this task – as required by Islam – five times per day, they would mobilize five minutes for each prayer.

While assuming that a woman invests "approximately 1 hour" per day for prayer, given that she performs the prayer – as required – five times per day, would mean that she mobilizes 12 minutes for each of her daily prayers which allow her to really focus on this task.

A woman who states that she invests "more than 1 hour" per day in prayer, takes the task of worshipping, and therefore her belief, very serious. It may be legitimate to call her a very religious person.

The results of the respective question 12 are depicted down below in dependency of years of schooling. Table 6 shows the results for the interviewees in Austria, table 7 shows the results for the interviewees in Pakistan.

<i>Daily time for prayer</i>	<i>Years of schooling</i>				
	<i>No school</i>	<i>0 – 4 years</i>	<i>5 – 8 years</i>	<i>9 – 12 years</i>	<i>Not specif.</i>
Altogether 25 min.	4	2	3	7	2
Approx. 1 hour	1	2	2	4	
More than 1 hour		2	2	2	1
Not specified	1			4	7

Table 6: Personal rating of religion as expressed by daily time for prayer among the participants in Austria (n = 50) in dependency of the years of schooling. – Own compilation.

<i>Daily time for prayer</i>	<i>Years of schooling</i>	
	<i>No school</i>	<i>9 – 12 years</i>
Altogether 25 min.		2
Approx. 1 hour	2	1
More than 1 hour	2	

Table 7: Personal rating of religion as expressed by daily time for prayer among the participants in Pakistan (n = 7) in dependency of years of schooling. – Own compilation.

The results of table 6 show a positive association of educational level and religion. As those who haven't ever attended a school show less incentives to invest their daily time in prayers. It becomes distinct with reference to the majority of these women who marked to invest just 25 minutes per day in worshipping, while in contrast only one out of six women who haven't attended a school ascertained she would have "approximately 1 hour" for prayer daily.

In comparison, of those women who went to school for 9 to 12 years, even four out of 17 stated to invest "approximately 1 hour" per day in prayer, while two out of 17 women particularized to pray "more than 1 hour per day".

While among those with no education more than one half chose the smallest time period possible, out of those with 9 to 12 years of schooling only seven out of 17 women marked the smallest time period possible.

In evidence from table 7, the results for women interviewed in Pakistan are very different: For the Afghan women in Pakistan, there is distinctly a negative association between education

and religiosity. Those who are well-educated tend to invest less time in prayer than those who have never attended a school.

This obvious difference between the two samples will be discussed in greater detail with chapter 5.3.

4.6 Consciousness in dependency of the gender perception

With hypothesis 4 on the perception of the own gender as a disadvantaging social meaning, I assumed that the personal perception will change with the age of the women. (Hypothesis 4) In order to depict this association, I related the answers to question 14 of the questionnaire (“Have you ever felt disadvantaged because of your gender?”) to the respective age groups. With a subordinated question, the women had the opportunity to describe the situations where they had felt disadvantaged because of their gender. The last rows of tables 8 and 9 below, report on the frequency of text-answers.

The following table 8 shows the answers by Afghan women living in Austria. With table 9 the answers of Afghan women living in Pakistan are depicted.

<i>Feeling the gender disadvantage?</i>	<i>Age in years</i>					
	<i>15 - 18</i>	<i>19 - 28</i>	<i>29 - 39</i>	<i>40 - 49</i>	<i>50 - 59</i>	<i>Not specif</i>
Yes.	1	7	10	3	2	7
No.	2	4	3	1		5
Not specified.		2				3
Text		4	7	3	1	4

Table 8: Personal perception of the own gender’s disadvantaging social meaning as dependent of age. Answers given by the women in Austria, n = 50. – Own compilation.

<i>Feeling the gender disadvantage?</i>	<i>Age in years</i>				
	<i>19 - 28</i>	<i>29 - 39</i>	<i>40 - 49</i>	<i>50 - 59</i>	<i>60 - 65</i>
Yes.		1			
No.	4				1
Not specified.				1	
Text	1	1			1

Table 9: Personal perception of the own gender’s disadvantaging social meaning as dependent of age. Answers given by the women in Pakistan, n = 7. – Own compilation.

Regarding the results for Afghan women living in Austria depicted in table 8, note that the age groups '19 – 28' and '29 – 39' are equal in size, namely containing 13 individuals each. This makes the forecast of a tendency possible showing that with the rise in age and maturity, the consciousness for disadvantages related to gender rises. As out of the women aged between 19 and 28 only seven of 13 answered the question “Have you ever felt disadvantaged because of your gender?” with Yes, while out of those aged between 29 and 39 even ten women out of 13 answered this question with Yes. It is also remarkable that out of the latter group, seven out of 13 women left a text with respect to the gender disadvantage, whereas only four out of 13 women from the age group 19 to 28 wrote a text.²⁵⁸

With reference to the sample of Afghan women living in Pakistan (n = 7), the remarkable finding is that women have grappled less with the issue of gender. One closely related note was expressed by one woman living in the refugee camp of Lahore. Asked if she had ever felt disadvantaged because of her gender in her mother tongue Pashto, the pregnant mother of three, aged 25, immediately replied in Pashto: “No, I never felt disadvantaged because of my gender. As I’ve never thought about a term like gender.” – This attitude will be more concisely approached with chapter 5.4.

4.7 Consciousness formation in accordance with environmental circumstances

The following considerations are based on the opus of Ibn Khaldun, a Mediterranean historian of the Middle Ages²⁵⁹ whose legacy has been coined “the greatest work of its kind that has ever yet been created by any mind in any time or place” by Arnold J. Toynbee.²⁶⁰ Khaldun was employed as a judge primarily while his interest in history was secondary.²⁶¹ Moreover, poetry and prose were of great interest for Ibn Khaldun.²⁶² Unsurprisingly, as litterateur he coined a neologism the meaning of which is subject to debate until today: *asabiyah*. While Franz Rosenthal translates it as “group feeling”,²⁶³ Mohammad Talbi describes *asabiyah* as “at one and the same time the cohesive force of the group, the conscience that it has of its own specificity and collective aspirations, and the tension that animates it and impels it ineluctably to seek power through conquest.”²⁶⁴

²⁵⁸ With a subordinated question 14.1 the questionnaire asked the women to specify the situation(s) where they felt disadvantaged.

²⁵⁹ Cf. Lawrence 2005, page vii.

²⁶⁰ Toynbee 1935 cited according to Lawrence 2005, page viii.

²⁶¹ Cf. Lawrence 2005, page ix.

²⁶² Cf. Lawrence 2005, page xi.

²⁶³ Cf. Lawrence 2005, page xiv.

²⁶⁴ Cf. Lawrence 2005, page xv.

This perception of collective consciousness will be an issue later on in the present paper. Regarding hypothesis 5, another legacy of Ibn Khaldun is under consideration: the distinction of desert and sedentary civilization. Khaldun regarded history as “information about human social organization, which itself is identical with world civilization.”²⁶⁵ The other aspects of daily life, like religion and politics, were – from his point of view – built upon the respective social organization of a society.²⁶⁶ Investigating the social organizations of the societies he encountered, Khaldun figured out two major differences emerging according to the different ways of people making their living: agriculture and cultivation on the one hand, animal husbandry on the other hand.²⁶⁷

Khaldun considered both sorts of organization as natural groups – as for him, their ways of living and their respective inner organization followed their surrounding structures and the fulfilment of their natural needs like producing food and clothes.²⁶⁸ From his considerations, Ibn Khaldun then concluded that the desert civilization preceded the sedentary civilization as the former is less complexly organized.²⁶⁹ Nevertheless, the Mediterranean historian was convinced, the people belonging to the desert civilization were closer to being good,²⁷⁰ because they provide for their own defense instead of entrusting it to others.²⁷¹

According to the Afghanistan expert Thomas Barfield, this division “is strongly marked in Afghanistan”²⁷². Barfield describes the small social units all over Afghanistan whose coherence is based on kinship as prototypes of Khaldun’s desert civilization.²⁷³ Remarkably, their strong group feeling (*asabiyah*) equips these groups with a sense of equality.²⁷⁴

In contrast to the desert civilization, the sedentary civilization is hierarchically organized and defines belonging by residence instead of kinship.²⁷⁵

The questionnaires and qualitative interviews of the present study are not expressive enough to draw conclusions on the particular kinds of group organizations women belong to. It is, nevertheless, noteworthy that only three women of the Austrian sample ($n = 50$) expressly referred to agricultural activities which allow the conclusion that their families were involved

²⁶⁵ Khaldun 2005, page 35.

²⁶⁶ Cf. Fromherz 2010, page 117.

²⁶⁷ Cf. Khaldun 2005, page 91.

²⁶⁸ Cf. Khaldun 2005, page 91.

²⁶⁹ Cf. Khaldun 2005, page 122.

²⁷⁰ Cf. Khaldun 2005, page 94.

²⁷¹ Cf. Khaldun 2005, page 95.

²⁷² Barfield 2010, page 56.

²⁷³ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 58.

²⁷⁴ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 59.

²⁷⁵ Cf. Barfield 2010, page 61.

in productive processes for subsistence.²⁷⁶ The 50 questionnaires of the Austrian sample convey the impression that most of the women have been enrolled in an urban life style back in Afghanistan which conforms with Ibn Khaldun's concept of the sedentary civilization. The seven women of the Pakistani sample whom I all met personally, with certainty belonged to the sedentary civilization.

4.8 First impressions of the participants' self-representations on Facebook

For the present paper, the Facebook accounts of three Afghan women living in Austria and of three Afghan women living in Pakistan were checked. The respective hypothesis ran that these media self-representations reflect narrative identities which differ from the practical identities.²⁷⁷ (Hypothesis 6)

The examination of the six Facebook accounts was based on two major assumptions:

1. Maintaining a Facebook account means to use tools of Digital Storytelling. Digital Storytelling is a computer based sort of communication that employs a bundle of media for its narration from bottom up.²⁷⁸
2. The self-consciousness is constituted within a dialogical process with others.²⁷⁹

To examine the Facebook accounts of voluntary participants, the purpose was explained to them concisely and they were asked to sign a Declaration of Consent on Networking.²⁸⁰ The networking has then tentatively been started, in order to check if the interviewees are content with connecting over long time and how fruitful the network is. I've connected via the social media platform Facebook with three Afghan women living in Vienna / Austria and three Afghan women living in Islamabad / Pakistan with my private account. The network is very calm which is mainly due to the fact, that I'm myself not a very active Facebook user.

Thoroughly, I've observed within the past three months that my connected partners are very actively using Facebook. Both from Austria and from Pakistan, two of three women post on a regular pace. One woman living in Vienna even informed about her engagement to marry via Facebook. One woman living in Pakistan informed me in December 2018 via WhatsApp that she had deactivated her Facebook account in order to achieve the focus necessary to complete her own master's thesis in political science. Another woman living in Austria and mother of a

²⁷⁶ The concrete assertions answering question 1 for the daily tasks in the household ran: "looking for the animals and feeding them" (translation German – English by M.G.), "taking out animals" and "I was a shepherd." (translation German – English by M.G.)

²⁷⁷ Cf. Reichert 2008, page 211.

²⁷⁸ Cf. Reichert 2008, page 217.

²⁷⁹ Cf. Taylor 1996 cited according to Reichert 2008, page 211.

²⁸⁰ For further details regarding the declarations on consent, please refer to the appendix, chapter 8.4 of the present paper.

small child is not very actively posting. She also doesn't share personal events, but posts mainly youtube-songs and Afghan poems that obviously reflect her feelings.

A conspicuous observation is that all three women living in Islamabad don't refer often to Afghanistan while all three women living in Vienna share steadily videos and poems from Afghanistan.

Moreover, only two women, both living in Austria, show themselves on Facebook. The residual four elude the self-representation on pictures. While the third woman who lives in Austria and is the less active poster of the Austrian sample, shows mainly pictures of her small child, the women living in Pakistan mainly present fashion pictures. The women in Austria also do so. Remarkably, they all seem to be very concerned with self-optimization.

Obviously, the observed women fulfill the requirements of the digitalized world that the media expert Ramón Reichert described as such: "Dabei geht es nicht mehr darum, sich selbst unbefangen und unreflektiert zu offenbaren, sondern vielmehr darum, Fähigkeiten zur medialen Selbstpräsentation zu entwickeln und diese gezielt einzusetzen."²⁸¹ - Consequently, hypothesis 6, that the Facebook self-representations differ from the real-life-personalities, can be maintained.

4.9 Literature review on the impact of poetry and oral history on consciousness

The act of (self-)narration as discussed with chapter 4.8 has to be embedded in a larger cultural norm: By narrating the past of a society in a we/the others form, the self-consciousness of the respective society is constituted.²⁸² As poetry composition and recitation still is the most important art form for Afghans,²⁸³ it is assumed to have a huge impact on the constitution of consciousness. (Hypothesis 7) The answer to this hypothesis is mainly given by the investigation of secondary literature. Moreover, the results of questions 19 ("Did you spend parts of [your weekly leisure time] with reading Afghan poetry?") and questions 20 ("Have you ever written a poem yourself?") of the questionnaire are considered.

With reference to the secondary literature, the most important point of reference is Zuzanna Olszewska's publication entitled "*A Desolate Voice*": *Poetry and Identity among Afghan Refugees in Iran* (2007). Therein, Olszewska points out that the recitation of literature is similar to some sort of license for saying also critical things in Afghanistan.²⁸⁴ When people like to put emphasis on something, they use to start with "Sha'er" (engl.: the poet) "mega" (engl.: she/he

²⁸¹ Reichert 2008, page 205.

²⁸² Cf. Schmidt 2008, page 23.

²⁸³ Cf. Olszewska 2007, page 205.

²⁸⁴ Cf. Olszewska 2007, page 206.

says).²⁸⁵ Also the Afghanistan expert Nancy Hatch Dupree who had first entered the country in 1962 and died in Kabul in 2017,²⁸⁶ described: “The love of poetry is pervasive throughout the society.”²⁸⁷ According to Hatch Dupree, poetry as part of narrative practices serves to maintain societal values.²⁸⁸

Surprisingly, only three of the women of the present study’s Austrian sample (n = 50) elaborated that they would “regularly” read Afghan poems. The answer options given to question 19 of the questionnaire (“Did you spent parts of [your weekly leisure time] with reading Afghan poetry?”) ran:

- Yes, regularly.
- Yes, approximately every second week.
- Yes, approximately once per month.
- No.

23 out of 50 women asked in Austria, claimed they never read an Afghan poem. For the Pakistani sample (n = 7), the results speak for themselves: Every participating woman able to read and write stated, she would “regularly” read an Afghan poem. Note, that only three of seven participants of the Pakistani sample are literate. Evidently, the four illiterate women living in the refugee camp of Lahore answered question 19 (“Did you spend parts of [your weekly leisure] time with reading Afghan poetry?”) and question 20 (“Have you ever written a poem yourself?”) both with No. Also for the sample compiled in Austria, the assumption is valid that there are many illiterate women among the participants. In many of these cases I’ve personally witnessed, a close friend assisted them with filling the questionnaire. Although Nancy Hatch Dupree ascertained that, by narration, poems are accessible for literate and illiterate people alike,²⁸⁹ the lack of the ability to read might restrict the access, especially for women living in the Afghan diaspora where customs of recitation are flawed.

The feminist theorist Rumpa Das explored poems of Afghan women in American exile and labelled their writing of poems “as acts of cultural self-definition”.²⁹⁰ The findings of the present study at least do indicate a considerable impact of poetic expression on women’s lives: As after all, ten out of 50 Afghan women being asked in Austria specify to have once written a poem themselves. In contrast, 30 of 50 women answered the question for an own poem compilation with No and residual ten women did not answer this question at all.

²⁸⁵ Cf. Olszewska 2007, page 206.

²⁸⁶ Cf. Mashal 2017, page B 6.

²⁸⁷ Hatch Dupree 2002, page 979.

²⁸⁸ Cf. Hatch Dupree 2002, page 979.

²⁸⁹ Cf. Hatch Dupree 2002, page 979.

²⁹⁰ Das 2011, page 245.

Even more distinct: Out of the three literate women living in Pakistan, two stated to have once written a poem themselves, while the third answered this question with No.

Lacking studies of other communities for comparison, it is hard to draw conclusions from these figures. But, as the above cited literature indicates, there is a demand for “cultural self-definition” by the means of poetry. – And my vague impression is that the practice of poetry recitation and writing is more common among people from Afghanistan than among people from Central Europe.

At the end, hypothesis 7 that there is a considerable impact of Afghan poetry on consciousness formation can be maintained.

4.10 Lessons from Afghan women’s self-consciousness: a challenge to *nationness* ²⁹¹

Hypothesis 8 has been drafted as a synthesis of the main hypothesis and the subordinated hypotheses 1 to 7: With it, it is assumed that the sort of consciousness that is prevalent among the interviewed women from Afghanistan is a challenge to the hegemonic concept of the nation state. (Hypothesis 8) Following Arjun Appadurai in his seminal work *Modernity at Large. Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* (1996), the politics of belonging are perceived in the present work as socially constructed values which are considered as “relational and contextual rather than as scalar and spatial.”²⁹²

With the main hypothesis and its subordinates, I have tried to analyze the texture of this relational spaces more closely. Subsequently, I aimed to show that women from Afghanistan know much more about veritable togetherness than I as an individual raised and educated in Central Europe do. So, I went out to learn at which levels of Western thoughts the concept of the nation state finds its manifestation, and which alternatives Afghan women offer. The answer is mainly given with the explorations of *collective* consciousness with the analysis-chapter of the main hypothesis:²⁹³ It is a special sense of coherence, of belonging, of togetherness that signifies a lack of Western societies.

In his seminal work *Imagined Communities. Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism* Benedict Anderson suggested to separate language from reality in order to grasp ‘the meanwhile’ of the nation state.²⁹⁴ But, at the end, as Homi K. Bhabha criticizes, “Anderson

²⁹¹ The expression nationness is based on Homi K. Bhabha’s use here: Bhabha 1994, page 250.

²⁹² Appadurai 1996, page 178, in his definition of locality.

²⁹³ For further details, please see chapter 4.2 of the present paper.

²⁹⁴ Cf. Bhabha 1994, pages 157 & 158.

fails to locate the alienating time of the arbitrary sign” in his description.²⁹⁵ Instead, Bhabha proposes, to perceive the nation “as a narrative strategy”.²⁹⁶

The concept of a group – no matter of which sort, initially – as *narrative strategy* seems to hold, also with reference to the parts of Afghan societies, I’ve encountered during my research. Nevertheless, as I’ve tried to show by pointing to the importance of ethnicity, there are of course *other narratives* in the discourses of people from Afghanistan that serve as tools of cultural identification. In order to show that, I concisely defined²⁹⁷ and, in particular, discussed the issue of ethnicity.²⁹⁸

But, contrary to the Western perception of a group, the Afghans would never get to the idea to form a nation state voluntarily. To illustrate this, I’ve revealed the course of Afghan history with chapter 2.1 of the present paper from its initial formation of “the Afghan nation state” which is said to be a legacy of Abdur Rahman Khan²⁹⁹ who ruled the country from 1880 to 1901. There is, moreover, a proved tendency of Central Asian societies – to which I account the Afghan societies – to gather in units different from the Western nation state model.³⁰⁰

In this respect, it was very advantageous to see the constitution of my own consciousness reflected in Michel Foucault main works.³⁰¹ Although, I don’t find it astonishing, that Homi K. Bhabha attests Foucault an eurocentric point of view.³⁰² Bhabha’s critique seems to be rather an appreciation than a depreciation of Foucault’s work, and so it is in my reading: As speaking about consciousness means precisely to speak about the *in-between*, the realm of intersubjectivity. Consequently, my first act as the writing subject is to take position within the social space in order to be clear about the perspective of my assertions. Moreover, consciousness only offers itself to the (conscious) thought as self-presence.³⁰³ But, the self-presence has to master something that has happened,³⁰⁴ it is as such the being of “[a] past that has never been present”³⁰⁵ – as Jacques Derrida states in *Différance* with reference to Emmanuel Levinas.

²⁹⁵ Bhabha 1994, page 161.

²⁹⁶ Bhabha 1994, page 140.

²⁹⁷ For the definition of ethnicity, please refer to chapter 2.2.4 of the present paper.

²⁹⁸ For the discussion of different perceptions of ethnicity in Austria and Pakistan, please refer to chapter 3.7 of the present paper.

²⁹⁹ Cf. Misdaq 2006, page 58.

³⁰⁰ Cf. Huntington 2003, page 175.

³⁰¹ With the following treatise, I mainly refer to Foucault 1988: Technologies of the Self, and Foucault 2013 a: Die Ordnung der Dinge. (= The Order of Things.)

³⁰² Cf. Bhabha 1994, page 243.

³⁰³ Cf. Derrida 2003, page 153.

³⁰⁴ Cf. Derrida 2003, page 151.

³⁰⁵ Derrida 2003, page 157.

This is why, “différance is not”³⁰⁶, it is rather “‘older’ than [...] the truth of Being.”³⁰⁷ As such, the sense of self-presence only occurs as *différance*, as something that not only differs but also defers.³⁰⁸ As such, *différance*, the sense of who differs and defers, is *produced*.³⁰⁹ This production by discourse is shaped over centuries as Michel Foucault has traced with his work *The Order of Things* and his work *Technologies of the Self*.

Focusing on the issue of the present paper: patterns of consciousness formation among Afghan women. – This issue, first and foremost, labelled the Afghan women under consideration as not-me. So, what is the major difference between “them” and “me”? – With hypothesis 8 that claims that the hegemonic Western model of the nation state is not applicable for groups of the Afghan society, I proposed the assumption that the constitution of individual consciousness of a society’s members is a pre-condition of the nation state. Following Foucault’s (Eurocentric, for instance) account of the breaches in occidental history, I can – remarkably, without only touching the evaluation of the consciousness of “my other”, the Afghan women – state that I feel reflected by his description of a constitution of the individual as one that needs to renounce herself.³¹⁰ This practice, called *exagoresis* in spiritual literature, was performed from the beginning of Christianity until the seventeenth century.³¹¹ I agree with Benedict Anderson, that this religious system of domination and obedience preceded the formation of the nation state.³¹² One can, moreover, get a concise scent of this development in Foucault’s work *The Order of Things*: Foucault, herein, detects a breach in the production of knowledge that took place between 1775 and 1825.³¹³ That period marks the invention of many positivistic sciences³¹⁴ which took turns with *similarity* as a kind of mystical category of knowledge.³¹⁵ This development started with the sixteenth century.³¹⁶ Also in the sixteenth century, the government of the state first appeared as distinct from different sorts of sovereignty – and independent from the personage of the sovereign.³¹⁷ As Patrick Joyce with his work *The Rule of Freedom. Liberalism and the Modern City* unearthed – taking example from the enactment of weights and measures in Britain in 1824 -³¹⁸, this turn to positivism was based

³⁰⁶ Derrida 2003, page 157.

³⁰⁷ Derrida 2003, page 158.

³⁰⁸ Cf. Derrida 2003, page 151.

³⁰⁹ Cf. Derrida 2003, page 151.

³¹⁰ Cf. Foucault 1988, page 48.

³¹¹ Cf. Foucault 1988, page 48.

³¹² Cf. Anderson 1991, page 12.

³¹³ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, pages 274 & 275.

³¹⁴ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, page 274.

³¹⁵ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, page 91.

³¹⁶ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, page 7.

³¹⁷ Cf. Joyce 2003, page 3.

³¹⁸ Cf. Joyce 2003, page 24.

upon an ideology of objectivity that should assist people in coping with the new complexity of the societies they lived in.³¹⁹ Along with it, the social realm that the nation state increasingly occupied was naturalized and declared the tool for understanding the individual self via “the society itself”.³²⁰

It is noteworthy that this development of the state took turns with the withdrawal of religious power: The ideology prepared by Christianity as described above had taught future citizens of the nation state that they carry the burden to be themselves. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak in her seminal work *Can the Subaltern Speak?* unveiled this perception of the Self as a burden even in parts of Karl Marx’s work.³²¹

Surprisingly, I couldn’t find the burden-perception within Afghan women’s consciousness at all. I had formulated one question of the six qualitative interviews as follows: “Do you feel that the concept of honor is a burden or is it something positive for you?” – None of my interviewees revived my term “burden” with her answer, most of them answered with irritation: honor is. Honor isn’t perceived as a burden you can get rid of or you must emancipate yourself from. Honor is. A woman can refuse it – expecting a bundle of negative consequences – or she can accept it. This conforms with what Spivak points out: “Class consciousness [in the Marxian sense; annotation] remains with the feeling of community that belong to national links and political organizations, not to that other feeling of community whose structural model is the family.”³²² - Spivak’s hint conforms with my observations because the thoughts of the women from Afghanistan I’ve encountered seems to be centered “to that other feeling of community whose structural model is the family”, whereas I have been socialized within the ideological sphere that also shaped Karl Marx’s model of an individual that has to be unburdened from herself. This “task” has been eagerly overtaken by the nation state in the Global North, as I’ve tried to show with the previous sections. Due to a different perception of individuality and collectivity, this takeover doesn’t seem to be necessary for Afghans.

This is the first consequence of my socialization within the discourse shaped as in-between of the dusk of Christianity and the dawn of the nation state. There is a second consequence, probably stemming from the same overall structure of discourse: the sort of knowledge production prevalent among Afghans is mainly based on the immediately tangible world. This is true, especially for women, as – according to the Afghanistan expert Elaheh Rostami-Povey

³¹⁹ Cf. Joyce 2003, page 25.

³²⁰ Joyce 2003, page 26.

³²¹ Cf. Spivak 1988, pages 276 & 277.

³²² Spivak 1988, page 277.

– only three percent of the Afghan women are literate.³²³ Consequently, they *must* rely on the things that are sensually noticeable.

Whereas, the European knowledge production since the seventeenth century is based on a sort of comparison that categorically excludes the proxy: it only allows the distinction of *identity* and difference, as Michel Foucault has impressively shown with *The Order of Things*.³²⁴ This conforms with the strictness that was established with the invention of the census in the Global North that was strongly inter-connected with the emergence of the governmental power of the nation state.³²⁵ Side note: Patrick Joyce expressly highlighted that the neutrality of the statistical system from its very beginning was “associated with masculinity”³²⁶, whereas the mandates of women within this system were “associated with understandings of their ‘natural’ condition as essentially passive and immobile, located in a domestic space”.³²⁷

Finally, as I have tried to explain with chapter 4.2 analyzing the validity of the main hypothesis: consciousness is constituted primarily by the immediate social environment as a result of absolute embeddedness into a collectivistic society. This different kind of consciousness demands direct options of identification: the *imagined community* – to coin it following Benedict Anderson - therefore, might still be *imagined* but appears, simultaneously, as tangible in the form of a permanent encounter with individuals of clan, kin and village.

³²³ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 60.

³²⁴ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, page 92.

³²⁵ Cf. Joyce 2003, pages 32 & 33.

³²⁶ Joyce 2003, page 30.

³²⁷ Joyce 2003, page 30.

5. DISCUSSION

With the upcoming chapter, I will discuss unexpected or saliently striking insights of my research. Chapter 5.1 is dedicated to the issue of social units of identification which are the families of origin, in particular. As Afghan societies follow a patriarchal and patrilocal tradition,³²⁸ the thoroughly positive impact of their fathers in fostering their freedom of choice has been highlighted by many interviewees. Therefore, I will draw a light on fathers' crucial role. Closely related is another – less pleasing – issue as discussed with chapter 5.2: the bride price that is still charged by most of the families in the course of the marriage of their daughters. The bride price means a “commodification of women”,³²⁹ whereby the women belong to the category of resources over which the community of men commands.³³⁰

With chapter 5.3, I will address the distinct difference between the Austrian and the Pakistani sample regarding the association of educational level and religiosity. As while for Afghan women living in Austria the association is distinctly positive, the well-educated women tend to invest more time in their daily prayers than the less educated do; the association is reversed for Afghan women living in Pakistan, with a rise in their educational level, they tend to invest less time in prayers. The sociologist Philip Schwadel is an expert of this issue and I will mainly rely on two of his strong publications in analyzing this gap.³³¹

Moreover, differences between the two samples have also become obvious during the field work in both countries: These differences have synthesized in the perception of the own gender which I will discuss with chapter 5.4.

Last not least, aspects with further need of consideration that couldn't be encompassed into this work, will be highlighted with chapter 5.5.

5.1. The own family's crucial role and fathers' impact

As Barnett R. Rubin has stated already in 1994, “[t]he most important political and economic institution in Afghanistan is the patriarchal, patrilineal, patrilocal family.”³³² Following the family structure as a model, the sense of belonging of the small unit communities in villages and tribes is based on the adherence to a khan who – by virtue of his power – organizes and protects the village or tribe.³³³ The khan is, evidently, male, as – although the

³²⁸ Cf. Rubin 1994, page 191.

³²⁹ Schütte 2009, page 485.

³³⁰ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 20.

³³¹ Concretely, I rely on Schwadel 2015 and Schwadel 2017 as quoted in the list of references.

³³² Rubin 1994, page 191.

³³³ Cf. Rubin 1994, page 200.

constitutional reform of 2004 grants an improvement of women's rights, women are still subordinated to men.³³⁴

In their publication *Capabilities, Perception of Well-being and Development Effort: Some Evidence from Afghanistan* (2011) Trani, Bakhshi and Rolland show that the definition of well-being of Afghans is closely related to their belonging to such a community and to meeting the expectations of this community.³³⁵ The Afghanistan expert Stefan Schütte in his extraordinarily sensitive account of the conditions of women in Afghanistan entitled *Living with patriarchy and poverty: women's agency and the spatialities of gender relations in Afghanistan* added to this assertion that the “aesthetics of suffering” belong to the expectations, the patriarchal community raises towards women.³³⁶ These expectations are shaped by the Afghan structures of living together which are grounded on two pillars: social scrutiny to maintain tribal tradition – and religion which is in the hands of mullahs.³³⁷

The hereby created, *expected* role of women within these small familial units is traditionally based on their reproductive functions.³³⁸ As Micheline Centlivres-Demont ascertains in her analysis *Afghan Women in Peace, War, and Exile* (1994), this attitude towards women is even expressed in customary marriage patterns: marriage is a matter rather of the family as a whole than of an individual woman.³³⁹

For the woman herself, marriage is usually related to emotional stress.³⁴⁰ This is because she commonly doesn't choose her husband herself, but the marriage contract is agreed upon among the male members of the families – due to customary prescriptions.³⁴¹ These male members are labelled with the attribute *banamus* which describes the ability of a man “to discipline women of the family”.³⁴² This attitude, as most of my interviewees highlighted, isn't grounded on Islam, it has emerged out of a steady state of insecurity within four decades of war.

As the well-experienced Afghanistan connoisseur Huma Ahmed-Gosh ascertained: “Women in Afghanistan hate the Afghan fundamentalists, not Islam.”³⁴³ Nevertheless, Ahmed-

³³⁴ Cf. Schütte 2014, page 1179.

³³⁵ Cf. Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 405.

³³⁶ Cf. Schütte 2014, page 1180.

³³⁷ Cf. Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 406.

³³⁸ Cf. Centlivres-Demont 1994, page 334.

³³⁹ Cf. Centlivres-Demont 1994, page 334.

³⁴⁰ Cf. Schütte 2014, page 1181.

³⁴¹ Cf. Hoodfar 2009, page 225.

³⁴² Emadi 2002, page 30. With chapter 3.5.2 of the present paper, I've distanced myself from the ideological background of the author. Once again, I do not share Emadi's perception in sum, but I consider his account of gender relations in Afghanistan noteworthy.

³⁴³ Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 9.

Gosh emphasizes the strong links between Islam and nationhood that place women in a subordinated position.³⁴⁴

This position is reproduced and manifested with the institution of the family.³⁴⁵ The family, again, serves the preservation of patriarchy by the exercise of power in expecting women to fulfill ideal gender roles.³⁴⁶ As Trani, Bakhshi and Rolland point out, the fulfillment of these expected roles becomes much more important in situations of conflict, as it then becomes “the sole pillar on which an individual can construct his/her well-being.”³⁴⁷ By fulfilling the ascribed duties and roles, the woman is thoroughly acknowledged within her family – and consequently might gain access to opportunities of agency.³⁴⁸

Four out of six women with whom I’ve had personal talks about their family lives and the term *honor*, have made clear that their fathers were the biggest supporters.³⁴⁹ Only one woman distinctly said that her father hampered her – based on the honor concept – to make free decisions.³⁵⁰ And an Afghan student at the International Islamic University Islamabad, summarized it as follows: “After getting married, the life will be very changed. As long we are living with our fathers, it is alright.”³⁵¹

5.2. The marriage market – negative influence of the bride price on women’s consciousness

In his salient publication *Living with patriarchy and poverty: women's agency and the spatialities of gender relations in Afghanistan* Stefan Schütte touches upon the nexus of women’s social subordination by patriarchy, the custom “of brokering marriages between families”³⁵² – and women’s adverse status within the family of their in-laws. This is a very appropriate statement to summarize my own impressions. Particularly, one interviewee in Pakistan³⁵³ and one interviewee in Austria³⁵⁴ highlighted the negative impact of marriage.

³⁴⁴ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 9.

³⁴⁵ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 10.

³⁴⁶ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 10.

³⁴⁷ Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 420.

³⁴⁸ Cf. Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 421.

³⁴⁹ For examples see chapters 8.1.4, 8.1.5, and 8.1.8 of the present paper.

³⁵⁰ See chapter 8.1.6 of the present paper.

³⁵¹ Interviewee No. 2, 2018, quoted from the English original whose complete version is attached to the present paper with chapter 8.1.4.

³⁵² Schütte 2014, page 1181.

³⁵³ Please, refer to chapter 8.1.4 for the complete transliteration of the respective interview.

³⁵⁴ Please, find the full version of the talk with the interviewee in Austria in chapter 8.1.6 of the present paper.

Interviewee No. 4 in Austria elaborated on the fortune of an Afghan woman after her marriage precisely:

Ja, und das ist nicht nur von ihrem Mann, sondern sie ist die Frau seiner ganzen Familie. Nicht nur von ihrem Mann. Und wenn sie verheiratet sind, dann kommt der Schwager und sagt: „Wo ist mein Hemd?“ – Und die Schwägerin kommt: „Wo ist mein Tee?“ – Und die ganze Familie sagt: „Wir haben viel Geld ausgegeben für dich! Es war nicht leicht, dich hierhin zu bekommen! Wir haben viel Geld ausgeborgt! Du bist unsere Sklavin! Du musst das machen, du musst das machen, das, das, das...“³⁵⁵

With the above assertion, my interviewee brought the bride price at stake as she quotes the family members of her in-laws as follows: “We’ve spent a lot of money for you! [...] You are our slave!” The respective bride price is a wide spread custom in Afghanistan. It is paid by the family of the groom to the bride’s and is meant as a compensation for the bride’s labor force within her family of origin.³⁵⁶ It is unknown how old the tradition of the bride price is in most of the Afghan societies. What is thoroughly known, is that there have been two serious attempts to abolish the bride price in 20th century Afghanistan. The first was undertaken by King Amanullah with the institution of women’s rights in 1924.³⁵⁷ For a second time in the 20th century, the PDPA government tried to abolish the bride price with its Decree 7 in 1978.³⁵⁸ Both attempts were met with massive resistance by the Afghan societies as they were considered an offense to Afghans’ social values.³⁵⁹ Up to now, the progressive attempts to change customary laws haven’t yielded considerable results.³⁶⁰ Contrary to Homa Hoodfar’s assessment, that most of the Afghan women even do not know that there is a codified family law and a family court in Afghanistan,³⁶¹ my interviewees have been very aware about their rights. They issued another problem: there are good laws in Afghanistan, but these are usually not used.³⁶²

Also Metin Turcan asserts that even young people do not resist the tradition and rather obey the prescriptions of their clan or tribe that might even promise babies to each other in so-called cradle arrangements.³⁶³ Within my interview sample, one of the Afghan students at the

³⁵⁵ Interviewee No. 4, 2018, for the entire transliteration please refer to chapter 8.1.6 of the present paper.

³⁵⁶ Cf. Turcan 2009, page 96.

³⁵⁷ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 5.

³⁵⁸ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 6.

³⁵⁹ Cf. Hoodfar 2004, page 148, and Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 6.

³⁶⁰ Cf. Hoodfar 2009, page 242.

³⁶¹ Cf. Hoodfar 2009, page 242.

³⁶² See the interview in chapter 8.1.6 with special emphasis on the legal issue.

³⁶³ Cf. Turcan 2009, page 96.

International Islamic University Islamabad, was the only salient example to break rank with the tradition. Interviewee No. 3 is very conscious of the fact that her example is rare and has proudly told, that she had been able to convince her future husband to move to her family's home. She elaborated:

*So, actually, I convinced him to live in my city, not in his. [...] This may sound normal in European countries. But, in my country, this is something very revolutionary.*³⁶⁴

As the interviewee above emphasized, her way of life isn't very common in Afghanistan: Usually, the bride is "acquired"³⁶⁵, and, consequently, fully integrated into the husband's family. This even means that the bride commonly doesn't inherit anything from her family of origin³⁶⁶ - a transfer which often results in a lasting traumatic experience for young girls and women.³⁶⁷

A few theorists have issued the economic background of the bride price as such: the girl is an important labor force for a household; raising her means to invest into the labor force of another (the in-law) family.³⁶⁸ Similarly, Feldbrugge has argued, as she is a valuable worker at her family's home, the marriage of a young woman means an economic loss.³⁶⁹ Consequently, the bride price is considered a compensation.

I disagree with that position: If the issuing of a bride price was only necessary for economic reasons, the position of male family members was ultimately depreciated. Because, the sons are those who cause the greatest economic loss for the family as they need to raise the price of their bride. My impression is that it is basically wrong to approach this issue from an economic perspective: Contrary to the societies of the so-called Global North, money is not the most important for the societies of the so-called Global South, as I've myself observed during my research stay in Pakistan. Therefore, I'm assuming, that the bride price results from the fact that the bride sheds her family's name and takes the name of her husband's family. We should consider the bride price renewed from the perspective of son and heir traditions.

³⁶⁴ Interviewee No. 3, 2018 quoted from the English original. For the full transliteration of this interview, please refer to chapter 8.1.5 of the present paper.

³⁶⁵ Centlivres-Demont 1994, page 334.

³⁶⁶ Cf. Centlivres-Demont 1994, page 335.

³⁶⁷ Cf. Schütte 2014, page 1181.

³⁶⁸ Cf. Turcan 2009, page 96.

³⁶⁹ Cf. Feldbrugge 1977, page 18.

5.3. On the mutual influence of educational level and religiosity

A distinct difference between the Austrian and the Pakistani sample of this study appeared with reference to the association of educational level and religiosity. This became obvious while checking hypothesis 3 which was that well-educated women will base religion to another significance than less educated women do.

Actually, the sample compiled in Austria showed a positive association of educational level and religiosity, while the sample from Pakistan depicted an obvious negative association of educational level and religiosity.³⁷⁰ This finding conforms with the results of the advanced research published by the sociologist of religion Philip Schwadel: Schwadel has compared data from 39 nations on the association of education and religiosity.³⁷¹ Although 71 percent of the survey's respondents were Christians,³⁷² while all participants of the present study are Muslims, Schwadel's investigation is very fruitful for clearing the issue emerging from hypothesis 3.

Schwadel's results show, that the negative effect of education on religiosity is especially robust in very religious nations³⁷³ – to which I do account the *Islamic Republic* of Afghanistan, as self-evident from its form of government. Schwadel explains this with the diffusion of new values from the highly educated to the less educated of a society.³⁷⁴

In a follow-up study, Schwadel points to parents' religious activity as “a key component of the religious context that not only affects their children's religiosity but also the way their children respond to attending and graduating from college.”³⁷⁵ As higher education enables young adults to distance themselves from the parental home, it will – among other aspects – bring the familiar religious practice at issue.³⁷⁶

Although, the latter publication by Philip Schwadel is expressly only generalizable for young adult Americans,³⁷⁷ it conveys a possible solution for the question of the gap emerging from the present paper's both samples: “Higher education does appear to promote religious change”³⁷⁸, but, in addition, other measures need to be considered. Besides the religiosity of the parents, the religious context during the past adolescence influences the way and magnitude to which religious change occurs distinctly.³⁷⁹

³⁷⁰ Please, refer to chapter 4.5 for further details.

³⁷¹ Cf. Schwadel 2015, page 405.

³⁷² Cf. Schwadel 2015, page 406.

³⁷³ Cf. Schwadel 2015, page 415.

³⁷⁴ Cf. Schwadel 2015, page 415.

³⁷⁵ Schwadel 2017, page 882.

³⁷⁶ Cf. Schwadel 2017, page 882.

³⁷⁷ Cf. Schwadel 2017, page 883.

³⁷⁸ Schwadel 2017, page 883.

³⁷⁹ Cf. Schwadel 2017, page 881.

The crucial insight from Schwadel's studies is, that the educational level's impact on religiosity has to be analyzed in combination with other factors. Regarding the obvious difference between the Austrian and the Pakistani sample of the present study, evidently, one has to take the surrounding contexts of the individuals into account: Like Afghanistan, Pakistan is an Islamic Republic, which means that Islam has the status of an official religion of the state. Within this surrounding, it is a benchmark of the upper well-educated class to distance themselves from religious practice. To the contrary, in *secularized* Austria, some sort of diasporic distancing must appear reversed: religion is given a higher significance with the rise in self-consciousness, as a consequence of education.

5.4. Perception of the own gender's position differing between Austria and Pakistan

In relation to the findings on differences in the association of education and religiosity, another gap appeared to be significant between both samples: While Afghan women living in Austria are commonly very conscious of gender-based discrimination, those in Pakistan responded less to the respective question.³⁸⁰

Again, my argument with reference to this assessment is similar with that to the religiosity issue: Contrary to the main hypothesis, it evidently matters *where* the asked women are. But, *according to the main hypothesis this does not matter because of the respective place*, instead it matters *because of the social boundaries* that are associated with this place.

With the assessment, that some things (like gender issues) are less pronounceable in certain contexts, we have arrived at the focal point to which the present study synthesizes: silencing is the key mechanism through which not only the patriarchal systems of Afghan societies, but also the Western imperialism there and the formation of every nation works. And, I'm unintentionally participating in this procedure of silencing.³⁸¹ This is because I contribute to the growth of an episteme whose mere possibility means violence.³⁸² Reworded less abstractly: Currently, I'm compiling my master thesis that is concerned with women originating from Afghanistan in a foreign language which most of them don't speak. Consequently, it will be hard for most of those I'm claiming to be concerned with *to articulate their own position* within the epistemic discourse. I feel, this is precisely violence.

For sure, it is possible to mitigate the violent procedures of silencing, while finding modes that enable us "to articulate that ideological formation [of the monolithic 'third-world-woman']

³⁸⁰ For the precise results from checking the respective hypothesis 4, please refer to chapter 4.6 of the present paper.

³⁸¹ Cf. Spivak 1988, page 287.

³⁸² Cf. Spivak 1988, page 287.

as Spivak calls her] – by *measuring* silences, if necessary – into the *object* of investigation.”³⁸³ Following this postulate of Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, I try to trace the *reasons for Afghan women* living in Islamic Republics to remain silent on urgent issues – like gender discrimination. I’m assuming the answer lies in the link between the women’s honor and their families’ honor which has been emphasized in numerous studies.³⁸⁴

The elaborations of Judith Butler on censorship seem to be very useful in the analysis of the Afghan honor concept. Butler defined censorship as “not merely restrictive and privative [...], but also formative of subjects and the legitimate boundaries of speech.”³⁸⁵ And interestingly, one of my interlocutors, student at the International Islamic University Islamabad, pointed out that “this question of honor is a very sensitive question in Afghanistan”.³⁸⁶ With her following assertions, she related the concept of honor not only to the family and remote relatives, but also to the place, where a woman lives. Similarly, Judith Butler frames the formative act of “censorship as a necessary part of the process of nation-building”.³⁸⁷

Arjun Appadurai in his salient work *Modernity at Large. Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* pointed already in 1996 to the fact, that cultural reproduction is an increasingly challenging task in a globalizing world.³⁸⁸ Appadurai continued that the *honor of women* is, besides an inhuman system of cultural reproduction, also “a new arena for the formation of sexual identity and family politics.”³⁸⁹

The summarizing impression is, that the concept of honor among Afghan societies serves to define the limits of the *sayable*, and in this sense – following Butler – is formative to women as *honorable subjects*. The limits of the *sayable* are constituted by the social spaces of belonging. This became obvious to me, when I felt strong bewilderment while talking to my interviewees in the Refugee Camp of Lahore / PK. Two out of four interviewed women answered the question, how much time they use to spend daily with their husbands as follows: “No time per day, but the entire night!” – and then laughed wolfishly in concert with all of the witnesses. In my perception (and in particular in the light of my expectations regarding women’s honor and the various requirements of an Islamic culture), this assertion didn’t belong

³⁸³ Spivak 1988, page 296.

³⁸⁴ Regarding this, please find concise analysis of Afghan culture in Hatch Dupree 2002, page 978, and have a glance at the interviews of Elaheh Rostami-Povey, especially in Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 61.

³⁸⁵ Butler 1997, page 132.

³⁸⁶ Interviewee No. 3, 2018, quoted verbatim from the English original. For further details, please refer to chapter 8.1.5 of the present paper.

³⁸⁷ Butler 1997, page 132.

³⁸⁸ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 44.

³⁸⁹ Appadurai 1996, page 45.

to the set of *sayable* things. But, it obviously did from these women's point of view. This caused my bewilderment.

To the contrary, in order to emphasize that there are more tools at work than Islamic culture and some sort of thus established *nationness*: When I met interviewees No. 2 shortly afterwards at the International Islamic University Islamabad, I was prepared to talk to them very openly – based on my experiences with the Afghan women in the Refugee Camp of Lahore.³⁹⁰ But, this time, it was *me* who caused the bewilderment of my interlocutors, as I asked: “[W]hich are the main aspects of honor? It is having no sex before the marriage, of course?! This is – I think – the most important honor aspect...” – Both of my counterparts felt obviously very embarrassed and didn't say more than “Yeah.” in answering this question.

This means, I observed directly what Judith Butler approached as follows: “To move outside of the domain of speakability is to risk one's status as a subject. To embody the norms that govern speakability in one's speech is to consummate one's status as a subject of speech.”³⁹¹

Also one of the experts I spoke with, insisted on the nexus of the maintenance of honor through the bodies of Afghan women and the existence of muted discourses by discussing the issue of sex work³⁹² among women from Afghanistan. Expert No. 2 referred to women in the Pakistani province Peshawar that shares a border with Afghanistan, who were sent to the owners of their families' houses as compensation for the monthly rent.³⁹³ The honor of the sending family is only kept, because the sex work is provided secretly.

5.5. Aspects future research should grapple with

With this subchapter, I summarize exceptional assessments that appeared to me in the course of my research. These aspects I had either overseen by compiling the present study's concept or I had to renounce their elaboration due to the scarcity of time and space. Herein, I allow myself a hierarchal order according to focus of interest.

³⁹⁰ Please, find the complete transliteration of the respective interview in chapter 8.1.4 of the present paper.

³⁹¹ Butler 1997, page 133.

³⁹² I'm aware of the sensitivity of the terms to name this kind of work and I know that there are proper arguments for using the term “sex work” and for using the term “prostitution” as well. Although I've started long ago to grapple with the use of these terms, I haven't yet found a suitable solution that I would be able to discuss based on sufficient arguments. Consequently, I employ the term “sex work” in the present paper following the author who is my main source of information regarding the issue: Alisa Tang argues, she prefers the term “sex work” as it de-eroticizes commercial sex and, simultaneously claims dignity of the job, cf. Tang 2011, page 160.

³⁹³ Kindly find the full version of this interview in chapter 8.1.3 of the present paper.

5.5.1. Complete commodification of women: sex work among Afghans

The latter issue of chapter 5.4, the massive spread of sex work institutions in the Afghan societies,³⁹⁴ was the most remarkable gain of knowledge for me personally. This isn't surprising, as - like touched upon with the last chapter – the issue of sex work among Afghans belongs to silenced discourses.

As the Afghanistan-expert Elaheh Rostami-Povey described, the coercion to sex work results mostly from extreme poverty.³⁹⁵ A Pakistani expert who spent much time with delivering an interview for the present thesis, highlighted the lack of alternatives for Afghan female sex workers living in Pakistan who she's met in the province of Peshawar:

*And, you know, that were apparently settled women and when women are striving, striving for food, they can be forced more into prostitution. Because bread and butter is the matter of survival. And, even sometimes if they are not forced by their men or families, they are forced by themselves: If their children are hungry!*³⁹⁶

Alisa Tang, who had been deployed to Afghanistan as a reporter of The Associated Press between 2006 and 2008, with one of the first serious publications concerning sex work in Afghanistan published in 2011 puts emphasis on the same problem: Sex work, Tang ascertains, is flourishing in Afghanistan, as “jobs are scarce to nonexistent”.³⁹⁷ The journalist also discovered, that women sex workers at a brothel in Kabul earn almost the amount of a monthly salary of a teacher or policeman with one client.³⁹⁸ Not only adult women, also minor girls and boys get engaged in the sex market.³⁹⁹

Quoting from an Ora International report, Alisa Tang states that four out of five female sex workers surveyed are married, while 15 percent find their clients through their husbands.⁴⁰⁰ One of the experts whom I've interviewed, said that it is even a common practice that the own mother gives away her daughter.⁴⁰¹

As Alisa Tang made clear with her publication *Selling Sex in Afghanistan. Portraits of Sex Workers in Kabul*, the concept of honor is utilized to mute the discourse on these

³⁹⁴ I derive the assessment, that there is a massive spread of sex work from the quotation of the parliamentarian Shukria Barakzai by the Afghanistan-expert Elaheh Rostami-Povey stating that Afghanistan's streets were “full of women beggars and sex workers”, cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 64.

³⁹⁵ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 32.

³⁹⁶ Expert interview No. 2, 2018, quotation from the English original. Please, refer to chapter 8.1.3 for the complete transliteration of this interview.

³⁹⁷ Tang 2011, page 154.

³⁹⁸ Cf. Tang 2011, page 157.

³⁹⁹ Cf. Tang 2011, page 155.

⁴⁰⁰ Cf. Tang 2011, page 157.

⁴⁰¹ Cf. expert interview No. 2, 2018, interview attached to the present paper with chapter 8.1.3.

massive invasions on Afghan women's integrity.⁴⁰² Judged as morally corrupt beyond salvation,⁴⁰³ women sex workers will be convicted as adulterers which can result to five to fifteen years of detainment.⁴⁰⁴ In the past, and especially under the Taliban regime, sex workers have also been sentenced to death.⁴⁰⁵

This is an unproved hypothesis, but my major impression is that the thriving of sex work in Afghanistan is related to the tradition of the bride price. One may rate the Soviet occupation of Afghanistan (1979 – 1989) to any contestable level, but, concerning the bride price, I share the view of the Soviet jurist F. J. M. Feldbrugge, that “the kalym [bride price] represents a basically incorrect attitude towards women”.⁴⁰⁶ I'm assuming that the commodification of women through the enforcement of a bride price gives rise to an attitude that legitimates buying a female body for sex.

5.5.2. Collective consciousness, solidarity and the promotion of education

As many former studies have highlighted, Afghan women established a considerable underground system of resistance under the regime of the Taliban.⁴⁰⁷ There were, for example, secret sewing courses organized by the Women's Association of Afghanistan.⁴⁰⁸ Rostami-Povey also reports of a woman, who had taught more than 800 students secretly in her home under the Taliban in order to prevent them from illiteracy.⁴⁰⁹ The Afghanistan-expert Stefan Schütte as well puts emphasis on the great importance of neighborhood networks, which are mostly established and maintained by women.⁴¹⁰ He also collected interviews with women in Afghanistan, who demanded women's spaces that would enable them to meet and discuss their concerns with other women.⁴¹¹

Women of Afghanistan have often proved that they are able to establish networks, which are even thus strong that Rostami-Povey goes into rapture to say: “Women's secret

⁴⁰² Cf. Tang 2011, page 155.

⁴⁰³ Cf. Tang 2011, page 160.

⁴⁰⁴ Cf. Tang 2011, page 154.

⁴⁰⁵ Cf. Tang 2011, page 154.

⁴⁰⁶ Feldbrugge 1977, page 19.

⁴⁰⁷ Elaheh Rostami-Povey is the greatest advocate of the capacities of these resistance systems and has pointed out these capacities in numerous publications, for example: cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 a, page 299.

⁴⁰⁸ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 30.

⁴⁰⁹ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 34.

⁴¹⁰ Cf. Schütte 2014, page 1184.

⁴¹¹ Cf. Schütte 2014, page 1187.

organizations and networks in Afghanistan were the only functioning organizations trusted by the community.”⁴¹²

With my own experiences in addition, observing Afghan women benevolently assisting their illiterate friends in filling my questionnaires, I, herewith, plead to use the windows of opportunity that open up through women’s diasporic trajectories in the Afghan diasporas of Austria and Pakistan. We should engage to provide Afghan women’s spaces of mutual teaching by utilizing their great sense of solidarity and collectivity.

5.5.3. The role of family names and males as sons and heirs

The Afghanistan-expert Huma Ahmed-Gosh has ascertained, that Afghan women are considered the ‘complimentary’ of their husbands.⁴¹³ This attitude, Ahmed-Gosh reasoned is based on a religiously legitimated sort of patriarchy.⁴¹⁴ Following this, the Islamic law dictates a considerable part of the gender relations in Afghan societies: According to it, a daughter is aggrieved with the heritage.⁴¹⁵ In practice, she usually inherits nothing.⁴¹⁶ This is because the woman is married into the family and belongs to it like a commodity.⁴¹⁷

Moreover, my own experience suggests that the woman usually adopts the name of her husband’s family. I’m convinced, that in the rating of women’s status within the society, this patriarchal son-and-heir tradition plays an essential role.

5.5.4. The language system and its impact on consciousness formation

As Elahesh Rostami-Povey has impressively proved, language is very essential in group identification and consciousness formation. Rostami-Povey made this clear by quoting from her encounter with a young Afghan woman who had been raised in Iran and then returned to Afghanistan:

*She spoke Farsi with an Iranian accent. In conversation with me she sometimes referred to Afghan as ‘them’. I asked her why. She said, ‘Because you are Iranian and my accent is the same as yours and not Dari accent as they speak in Kabul. I, therefore, feel that Afghans are ‘them’ and Iranians are ‘us’.*⁴¹⁸

⁴¹² Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 32.

⁴¹³ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 9.

⁴¹⁴ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 9.

⁴¹⁵ Cf. Centlivres-Demont 1994, page 335.

⁴¹⁶ Cf. Centlivres-Demont 1994, page 335.

⁴¹⁷ Cf. Moghadam 2002, page 20.

⁴¹⁸ Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 68.

Following Michel Foucault, who linked the system of language with the complexity of thought as such,⁴¹⁹ I reflected on the system of Dari language: the script is extremely complex compared to the binary system⁴²⁰ of the Latin one. The letters of the Dari-script change their appearance in each of these cases: They look different, when they are linked left-side, when they are linked right-side or when they are linked both-sides. A closer examination of the impact of this complexity on patterns of consciousness formation should be conducted.

⁴¹⁹ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, pages 78 & 79.

⁴²⁰ Cf. Foucault 2013 a, page 78.

6. CONCLUSION

The most important lesson from the present paper is that there is no cohesive object of investigation: ‘The woman from Afghanistan’ is not a generalizable framework applicable to all females who have been raised and socialized within these particular national borders. Nevertheless, it is inevitable to grapple with the role models, women from Afghanistan must conform to.

With reference to these role models, I’ve employed “the Afghan woman” as “the paradigmatic subject of the current configuration of the International Division of Labour.”⁴²¹ The capitalist division of labor follows a principal of gender segregation according to the female, private sphere and the male, public sphere which are both most distinct within the Afghan societies.

Along with this division, a complicity of patriarchy and the Western concept of the nation state arose. As Patrick Joyce has made impressively distinct, the formation of the nation state as such - via the establishment of a reliable census - goes along with the institutionalization of gender roles.⁴²² For the smaller Afghan social units which I’ve analyzed with the present paper, this institutionalization hasn’t been completed as the perception of the self is less developed.⁴²³

Instead, “community values”⁴²⁴ are rated to the highest significance. The Canadian philosopher and permanent fellow at the Viennese Institute for Human Sciences Charles Taylor in his pioneering publication *Sources of the Self. The Making of the Modern Identity*. precisely draws a comparison between the education of youth in India and the education of youth in the “western societies” by quoting the Indian theorist Sudhir Kakar:

*Die Sehnsucht nach der bestätigenden Gegenwart der geliebten Person [...] ist vor allem im Rahmen der Großfamilie der in Indien vorherrschende Modus sozialer Beziehungen. [...] Es ist bezeichnend, daß sich die Inder auf die Unterstützung anderer verlassen, um das Leben zu meistern und mit den Anforderungen der Außenwelt zurechtzukommen.*⁴²⁵

Taylor hereof concludes that the Western education encourages exactly the opposite attitude.⁴²⁶ As my observations of Afghan families are similar to those of Kakar and as both countries belong to the same world region, I consider the comparison of Indian and Afghan

⁴²¹ Spivak 2003 b, page 240.

⁴²² Cf. Joyce 2003, page 30.

⁴²³ Cf. Taylor 1994, page 81.

⁴²⁴ Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 423. Trani, Bakhshi and Rolland herewith use another term for framing what I’ve identified as collective consciousness throughout the present paper.

⁴²⁵ Kakar 1978, cited according to Taylor 1994, page 81.

⁴²⁶ Cf. Taylor 1994, page 81.

living conditions as permissible. Remarkably, the constitutive element of this meaningful community is the woman.⁴²⁷ Consequently, I've tried throughout this paper to depict the locality of women rather than to locate them physically. As extensively discussed with chapter 4.2, locality is – following Arjun Appadurai – perceived as relational and contextual function.⁴²⁸ As such, locality is produced, represented and reproduced by local subjects.⁴²⁹ For the example of Afghanistan, this is *patrilocality* at that time which results in the dislocation of women generally.⁴³⁰ At that point, my emphasis of the concept of agency brings these deliberations full circle: As soon as local subjects act as agents, that is – as explained with chapter 2.1.1 – local subjects become capable of performing “an act with consequences’, an extended doing, a performance with effects”⁴³¹, a dialectical process starts: the neighborhood of contexts starts producing the contexts of neighborhood.⁴³² The local subjects – by “generally unwittingly”⁴³³ shaping the conditions of their lives – turn into historical subjects, the subjects of their own history. In my opinion, the most desirable goal of these changes is to reshape Afghanistan's societies towards *matrilocality* for the profit of men and women as well.

Finally summarizing these insights, I agree with Trani, Bakhshi and Rolland who argued that “taking into account community values that define social roles and [...] giving a collective dimension to policies and programming in a conflict state such as Afghanistan”⁴³⁴ is of great importance. Trani, Bakhshi and Rolland, moreover, put emphasis on the widespread positive self-esteem of Afghan women which is closely related to their fulfilling of expected gender roles.⁴³⁵ By fulfilling the family's and community's expectations, women are capable of gaining a voice within their social units. Organizing these units *matrilocally* will promote the positive aspects of Afghan collectivity.

Afghan women's thus established agency may be not my personally preferred sort of agency. This is, evidently, a result of my belonging to the ideological structures of different discourses which produces an insuperable gap between the valuation of social meanings performed by my interviewees, all of them raised and educated or at least socialized in Central Asia and my valuation of social meanings as I was raised and educated in Central Europe: As

⁴²⁷ Cf. Spivak 2003 b, page 239.

⁴²⁸ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 178.

⁴²⁹ Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 179.

⁴³⁰ The most powerful insights into the power structures of patrilocality delivered my qualitative interview No. 3, 2018, for the full version of this interview see chapter 8.1.5. There are further assertions on the complicity of women with the patrilocal tradition in the qualitative interview No. 4, 2018, chapter 8.1.6 of the present paper.

⁴³¹ Butler 1997, page 7.

⁴³² Cf. Appadurai 1996, page 179.

⁴³³ Appadurai 1996, page 179.

⁴³⁴ Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 423.

⁴³⁵ Cf. Trani / Bakhshi / Rolland 2011, page 421.

Michel Foucault has impressively shown with the third volume of his work *The History of Sexuality* entitled *The Care of the Self*, the loving devotion to the self, the self-centering, is a legacy of the occident.⁴³⁶ It is grounded in the ancient Greek and Roman philosophies which are most influential to enlightenment and post-enlightenment thinkers.

It is precisely this gap which provides spaces of agency, for the subversion of the hegemonic discourse of the Global North that can and will be performed by Afghan women in the diaspora. We must provide these opportunities by allowing Afghan women to turn into historical subjects. This means, first and foremost, that people of the welcoming societies need to be *content to speak to women from Afghanistan while acknowledging them as subjects*.⁴³⁷ This does not provide space for the hegemonic discourse that demands conformation with norms and values of the so-called Global North. Being exempted from the typical Western self-loving devotion, these women then will establish new social spaces which neither institutionalize patriarchy nor remain stuck in tribal traditions. Instead, they will provide the framework of an immediate and trustworthy new kind of togetherness which will contest the hegemonic discourse of the nation state. I imagine that spaces of knowledge production and knowledge transfer can be established over time, where Afghan women act as leading agents.

The results of the present study also break with the typical Western perception of gender binary and Afghan women's victimhood to patriarchy. Rather, I've come to the conviction that men – and especially fathers – play a major role in the promotion of women's education and self-reliance in Afghanistan.⁴³⁸ In this sense, I agree with Sima Wali, one of the three women participants of the Bonn talks on Afghanistan,⁴³⁹ who has impressively highlighted that Afghan men rather belong to this new creation of togetherness than being opposed to it.⁴⁴⁰ For the diaspora societies, it is key to provide women with spaces that allow their own modes of knowledge production and knowledge transfer.

⁴³⁶ Cf. Foucault 2013 b, page 1409.

⁴³⁷ Cf. Spivak 1988, page 295.

⁴³⁸ I've gained these insights from most of my qualitative interviews, especially my talks No. 2 (chapter 8.1.4), No. 3 (chapter 8.1.5) and No. 6 (chapter 8.1.8). While expert No. 2 highlighted the opposite, negative impact of an Afghan father to his daughter's right of self-development (see chapter 8.1.3).

⁴³⁹ Cf. Rostami-Povey 2007 b, page 59.

⁴⁴⁰ Cf. Ahmed-Gosh 2003, page 10.

7. LIST OF REFERENCES

- Abraham, Ibrahim / Busbridge, Rachel (2014): *Afghan-Australians: Diasporic Tensions, Homeland Transformations and the "2014 Syndrome"*, in: *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, Vol. 34, No. 3, pages 243 – 258.
- Ahmad, Lida / Anctil Avoine, Priscyll (2018): *Misogyny in 'post-war' Afghanistan: the changing frames of sexual and gender-based violence*, in: *Journal of Gender Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 1, pages 86 – 101.
- Ahmed-Gosh, Huma (2003): *A History of Women in Afghanistan: Lessons Learnt for the Future or Yesterdays and Tomorrow: Women in Afghanistan*, in: *Journal of International Women's Studies*, Vol. 4, No. 3, pages 1 – 14.
- Anderson, Benedict (1991): *Imagined Communities. Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, revised edition, London / New York: Verso.
- Appadurai, Arjun (1996): *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Barfield, Thomas (2010): *Afghanistan: A cultural and political history*, Princeton / Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- Bezhan, Faridullah (2008): *Women and War in the Works of Two Female Afghanistani Writers*, in: *Critique: Critical Middle Eastern Studies*, Vol. 17, No. 3, pages 309 – 325.
- Bhabha, Homi K. (1994): *The Location of Culture*, London / New York: Routledge.
- Bloch, Ernst (1985): *Neuzeitliche Philosophie II: Deutscher Idealismus, Die Philosophie des 19. Jahrhunderts*, (= Römer, Ruth / Schmidt, Burghart (eds.): *Leipziger Vorlesungen zur Geschichte der Philosophie: 1950 – 1956*/Ernst Bloch, Vol. 4), Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Brah, Avtar (2005): *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*, London: Routledge.
- Bujis, W. (1993): *Migrant Women: Crossing Boundaries and Changing Identities*, Oxford: RI Berg.
- Butler, Judith (1997): *Excitable Speech. A Politics of the Performative*, London / New York: Routledge.
- Butler, Judith (2012): *Can one lead a good life in a bad life? Adorno Prize Lecture*, in: *Radical Philosophy*, Vol. 176, pages 9 – 18.
- Centlivres-Demont, Micheline (1994): *Afghan Women in Peace, War, and Exile*, in: Weiner, Myron / Banuazizi, Ali (eds.): *The Politics of Social Transformation in Afghanistan, Iran, and Pakistan*, Syracuse / New York: Syracuse University Press, pages 333 – 365.
- Charusheela, S. (2010): *Gender and the stability of consumption: a feminist contribution to post-Keynesian economics*, in: *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, Vol. 34, pages 1145 – 1156.

- Ching, Leo T.S. (2001): *Becoming "Japanese". Colonial Taiwan and the Politics of Identity Formation*, Berkeley / Los Angeles / London: University of California Press.
- Clifford, James (1994): *Diasporas*, in: *Cultural Anthropology*, Vol. 9, No. 3, 'Further Inflections: Towards Ethnographies of the Future', pages 302 – 338.
- Cohen, Robin (2008): *Global Diasporas. An introduction*, London / New York: Routledge.
- Coll, Steve (2018): *Directorate S. The C.I.A and America's Secret Wars in Afghanistan and Pakistan, 2001 – 2016*, St. Ives: Allen Lane.
- Creamer, Elizabeth G. (2018): *Enlarging the Conceptualization of Mixed Method Approaches to Grounded Theory With Intervention Research*, in: *American Behavioral Scientist*, Vol. 62, No. 7, pages 919 – 934.
- Das, Rumpa (2011): *Stillness of star-less nights: Afghan Women's Poetry of Exile*, in: *Rupkatha – Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in the Humanities*, Vol. 3, No. 2, pages 243 – 250.
- Derrida, Jacques (1974): *Grammatologie*, translated by Hans-Jörg Rheinberger and Hanns Zischler, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Derrida, Jacques (2003): *Différance*, in: Culler, Jonathan (ed.): *Deconstruction. Critical Concepts in Literary and Cultural Studies*, Vol. 1, London / New York: Routledge, pages 141 – 166.
- Du Bois, W. E. B. (2015): *The Souls of Black Folk*, Tustin/California: Xist Publishing.
- Emadi, Hafizullah (2002): *Repression, resistance, and women in Afghanistan*, Westport: Praeger Publishers.
- Eriksson Baaz, Maria (2005): *The Paternalism of Partnership. A Postcolonial Reading of Identity in Development Aid*, London/New York: Zed Books.
- Feldbrugge, F. J. M. (1977): *Criminal Law and Traditional Society: The Role of Soviet Law in the Integration of Non-Slavic Peoples*, in: *Review of Socialist Law*, Vol. 3, pages 3 – 51.
- Finke, Peter (2006): *Competing Ideologies of Statehood and Governance in Central Asia: Turkic Dynasties in Transoxania and their Legacy in Contemporary Politics*, in: Sneath, David (ed.): *States of Mind: Power, Place and the Subject in Inner Asia*, series: *Studies on East Asia*, Vol. 27, Cambridge: University Press, pages 109 - 128.
- Fluri, Jennifer L. (2008): *Feminist nation-building in Afghanistan: An examination of the Revolutionary Association of the Women of Afghanistan (RAWA)*, in: *Feminist Review*, Vol. 89, pages 34 -54.
- Fontana, Benedetto (1993): *Hegemony & Power. On the Relation between Gramsci and Machiavelli*, Minnesota: University Press.

- Foucault, Michel (1974): *Die Ordnung der Dinge. Eine Archäologie der Humanwissenschaften*, translated by Ulrich Köppen, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Foucault, Michel (1988): *Technologies of the Self*, in: Luther, Martin H. / Gutman, Huck / Hutton, Patrick H. (eds.): *Technologies of the Self. A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, London: Tavistock, pages 16 – 49.
- Foucault, Michel (2013 a): *Die Ordnung der Dinge*, translated by Ulrich Köppen, in: Foucault, Michel (ed.): *Die Hauptwerke*, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, pages 7 - 470.
- Foucault, Michel (2013 b): *Die Sorge um sich*, (= The History of Sexuality, Volume 3), translated by Ulrich Raulff and Walter Seitter, in: Foucault, Michel (ed.): *Die Hauptwerke*, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, pages 1371 – 1582.
- Fromherz, Allen James (2010): *Ibn Khaldun: life and times*, Edinburgh: University Press.
- Gramsci, Antonio (1992): *Gefängnishefte, booklets 4 – 5*, series: Bochmann, Klaus/ Haug, Wolfgang Fritz (eds.): *Kritische Gesamtausgabe auf Grundlage der von Valentino Gerratana im Auftrag des Gramsci-Instituts besorgten Edition*, Vol. 3, Hamburg: Argument.
- Green, Nile (2008): *Tribe, Diaspora, and Sainthood in Afghan History*, in: *The Journal of Asian Studies*, Vol. 67, No. 1, pages 171 – 211.
- Groen, Simon P.N. / Richters, Annemiek / Laban, Cornelis J. / Devillé, Walter L.J.M. (2018): *Cultural Identity Among Afghan and Iraqi Traumatized Refugees: Towards a Conceptual Framework for Mental Health Care Professionals*, in: *Cult Med Psychiatry*, Vol. 42, pages 69 – 91.
- Grosfoguel, Ramon (2011): *Decolonizing Post-Colonial Studies and Paradigms of Political-Economy: Transmodernity, Decolonial Thinking, and Global Coloniality*, in: *Transmodernity: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World*, pages 1 – 37.
- Grossberg, Lawrence (1996): *Identity and Cultural Studies: Is That All There Is?*, in: Hall, Stuart / Du Gay, Paul (eds.): *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London: Sage, pages 87 – 107.
- Guetterman, Timothy C. / Babchuk, Wane A. / Howell Smith, Michelle C. / Stevens, Jared (2017): *Contemporary Approaches to Mixed Methods–Grounded Theory Research: A Field Based Analysis*, in: *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, Vol. 00, No. 0, pages 1 – 17.
- Hajek, Katharina / Kinzel, Katherina (2011): *Hegemonie, Geschlecht und Weltordnung. Feministische und neogramscianische Ansätze in der IPÖ*, in: Opratko, Benjamin / Prausmüller, Oliver (eds.): *Gramsci global. Neogramscianische Perspektiven in der Internationalen Politischen Ökonomie*, Hamburg: Argument, pages 125 – 144.
- Hall, Stuart (1996): *Who Needs 'Identity'?*, in: Hall, Stuart / Du Gay, Paul (eds.): *Questions of Cultural Identity*, London: Sage, pages 1 – 17.

- Haraway, Donna (1988): *Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective*, in: *Feminist Studies*, Vol. 14, No. 3, pages 575 – 599.
- Harzig, C. (2003): *Immigration policies: a gendered historical comparison*, in: Morokvasic-Muller, M./Erel, U./Shinozaki, K. (eds.): *Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries: Gender on the Move*, Leske: Opladen, pages 35 - 58.
- Hatch Dupree, Nancy (2002): *Cultural heritage and national identity in Afghanistan*, in: *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 23, No. 5, pages 977 – 989.
- Heath, Jennifer / Zahedi, Ashraf (2011, eds.): *Land of the Unconquerable. The Lives of Contemporary Afghan Women*, Berkeley / Los Angeles / London: University of California Press.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich (1973): *Phänomenologie des Geistes*, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Heider, Placidus Bernhard (2003): *Kurze Besinnung zur politischen Anthropologie: Vorüberlegungen zu einem verwaisten Schwerpunkt*, in: *Salzburger Jahrbuch für Philosophie*, No. 48, pages 41 – 49.
- Heider, Placidus Bernhard (2005): *Das politische Individuum: Ein Versuch über die soziale Identität des Menschen*, in: *Salzburger Jahrbuch für Philosophie*, No. 50, pages 75 – 85.
- Heider, Placidus Bernhard (2014): *Auf der Suche nach der unendlichen Zeit – von Hannah Arendt zu Augustinus*, in: Herb, Karlfriedrich (ed.): *Raum und Zeit. Denkformen des Politischen bei Hannah Arendt*, Frankfurt am Main: Campus, pages 165 – 174.
- Hoodfar, Homa (2004): *Families on the Move: The Changing Role of Afghan Refugee Women in Iran*, in: *Hawwa*, Vol. 2, No. 2, pages 141 – 171.
- Hoodfar, Homa (2009): *Afghan Refugee Women in Iran: Revisioning the Family*, in: Cuno, Kenneth M. / Desai, Manisha (eds.): *Family, gender, and law in a globalizing Middle East and South Asia*, (= *Gender and Globalization*, 1st edition), New York: Syracuse University Press, pages 223 – 250.
- Hoodfar, Homa (2010): *Refusing the Margins: Afghan Refugee Youth in Iran*, in: Chatty, Dawn (ed.): *Deterritorialized Youth: Sahwari and Afghan Refugees at the margins of the Middle East*, New York/Oxford: Berghahn Books, pages 145 - 182.
- Huntington, Samuel P. (2003): *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*, New York/London/Toronto/Sydney: Simon & Schuster Paperbacks.
- Joyce, Patrick (2003): *The Rule of Freedom. Liberalism and the Modern City*, London / New York: Verso.

- Kamal, Sarah (2010): *Afghan Refugee Youth in Iran and the Morality of Repatriation*, in: Chatty, Dawn (ed.): *Deterritorialized Youth: Sahwari and Afghan Refugees at the margins of the Middle East*, New York/Oxford: Berghahn Books, pages 183 - 212.
- Khaldun, Ibn (2005): *The Muqaddimah. An Introduction to History*, translated and introduced by Franz Rosenthal, edited by N.J. Dawood, Princeton / Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- Khan, Mahmud Hasan / Hare, Adrian E. (2004): *Construction of an Afghan National Identity: The Discourses of Time and Newsweek*, in: *Intellectual Discourse*, Vol. 12, No. 1, pages 45 – 62.
- Khan, Shahnaz (2014): *The two faces of Afghan women: Oppressed and exotic*, in *Women's Studies International Forum*, Vol. 44, pages 101 – 109.
- Lawrence, Bruce B. (2005): *Introduction to the 2005 edition*, in: Khaldun, Ibn: *The Muqaddimah. An Introduction to History*, translated and introduced by Franz Rosenthal edited by N.J. Dawood, Princeton / Oxford: Princeton University Press, pages vii – xxv.
- Lederman, Arline (2002): *The Zan of Afghanistan. A 35-year Perspective on Women in Afghanistan*, in: Mehta, Sunita (ed.): *Women for Afghan Women. Shattering Myths and Claiming the Future*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, pages 46 – 58.
- Mashal, Mujib (2017): *Nancy Hatch Dupree, a Scholar of Afghanistan for Decades, Dies at 89*, in: *The New York Times*, New York edition, September 11th 2017, page B6.
- McNay, Lois (1999): *Subject, Psyche, and Agency. The Work of Judith Butler*, in: *Theory, Culture, and Society*, Vol. 16, No. 2, pages 175 – 193.
- McRobbie, Angela (2005): *The Uses of Cultural Studies. A Textbook*, London: Sage Publications.
- Meer, Nasar (2018): *W. E. B. Du Bois, double consciousness and the 'spirit' of recognition*, in: *The Sociological Review*, pages 1 – 16.
- Mehta, Sunita (2002): *Editor's Preface*, in: Mehta, Sunita (ed.): *Women for Afghan Women. Shattering Myths and Claiming the Future*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, pages X - XIII.
- Mignolo, Walter D. (2005): *Prophets Facing Sidewise: The Geopolitics of Knowledge and the Colonial Difference*, in: *Social Epistemology*, Vol. 19, No. 1, pages 111 – 1127.
- Misdaq, Nabi (2006): *Afghanistan. Political frailty and external interference*, London / New York: Routledge.
- Moghadam, Valentine M. (2002): *Patriarchy, the Taleban, and Politics of Public Space in Afghanistan*, in: *Women's Studies International*, Vol. 25, No. 1, pages 19 – 31.

- Monsutti, Alessandro (2010): *Food and Identity among young Afghans in Iran*, in: Chatty, Dawn (ed.): *Deterritorialized Youth: Sahwari and Afghan Refugees at the margins of the Middle East*, New York/Oxford: Berghahn Books, pages 213 - 248.
- Nawa, Fariba (2002): *Two identities, one mission*, in: Mehta, Sunita (ed.): *Women for Afghan Women. Shattering Myths and Claiming the Future*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, pages 184 – 192.
- Nimmervoll, Lisa (2018 a): *“Wir sind alle moralische Selbstbefriediger“*, Interview in the newspaper Der Standard, April 21st/22nd 2018, Vienna, page 8.
- Nimmervoll, Lisa (2018 b): *„Das Kopftuch ist ein Unterdrückungsmechanismus“*, Interview in the newspaper Der Standard, August 7th 2018, page 6.
- Olszewska, Zuzanna (2007): *“A Desolate Voice”: Poetry and Identity among Young Afghan Refugees in Iran*, in: *Iranian Studies*, Vol. 40, No. 2, Afghan Refugees, pages 203 – 224.
- Rae, Heather (2002): *State Identities and the Homogenisation of Peoples* (= Cambridge Studies in International Relations, No. 84), Cambridge: University Press.
- Raqib, Mariam / Barreto, Amilcar Antonio (2014): *The Taliban, religious revival and innovation in Afghan nationalism*, in: *National Identities*, Vol. 16, No. 1, pages 15 – 30.
- Rasuly-Paleczek, Gabriele (1998): *Ethnic Identity versus Nationalism: The Uzbeks of Northeastern Afghanistan and the Afghan State*, in: Atabaki, Touraj / O’Kane, John (eds.): *Post-Soviet Central Asia*, London: I.B. Tauris & Co Ltd, pages 204 – 230.
- Reichert, Ramón (2008): *Das narrative Selbst. Erzählökonomie im Web 2.0*, in: Gächter, Yvonne / Ortner, Heike / Schwarz, Claudia / Wiesinger, Andreas (eds.): *Storytelling - Reflections in the Age of Digitalization*, Innsbruck: University Press, pages 202 - 228.
- Rostami-Povey, Elaheh (2007 a): *Gender, agency and identity, the case of Afghan women in Afghanistan, Pakistan and Iran*, in: *The Journal of Development Studies*, Vol. 43, No. 2, pages 294 – 311.
- Rostami-Povey, Elaheh (2007 b): *Afghan Women: Identity and Invasion*, London: Zed Books.
- Roy, Olivier (1994): *The New Political Elite of Afghanistan*, in: Weiner, Myron / Banuazizi, Ali (eds.): *The Politics of Social Transformation in Afghanistan, Iran, and Pakistan*, Syracuse / New York: Syracuse University Press, pages 72 – 100.
- Rubin, Barnett R. (1994): *Redistribution and the State in Afghanistan. The Red Revolution turns Green*, in: Weiner, Myron / Banuazizi, Ali (eds.): *The Politics of Social Transformation in Afghanistan, Iran, and Pakistan*, Syracuse / New York: Syracuse University Press, pages 187 – 227.

- Safran, William (2005): *The Jewish Diaspora in a comparative and theoretical perspective*, in: Israel Studies, Vol. 10, No. 1, pages 36 – 60.
- Saikal, Amin (2010): *Afghanistan and Pakistan: The Question of Pashtun Nationalism?*, in: Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs, Vol. 30, No. 1, pages 5 – 17.
- Schetter, Conrad (2010): *Kleine Geschichte Afghanistans*, third, improved edition, Munich: Beck.
- Schmidt, Siegfried J. (2008): *Telling Stories about Story Telling*, in: Gächter, Yvonne / Ortner, Heike / Schwarz, Claudia / Wiesinger, Andreas (eds.): *Storytelling - Reflections in the Age of Digitalization*, Innsbruck: University Press, pages 17 - 28.
- Schrott, Thomas (2018): *Fact finding mission report Afghanistan*, Vienna: Bundesamt für Fremdenwesen und Asyl (BFA).
- Schütte, Stefan (2009): *Informal (In)security in Urban Afghanistan*, in: Iranian Studies, Vol. 42, No. 3, pages 465-491.
- Schütte, Stefan (2014): *Living with patriarchy and poverty: women's agency and the spatialities of gender relations in Afghanistan*, in: Gender, Place & Culture, Vol. 21, No. 9, pages 1176-1192.
- Schwadel, Philip (2015): *Explaining Cross-National Variation in the Effect of Higher Education on Religiosity*, in: Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, Vol. 54, No. 2, pages 402 – 418.
- Schwadel, Philip (2017): *The Positives and Negatives of Higher Education: How the Religious Context in Adolescence Moderates the Effects of Education on Changes in Religiosity*, in: Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, Vol. 56, No. 4, pages 869 – 885.
- Shirin Gul, Sadozai / Hina Anwar, Ali (2015): *Can the Afghan Diaspora Speak? Diasporic Identity in the Shadow of Human Rights*, in: Croisy, Sophie (ed.): *Globalization and 'Minority' Cultures. The Role of 'Minor' Cultural Groups in Shaping Our Global Future*, Leiden/Boston: Brill Nijhoff, pages 109 – 121.
- Simonsen, Sven Gunnar (2004): *Ethnicising Afghanistan?: inclusion and exclusion in post-Bonn institution building*, Third World Quarterly, Vol. 25, No. 4, pages 707 – 729.
- Simonsen, Sven Gunnar (2009): *Leaving Security in Safe Hands: identity, legitimacy and cohesion in the new Afghan and Iraqi armies*, in: Third World Quarterly, Vol. 30, No. 8, pages 1483 – 1501.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty (1988): *Can the Subaltern Speak?*, in: Nelson, Cary / Grossberg, Lawrence (eds.): *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*. London: Macmillan Education.

- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty (2003 a): *Feminism and deconstruction, again: negotiating with unacknowledged masculinism*, in: Culler, Jonathan (ed.): *Deconstruction. Critical Concepts in Literary and Cultural Studies*, Vol. 2, London / New York: Routledge, pages 353 – 370.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty (2003 b): *Subaltern Studies: deconstructing historiography*, in: Culler, Jonathan (ed.): *Deconstruction. Critical Concepts in Literary and Cultural Studies*, Vol. 4, London / New York: Routledge, pages 220 – 244.
- Stahlmann, Friederike (2018): *Gutachten Afghanistan*, Geschäftszeichen: 7 K 1757/16.WI.A, Berlin / Wiesbaden.
- Stokes, Sonya / Seritan, Andreea L. / Miller, Elizabeth (2016): *Care Seeking Patterns Among Women Who Have Experienced Gender-Based Violence in Afghanistan*, in: *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 22, No. 7, pages 817 – 831.
- Tang, Alisa (2011): *Selling Sex in Afghanistan: Portraits of Sex Workers in Kabul*, in: Heath, Jennifer / Zahedi, Ashraf (eds.): *Land of the Unconquerable. The Lives of Contemporary Afghan Women*, Berkeley / Los Angeles / London: University of California Press, pages 154 – 161.
- Taylor, Charles (1994): *Quellen des Selbst. Die Entstehung der neuzeitlichen Identität*, translated by Joachim Schulte, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Teddlie, Charles / Tashakkori, Abbas (2009): *Foundations of Mixed Methods Research. Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches in the Social and Behavioral Sciences*, Los Angeles / London / New Delhi / Singapore / Washington DC: Sage Publications.
- Thiel, Susanne (2012): *KulturSchock Pakistan*, third, entirely newly composed edition, Bielefeld: Peter Rump.
- Trani, Jean-Francois / Bakhshi, Parul / Rolland, Cécile (2011): *Capabilities, Perception of Well-being and Development Effort: Some Evidence from Afghanistan*, in: *Oxford Development Studies*, Vol. 39, No. 4, pages 403 - 426.
- Turcan, Metin (2009): *Between heaven and earth: Field observations relating to counterinsurgency in tribalized rural Muslim environments*, in: *Dynamics of Asymmetric Conflict*, Vol. 2, No. 2, pages 86 – 111.
- Turner-Zwinkels, Felicity M. / Postmes, Tom / van Zomeren, Martijn (2015): *Achieving Harmony among Different Social Identities within the Self-Concept: The Consequences of Internalising a Group-Based Philosophy of Life*, in: *PLoS ONE*, Vol. 10, No. 11, pages 1 – 31.
- UNAMA Human Rights Service (2018): *Midyear Update on the Protection of Civilians in Armed Conflict: 1 January to 30 June 2018*, online available:

https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama_poc_midyear_update_2018_15_july_english.pdf (September 25th 2018).

UNAMA Human Rights Service (2018): *Quarterly Report on the Protection of Civilians in Armed Conflict: 1 January to 30 September 2018*, online available: https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama_protection_of_civilians_in_armed_conflict_3rd_quarter_report_2018_10_oct.pdf (January 3rd 2019).

8. APPENDIX

8.1. Transcriptions of the interviews

With the following sub-chapters, the transliterations of all semi-structured interviews are presented in chronological order. The first sub-chapter delivers a protocol of the insights to the Afghan refugee camp in the outskirts of Lahore / Pakistan where my respect towards the Afghan culture prohibited detailed interviews with Afghan women. In all following transcripts, I've denoted myself with R for researcher. All my counterparts are denoted with the first letter of their Christian names.

8.1.1. Qualitative inquiry No. 1, impressions from the refugee camp in Lahore / Pakistan

September 3rd 2018 – Trip to Afghan informal camps in the outskirts of Lahore, facilitated by FACES Pakistan

After a 45 minutes ride with the car, the well-made streets of Lahore are left. From that right turn onwards, the car will wobble through a provisional sandy road full of punches. Distrusting glances are casted from the road's margins. Men and children, many, many children. Women are not visible. We are going through the outskirts of Lahore in which roughly 10.000 Afghan refugees live informally.

It is a trip on an invitation of FACES Pakistan, a non-governmental organization with its focus on the integration of marginalized groups into the society. FACES Pakistan focusses on Afghan refugees as well as on the considerably huge community of transgender persons in Pakistan.

The first appointment is at a women's area. Men from outside the family are usually not allowed to enter these areas. That's why FACES Pakistan has provided a female expert as well as a female translator. The provisional entrance is made of an awning that is provisionally fixed on a wooden fence. Many animals are the first striking feature of the women's area: goats, hens, a donkey. It smells from excrement. Myriads of flies buzz around.

The women keep themselves in the background, approaching only reluctantly. Although, our visit has been announced a few days ago, they obviously distrust their visitors. The children are braver. They come close and stare at the foreigners out of huge, dark eyes silently.

After a careful "A Salam a-Leikum" we are with a hand sign guided into the community tent. It is open to the inner side of the round, fenced area. It has got a ventilator which currently doesn't work due to one of the regular black outs, and heavy, colorful carpets on the ground. It has 38 ° C. The FACES Pakistan expert, the translator, and I, the researcher, get the

thickest mat to sit down on the flour. The women gather. Still reluctantly but obviously curiously either. So do the children. They are approximately 25, female and male children as well – as they are coming and going, their exact number is hard to guess. Many suffer from heavy rashes, at a few I believe to recognize measles. All of them belong to the present women.

The present women are: 3 elderly women, 4 women in marriageable age, 3 youth women. A young man with his right leg strongly shortened joins the group. He is obviously a close relative of one of the women as otherwise he wouldn't be allowed to enter the women's area.

Of the 4 women in marriageable age, 3 are viewably pregnant, the forth breast-feeds her son. One of the pregnant women sews a veil for her mother-in-law on an old and decorated sewing-machine. She is the first who finds words: "Who is she?", she asks in Pashto towards the translator who is well-known to her as the teacher of her children. She means me. The translator gives an explanation in Pashto. I give a hard try to smile at all of them openly although I'm busy with fighting the fear of being infected with malaria or measles or similar horrible diseases.

"You want information? – You can pay us money, then we will give you information", the sewing woman suggests in Pashto, grinning at me. The FACES Pakistan expert and I start a discussion in English which is understandable to no one else in the room, not yet the translator who is illiterate and has, nevertheless, managed to learn to speak Urdu fluently.

We decide to refuse and chat and wait. We will wait for very long 40 minutes. During this time, some women will catch three huge self-made fans which they will give to us. I will start to blow fresh air to the breast-feeding mother to my left. The ice slowly melts down.

One of the 3 elderly women wonders why we came here: "We are poor", she says. "Why do you want to spend time with us in our poor, dirty rooms voluntarily?" – We start chatting.

Finally, we filled out four questionnaires in a term of two and a half hours. As the translator had to go for other duties in the meantime, the disabled young man had offered himself as translator. None of the women speaks Urdu, the language of the host country. And not one of them is literate. As women are neither allowed to be recorded for an interview without the permission of their husbands nor allowed to appear on pictures, we renounced both opportunities and headed for a meeting with representatives of the male community.

Group discussion - 5 male representatives of the Afghan community, precisely those who are not regularly employed because most of the others are at work, interference by their mates, September 3rd 2018, 1:00 p.m., standing in the streets of the outskirts of Lahore

R: So, the record is on, everything works. What I would like to know from you today is: As I've observed that the role of women is very important in your society, so women have an important task in your society, so why is it important? For which tasks do you need your women?

[A female development assistant of FACES Pakistan translates into Urdu. Answer in Urdu.]

[The FACES fellow makes request in Urdu.]

[A discussion in Urdu comes up.]

[A second out of the 5 men interferes.]

[The FACES fellow requests consideration.]

[Traffic noise in the background, a donkey vehicle goes along.]

FACES fellow: The first men said, our women take care of our children. And they take care of our house, and they will prepare our meals for us, and as they are making everything in the household, they play a very important role in our lives.

R: Great, great, great, and are there certain expectations, women will have to meet in daily life?

[The FACES fellow asks in Urdu.]

[A discussion between the 5 men occurs, in Urdu language.]

FACES fellow: The second men said, we expect that they should be more punctual to the work for the family. And they should become more obedient for them.

[A third man out of the 5 interrupts and talks excitedly to the FACES fellow in Urdu.]

FACES fellow: He said, if I imagine something in my mind for my life, she should understand and obey my feelings. She should also obey my every order. Otherwise she is not perfect.

R: She is there for serving.

FACES fellow: Yeah.

[A fourth man interrupts.]

FACES fellow: He just stated, I've got the same desire.

R: What do you want your children to be in future?

[The FACES fellow translates into Urdu.]

[Different men answer.]

FACES fellow: He said I want my children to become doctors or engineers or any educationist. That they become more powerful persons after they got some education. Education is important. So, I want to do something for my children in terms of education.

[Donkey crying thus loudly that only parts of the above answer have been understandable.]

R: Do you want to improve the access to education also for the girls or only for the boys?

[The FACES fellow translates.]

FACES fellow: He said as well for the girls!

R: Oh, very nice! Can we just take the picture?

[The five men are asked in Urdu if they want to take a picture. All of them agree.]

8.1.2. Expert interview No. 1 with a representative of FACES Pakistan

Expert interview – FACES fellow, September 3rd 2018, 5:30 p.m., Lahore, car in the traffic jam

R: Dear T, which are the basic living conditions of Afghans in Lahore?

T: The living conditions of Afghans are very pathetic because they lack every infrastructure. They have no facility of health, no facility of pure drinking water. They use to have one place in rent and this one place they divide between more than 5 families. And there these more than 5 families are living without having separate kitchens and washrooms. This means, they use a community place for washing and a community place for cooking. So, their living conditions are very, very poor.

Additionally, they have no educational facilities for their children and their children are usually forced to earn money. They are mostly involved in garbage picking and earn small money in this trade.

R: How can they earn money with garbage picking?

T: They go to the specified pockets whereto the departments bring the garbage and they find some garbage pieces for them which they sell and get the money. And, especially, they find the hairs of females and collect them in cages. When they have one or two full of hairs, they go and sell it. They get 200 to 300 Rupees per cage. But, I still don't know for which purposes these hairs are then used.

R: Which is the role of women in the Afghan community?

T: Mostly, they are not allowed to go anywhere without the permission of their male members and they are strictly restricted to their homes and they spend their whole life in one place. They take care of their children, they cook and prepare the meal for the entire family and they engage themselves in stitching and in equipping brides.

R: Regarding the madrassas, do the madrassas have an impact on the Afghan communities of Lahore?

T: Yes, there are so many madrassas in Lahore. But, these Afghan communities, they don't reach these madrassas [living in the outskirts of the city, the members of the Afghan communities have no facilities to get to the madrassas regularly; annotation]. Some of them go to the madrassas and they get the Islamic education from there. But mostly, they don't go there, they simply engage themselves in daily earning.

R: This means, the impact of the many madrassas on Afghan refugees is small in comparison to the host society?

T: Yes, it is small.

R: Are there women of the Afghan communities who attend the female madrassas?

T: No, mostly they are completely restricted to their homes. They are not allowed to go to any madrassas or to schools.

R: Finally – we are almost finished – how many Afghans are roughly living in the outskirts of Lahore?

T: I think, their number is very huge. Except of that forepocket that we visited, there are a few more in the outskirts and I think their total number is more than 10,000. They are in the phase of taking the asylum in Pakistan.

R: In Lahore especially and in the entire province of Punjab? I'm not sure if I remember this correctly from our lunch, but I think our host said 120,000 persons – he meant entire Punjab, am I right?

T: Yes, he meant entire Punjab.

R: Final question: At what time has this community started establishing itself?

T: I don't know! Because they mostly rely on the Pakistani community and they demand from the government that they provide infrastructure to them, the education facilities, the health facilities. So, mostly they earn their money for their basic needs.

R: Yeah, but when have they started to appear in Pakistan?

T: I have no clear idea but the main purpose of our government is to try to force these Afghani communities to provide their own things.

R: But, when did the first Afghan refugees arrive in Pakistan?

T: Before more than 40 years. In the early 60s.

R: Ah, already in the 60s? – This time, Afghanistan was ruled by a communist party, the Peoples Democratic Party of Afghanistan. And back then they already wanted to escape their homes...

T: Yes, and up to now they don't want to go back to their homes. They claim, they are more happy in Pakistan, although they have no facilities. They feel that they are more happy here

than in their homeland! They don't yet have an identity card! But, nevertheless, they want to stay here.

R: Yes, I think, this is a sign for the huge threats they face in case of their return to Afghanistan.

T: Yes, it is.

R: Dear T, thanks a lot!

T: Thank you so much!

8.1.3. Expert interview No. 2 with a professor of the Department of Political Science and International Relations, Faculty of Social Sciences, International Islamic University, Islamabad / Pakistan

Expert interview - female professor, September 5th 2018, International Islamic University Islamabad, Female Campus, Maryam Block, Room 225

R: I'm talking to professor Dr. [Christian name] [Surname]. Have I pronounced it correctly?

Dr. A: Yes!

R: Wonderful. We are talking about one Afghan refugee she has encountered at her university [the International Islamic University Islamabad; annotation] and her general experience with the situation of Afghan women, especially within their families.

Dr. A: My student, [she mentions the full name which is left out here; annotation], she was a student of Master in Political Science and IR [International Relations; annotation] in the 2007 and 2008 sessions. And, she was a wonderful student, she stood first in my course and she wanted to stay here, she wanted to work further. She wanted to continue her higher studies in M.Phil but she was not allowed to work. And then, she requested me to guide her to write a paper, a research paper. I said: 'Alright, you're most welcome!' I made a sketch and I facilitated her to write an abstract, and then corrected it, and she started working.

But, after a few months she told me that her father is not allowing her to stay here, and that she will go back to Afghanistan. I said: 'Okay, you are going back and you can work and you can be in touch with me on the telephone or internet and you can e-mail me your work, I will check and get it back to you.' Then she said: 'No, when I will be back in Afghanistan, I will be having no access to telephone, I will have no access to internet.' I said: 'Okay, then you can join some of the jobs, a teaching job, and you can facilitate Afghani women. You should work for the development of your society because you are now educated and those women are having duty towards those fellow women of your country. So, you should work.' She said: 'No, I would not be allowed to have a job. I will be compelled to marry some of my illiterate cousins or otherwise if I would resist, my father would kill me.'

So, it was so ridiculous and painful for me to even think of but she was having the same faith. Similarly, I've seen lot of Afghani women. If you go with me to the market nearby, that is market of D-10 and D-9 [all districts of Islamabad are encoded to a scheme of capital letters and numbers; annotation] you see lot of Afghani women, they are begging there, they are having no job and no food and on Thursdays and Fridays some of the Pakistani shop keepers arrange food for charity, then those women are standing in long queues and they are waiting for food and they are begging. And, I have learned from many people that those women who escape from the camps [Dr. A here refers to the governmentally established refugee camps which are subject to heated discussions of advocates and opponents regularly; annotation] and they found some residences in colonies and settlement in Pakistani cities, their husbands force them to prostitution because they need money for their food and their livelihood.

So, women are facing lots of problems, they were abused. I've heard the stories from people who have migrated to Pakistan that women were abused and they were thrown from helicopters after being raped by the Russian people when they were having occupation in Afghanistan. So, they escaped to Pakistan. But, when they came to Pakistan, they were forced to prostitution by their own families for their survival and they tried to settle in Pakistani society that's why they escaped from their camps. But, it's a major mistake! They should live there because the NGOs, the UN and Pakistani authorities are having access to them and they provide them food and shelter and education there. They establish schools, But, when they come out of those settlements, they are more vulnerable because they don't have any skill, they don't have any job, and then they want to survive as independent and so their families force them to prostitution. Because there is no way out for them. So, plight of women is miserable!

And, secondly, the generation I have seen, the young girls: They are having another challenge. A boy at D-10 market, he told me that he was born in Pakistan, in Islamabad. And, so he is not knowing Persian, he is not knowing Pashto. When their parents are going back, these young people cannot go back because there is a communication gap. The boy told me, he would want to stay in Islamabad but his family is not allowing that and he is working in a shop and that shop keeper said: 'Okay, continue your job, I will arrange your education' but he could not arrange this education because he could not get time out of that salesmanship to study. Then I introduced him to one of the NGOs working in Islamabad to improve the plight of women and children. They arranged some sort of tuition facility for that boy. So, lots of women and boys, both, both are suffering because of this first USSR invasion in Afghanistan, they suffered out of that, and second due to war on terror in Afghanistan: People are the victims!

People and, especially, the women. Because women are having no skill, no exposure, they don't have any training of social contacts. So, when they came out first time from home, they are not having any experience. Therefore, whatever people said, they followed. They are the victims. And, their families also mistreated them because Afghans having quite closed and quite stick culture at their homes. So, when women came out and they faced challenges, the men felt dishonored. They don't allow them to do that. Consequently, in one case, they compel them for prostitution, the other extreme case was that when they started jobs, then their families felt dishonored: 'You are doing something which is not a dignified practice! And, you cannot be part of our family.' – They were divorced, they were thrown out.

We are having quite few Afghan students here and from the last year we treated Afghan students as the local, as equal with Pakistani students. We provided all those facilities here which are provided for Pakistani students. But, from the last year onwards when it was settled that all refugees would be sent back to their country because their country needed them for its rehabilitation. Manpower is required! – Then it was decided that now Afghan students came as foreigner students. But, those foreign students are even getting more facilities as they are treated as foreigners on priority. We give them hostel, we give them admission, even they are low in performance but we treat them as special guests because their country was war-torn so their performance cannot be up to that mark which our students have achieved already. So, we facilitate them. Right now, two Afghan students were passed out in this BS program. They have completed their semesters, they have got their degrees and they have gone back to Afghanistan.

R: Thank you very, very much, Ma'am, for that deep insight. It was great! I've just one additional question: It bothers me how the enforcement of prostitution on Afghan women fits with the honor concept. You know, the honor concept is such critical and essential for Afghan families, especially. And, women usually are the bearers of the honor of the entire family. But, when they are forced to prostitution, how can that be compatible?

Dr. A: Exactly, yes! That is, indeed, very ironical. I've seen that because Pakistani families have the same concept that the woman is the honor bearer of the family. And, males can do anything. But, females not can do anything and even they cannot think of it. But, you know that is – even in terms of social dilemma – it is not expected but it is very obvious: When you are starving and you're not having any money. And, that happened – there was a novel on the declining period of Lakhnau, Lakhnau, a state in India – that was the house of culture. They say that you come first, you come first and the self is left. That was the house of culture and literature before India and Pakistan got separated. But, when Lakhnau was declining in terms of economy. There was no job, no future of people, then they forced their women to do

prostitution secretly. So, that the family honor can be maintained. That is the irony of human civilization. That whenever a problem comes up, women will have to face it.

The same dilemma, we can understand: There was a movie on that also. That is called ‘Bazar’, ‘Baaazaaaar’.

R: I will have a look on it!

Dr. A: It was done by the superstars [Dr. A cites the names which are left out here due to low relevance]. It was a seminal movie, I’ve seen it many times. It was so painful, it was so painful! A lady of a very honorable family was forced by her mother to do prostitution to keep the family honor maintained. Right? – So, the same happens with the Afghan women. That keeping the family honor, women should do prostitution secretly. And, I have evidences that women were sent to the owner of the house in exchange of the monthly rent of that house. I have evidences! I have evidences!

And, women told me personally, some of the women they were crying on that. That our family forced us to pay that rent in the form of the time spending with that owner of the house. On monthly basis, on weekly basis... Sometimes on monthly basis, sometimes on weekly basis to pay the amount that was due as a rent.

R: Can you estimate – final question! – which percentage of the Afghan women living in Pakistan do face such an enforcement?

Dr. A: I cannot estimate because I don’t have access to lots of Afghani women. I’ve seen those women who are living in Islamabad, those women I met, a few women, just less than ten living in Peshawar. And, out of those 10 to 11 women, 3 told me the same. It means that if I can take that 11 women as my sample, then 33 percent of the women were forced to go into prostitution. 33 percent!

R: This is a horrible number!

Dr. A: It is a horrible number! And, you know, that were apparently settled women and when women are striving, striving for food, they can be forced more into prostitution. Because bread and butter is the matter of survival. And, even sometimes if they are not forced by their men or families, they are forced by themselves: If their children are hungry!

I know one Afghani woman living here [in Islamabad; annotation], she was a small girl. She could not speak. She was deaf and dumb. She was 11 years old. She was employed at one of my students’ home in Mardan. I visited my student, she was having a baby, so I visited her, because I have very close relations with my students, and she asked again and again: ‘You could not come to my marriage, so you could come and see my daughter.’ I went there with my daughter and my son, younger son. And she was working there. She told me that she was taken

from that Kachipasti, from this I-10 section, there is a settlement of Afghan refugees and she took her from there. And, she is the daughter of an Afghan woman having three daughters. Then her husband died. He went back to Afghanistan, there he died and there was no news about him and then she got married to another person, and he was also Afghan. Because she was not able to do anything. She was very poor and having no source of income, therefore, she got married. And, that person was threat for her daughters! – Yeah! – Yes, because he wanted to abuse those daughters. Yeah, you know, as stepfathers do in most of the cases, even in Europe. Stepfathers they are having different looks towards their daughters and stepdaughters. So, she sent that girl – she was now 11 and she was more vulnerable – to that lady and said: ‘Please, protect her and teach her and then grow her in your home.’ – And, she was protecting the girl. But, how many small girls could get that type of family? Because my student was educated, she is graduate from this university [International Islamic University Islamabad; annotation], she has done her M.Phil in Political Science.

So, she was quite concentrate and nice and everything and her in-laws were also cooperative to have a servant. Otherwise, you know, most of the families, they don’t provide a separate sale for the daughters-in-law. She got that opportunity to live with that lady who was teaching her, who was grooming her, who was giving her good food... But, not every Afghan woman is getting that opportunity. So, her two sisters were also without shelter. I tried to engage them but since I was having a language barrier, they were not knowing Urdu. So, I could not keep them at home because they were not listening me and I was not able to understand them.

So, ultimately, they refused, they cannot live at a home that is having that language barrier. But, I wondered how many Afghan women were having the same challenges. So bad, when they are not having any source of income for their family, for their children, for living without males. They start prostitution. There is no other way to survive!

And, since they are beautiful, they are presentable and they are forced to do that because they have no other source. You know. So, I have observed that all in our society – that is, you know, I would not say that that is a practice among Pakistani women but Pakistani women are also having this challenge because they are not having enough facilities to education, they are forced to work in the childhood. You know, you see the house servants, they are the same people, you know, they are forced. Young children, boys and girls, they want to go to school and study and play. They don’t want to work as servants at home. When they are doing that, it means they are compelled to do that by their families.

R: Thank you very much! That means the conclusion is: Fighting illiteracy and promoting education are the key elements to approach Afghan women.

Dr. A: Exactly.

R: Thank you very, very much!

8.1.4. Qualitative interview No. 2, students of the International Islamic University
Islamabad (IIU)

*Interview with two female students of the International Islamic University Islamabad with
Afghan citizenship, September 06th 2018, Female Campus, Fatima Block, Office for
International Relations, IIU.*

R: It's recording. Dear H, dear S, you came to Pakistan to study, do you miss your country?

Both: Of course, we miss a lot!!!

H: Of course, it is very hard for us as we have to stay for one year. Only in summer vacations we go back to Afghanistan. So, it is very hard, we miss our parents.

S: Every second we spend here, we will miss our parents.

R: It's somehow surprising for me as usually one assumes that Afghan women are such suppressed in their home societies and that this might mean that they are very, very happy to come out from their society and not be bound there. But, you don't feel suppressed?

[A third interviewee enters the office.]

R: Wa salam! We are just recording the first interview. When you have time to wait a few minutes, then we can record a second one.

Interviewee: Sure!

R: Thank you so much!

R: Dear H, dear S, when will you return to Afghanistan?

H: Inshallah, after our studies are completed. Mostly, we go in summer vacations. After one year we go for having the new visa and we will meet our parents also. We will stay for four years until we have completed our degrees, then we will return.

R: And you will return to stay regularly there?

Both: Yes.

R: And which are your plans for your lives in Afghanistan?

H: Our plans are very different compared to when we came here: We have changed our minds. We will try to get some scholarships in foreign countries. So, it will be very easy for us to achieve our aims, to make our own lives. So, the aim is now to work on our country from the

outside. To go back now, would mean to feel very disappointed. So it's better to try it abroad to get more experience, more knowledge, so that we could give something to our country.

R: Will you then marry in Afghanistan?

Both: Yes, of course!

H: It's the culture, so we can't escape. We cannot escape!

R: Your families decided that you will marry?

H: Yes, they will decide.

R: They will decide that you will get married. Alright.

Is there already any husband chosen by your family or will you have the right to choose him yourself.

S: We have the right to choose!

H: But, it is still very hard because the relatives they will start gossip.

S: Yes.

H: So, the family will be afraid that they gossip and that they will say: 'They have sent them out of country! And why don't they get married? Are they might useless girls?' – So, it is like this. They might be afraid that people will talk about this all. So, they are requesting us to get married with the best partner that they will select.

R: Alright, I have to accept that. For you personally, and regardless of any perception from the exterior world, but from your very, very personal and individual view and independent of your families: Which are the most valuable aspects of your life, maybe we can distinguish – first – of your life in Pakistan – and the most valuable aspects of your life in Afghanistan. So, you can distinguish: For my life in Pakistan, this is the most valuable. For my life in Afghanistan, that is the most valuable. It's maybe a different thing?

H: Yeah, it's very different.

S: Totally different!

H: We feel more relaxed in Pakistan.

S: But, I feel relaxed in my country!

H: But, we feel better in Pakistan. Because in Afghanistan, there is less support, less opportunities. So, we feel a bit ...

S: So, there is more opportunities for us in Pakistan.

H: In Pakistan, there is more opportunities for girls, so we feel more – what we call – butterfly over here.

S: Yes!

R: Yeah, I can understand that. In the case that you won't make it abroad but you will stay for the rest of your life in Afghanistan with your family, will you then be able to exercise a job outside the house or will you be restricted to the household?

H: It will be very hard. When we make it in any institute or any school, then it could work. But, in offices, most families and her partner will not allow a woman to stay in the office with other men. Because of this, it will be very hard for us to get the opportunities to follow the jobs we want.

S: But, I think, our family is not like this. Our family is not like this! – But, some families are like this.

H: Partners... it depends. Families not. Families always support us. – Partner means: After the marriage, it depends which kind of partner you have. The families not, they support us whatever we wish. They love us. When we are happy, they are following our happiness. But, the partner only, he might think about the public perception, and about his life, his safety. – After getting married, the life will be very changed. As long we are living with our fathers, it is alright.

R: And, currently, who is the most worthful person of your life?

H: Our father.

S: Yes, father.

R: The father, very interesting. Because he is so supportive for your educational career?

Both: Yes, he is.

R: Very impressive! Now that ethnicity question: Is your ethnicity an important aspect for you? Regardless if in Pakistan or in Afghanistan.

In general, in your life, does ethnicity determine you?

S: I can't understand.

H: I not get the question.

S: Yes.

R: Your ethnicity, in the one case Hazara [H], in the other case Tajik [S] is it important for you?

S: In Pakistan?

R: Regardless if there or there.

H: Yes, in here, we have not faced such problems but in Afghanistan it happens: Pashtun and Hazara are opposed.

S: Yeah, Pashtuns are very opposed against the Hazara.

H: And Hazara are afraid of Pashtuns. So, there are many problems with ethnicity.

S: But, in Pakistan there are no such issues.

H: No, in Pakistan not but in Afghanistan people face these issues. I've experienced this also. That's why I'm saying. But, for Tajik people it is very easy to live and they have their opportunities, their rights in Afghanistan. Hazara people, they still have not got the rights in Afghanistan from Pashtun people. We have faced really.

R: The next one is a huge question but it is almost the final one: What does freedom mean to you? When you define freedom for you personally?

H: Freedom means for myself, I have to be independent, I have to be on my own thoughts. I have to be whatever I'm doing. So, it must be from my own thoughts, my own perceptions. So... And, I have to follow my wishes to get my right. Either, the most important is: There must be no difference between male and female. I want to get the right which men have. Means, in Afghanistan and Pakistan they think, we are only women. I want to have the right that men have, right now! – This is the wish, we have not got yet. So, this is our wish. To get this freedom for ourselves.

R: To live in an equal society?

S: Yes, equal society!

H: Equal society! Equal rights! – And, that they don't think the females are weak. They can't do the things that men can do. So, if we compare, we might do more than males.

S: Yes, and we want the right to do it!

R: My final question refers to some clue, I got out of the first questionnaires which were, indeed, filled in Austria. Because many, many women wrote there: "I'm the honor of the family. I'm the bearer of the honor." – And, so I began bothering myself about the term of 'honor' and what it means. Maybe, you can help me there, because really: I've not understood it completely by now. – Do you perceive honor as positive or as a burden?

H: Honor?

R: Yeah, honor.

S: It's positive...

H: Yeah, it's positive for us.

R: Yes, but do you feel yourself as the bearer of the honor of the entire family? So, do you feel some responsibility for honor?

S: Yes, we feel.

R: Alright, that is what I expected, indeed. So, how is honor then maintained? Can you do actively something to maintain it?

H: Of course, now we are in Pakistan. So, we do, we maintain, we manage everything on ourselves.

S: There is not even our father...

H: So, of course, after getting married, we will handle everything outside and inside. So, they will give us the right or the opportunity. So, in here we are staying in the hostel, we are managing everything ourselves. The hostel means also accommodation problems. So, there is no one to help us, there is no father to say or to listen, and we don't want to give them an impression of the problems we are facing. We make problems, we solve it, and we are getting experience from all that problems we are getting over here.

R: Alright, that means acting self-reliantly as a woman, that means as a woman not being a burden for the family, for example, this is already related to the honor concept? So, it means honor that you can live self-reliantly?

H: Yes.

S: Yes.

R: Alright, this is very interesting. And are there other members of your family that are also responsible for the maintenance of honor? Or is it all burdened on your shoulders?

H: In our families, mostly the father is taking the burden. And my brothers, my brothers are helping a lot my father to manage all the problems of outside and inside. Mostly, the burdens are, at least in Afghanistan, maybe in Pakistan also, all burdens are on fathers and brothers. But, we are sisters. We are living as a princess. [Laughs.]

S: Actually, I don't have any sister. I'm the one and all my brothers are younger. So, I have responsibility for them. It's dependent on the family: How they react...

R: Alright, and which are the main aspects – final question – which are the main aspects of honor? It is having no sex before marriage, of course?! This is – I think – the most important honor aspect...

H: Yeah.

S: Yeah.

R: But, are there some other aspects either? Like, for example, going out on the streets only veiled? Or somewhat?

H: No, we can't. We have our veils, we have our scarfs.

S: It's our culture.

H: Yeah, it's our culture. So, in Pakistan they can make it in their own wish. So, whether they wear the scarf or not. But, in Afghanistan it is compulsory. You have to have a small scarf on your head.

S: Because we are Muslims.

H: So, that is why it is the matter.

R: And this is not related to honor? This is a different thing?

H: Yeah, it's a very different thing. So, it's compulsory, you have to ...

S: Actually, this depends on honor also.

H: No, it doesn't.

It's very hard to live without scarf in Afghanistan. In the streets and in the universities we must have a scarf. But, in parties or any concerts, we have so many girls who don't wear the scarf. But, in the streets, outside, it is very compulsory. Very compulsory to wear! To have your Hijab, to cover your head.

R: It's really interesting. I need an additional question that comes to my mind currently: I didn't ask you what you are studying and I think, that is important. So, we can record it here or we can write it here. – We can write it here! “Bachelor of...” – Alright, let's make it like that and thank you very, very, very much. – Wow, it was great time for me! Really. Thank you so much!

S: Thank YOU!

8.1.5. Qualitative interview No. 3, student of the International Islamic University
Islamabad (IIU)

Interview with a female student of the International Islamic University Islamabad with Afghan citizenship, born and raised in Pakistan, September 06th 2018, Female Campus, Fatima Block, Office for International Relations, IIU.

R: It's recording!

So, you have been born in Pakistan, but nevertheless, you have a strong idea of Afghan life. How does that come?

Z: Well, I was born here in a refugee camp. During the last years of Russian war in Afghanistan. When my family migrated to Pakistan along with millions of other refugees. And, during that time, my mom was pregnant on me, so I was born here, in Pakistan. And, I was raised here. But, I was living among Afghans in an Afghan refugee camp, studying in an Afghan school, and being raised in an Afghan family, Afghan environment. So, I have quite an enough idea of Afghan culture.

R: This is a very impressive way of life. The refugee camp where you have been raised, was it one of that government camps?

Z: No, this was, actually, made by Afghans. By Afghans themselves. They were in kind of a contract with the Pakistani government. They gave them the area, they gave them the facilities.

And, also with international organizations like HEC – maybe, you have heard there is some organization called H-E-C [Z is pronouncing it letter by letter, instead as the usual one word.] - that is funding.

R: HEC, yes, I've heard about it.

Z: We have kind of... This was a UN refugee camp. Kind of... like that. It was one of the oldest camps in Pakistan. With the largest number of refugees and it was quite well facilitated. There were schools, there were hospitals, there was everything. Even there was a university in the early years but later it was closed.

R: Ah, very interesting! And, as you can judge the Afghan culture somehow and as you have lived for many years in Pakistan: Which are the differences between a woman's life in Pakistan and a woman's life according to Afghan traditions?

Z: You mean an Afghan woman in Pakistan, and an Afghan woman in Afghanistan?

R: Exactly.

Z: An Afghan woman in Pakistan may find a few things different from Afghanistan. A rural Afghan woman in Pakistan may find more freedom in the sense of education. Afghan women may not have the full freedom of education, though it depends on the females themselves. But, it also depends on the cultural norms, it also depends on the security. Because most of the rural areas [of Afghanistan; annotation] are not secure enough for education. Especially for women. So, she may find more security in Pakistan. She may find more freedom in Pakistan and she may find more opportunities in Pakistan. But, as an urban woman who is living in big cities she may not find a lot of differences between Afghanistan and Pakistan because these countries are not as different like in First World and Third World. [Z smiles broadly, audibly.] So, I personally, when I go back to Kabul, I will have the opportunity to have a job or to do further studies or to do anything. Because I'm living in the capital... Also, this makes a difference.

R: And, you soon will become married, right?! After you finished your studies.

Z: Yes.

R: You look quite happy about it.

Z: I am! I am!

R: You are!

And, have you chosen your husband yourself?

Z: Yes, I have.

R: Alright, then you have every reason to be very happy.

[Z laughs loudly.]

R: Do you then want to have children after you finished your studies?

Z: Sure, yes. I have to do that. But not quite soon.

Because my husband will be... We will be going most probably on a scholarship to Malaysia. My husband will be completing his studies. So, after that we will plan a child.

R: Alright, so you will accompany him to Malaysia?

Z: Yes.

R: Very interesting! But, it was his idea and not your idea? So, he said: "I want to go to Malaysia." And you said: "Well, I will follow."?

Z: Yes, I knew about this even before we got engaged. So, I knew every detail about him before we got engaged. It was not like a totally arranged marriage. It was according to our culture but it was not an imposed marriage. Like, it took me six months to think and to research and to make sure that he is the right man for me. Six months! Even though we were not dating like the dating-idea which is there in European countries ... You must know these things... So, according to my culture we were not dating. We were meeting but not as a girlfriend and a boyfriend. But, we were meeting to get to know each other. That's it. And, then, my family was agreed about this. My dad likes him so much! He was, actually, my brother's friend from long time ago. Five years back. So, I knew him.

Then his family came. The family is like far away. They are living in West Afghanistan. Close to Iran. So, they came to my city. They met my family. And they liked each other. It was kind of arranged marriage and kind of love-marriage, kind of mixed, you know. But, something that will not clash with my culture because I have a respect to my culture and also to my family's choice because I would love to live with a man whom my family loves. Whom my family wanted. And, my mother, my father, they love him so much. So, and he is also like I found him. Like he agrees on me having anything I want, like completing my studies, having any job I want, living anywhere I want. So, actually, I convinced him to live in my city, not in his. [Laughs luckily.]

R: Wow!

Z: This may sounds normal in European countries. But, in my country, this is something very revolutionary.

R: Yes, exactly, I can imagine! Wow!

And, yeah, maybe in future your husband will be the most important person. But, who is for now the most worthful person of your life? Is it might still one family-member?

Z: My parents! My parents!

R: Yeah, as for me.

Z: Because living in a refugee camp, being raised in a refugee camp, I found my father going through the hardest time a parent can go ever. Like, it was not easy to make a living for a seven-members-family. We were five siblings and we had my mom. Both of them were doing a job. My mom was a principal – as I told you before – and my father was also a teacher. And, along that, he started some little business. But, he worked. He struggled really hard to make us do education. Because there were parents who couldn't do this. Like there were a lot, a huge number of children who couldn't get any education in Pakistan. Even inside Afghanistan.

So, even I'm studying here: I'm not on a scholarship. My father is funding me. And he is sending for my living, for my hostel, for my studies, for my pocket-money. Everything! And even if I ask him: "Dad, there are job opportunities, I wanna do a job." He will say: "No, this is your study time. Focus on your studies!"

So, now he is an old man but still he is working. He is writing, and he is making money out of his writings. And he is not paid so much as in other countries. I know that you can make a lot out of writing in other countries. But, in Afghanistan, there is not as much value for academics' works. But, he still does. He funds me and my brother. We're both above 18. I'm 24 and my brother is 22.

So, he is funding both of us.

R: This is really great. But, your family is also a very, very well-educated family, right?!

So, that means, the family already values education very high because they themselves experience the advantages of being educated. And, your mother was a principal of an Afghan school. And, was your father also a teacher of an Afghan school in Pakistan.

Z: No, my father was a teacher in Higher Education Institute which was also for Afghans. But, now he is no more teaching. He is only translating books and writing books and doing that business of gym stones. So, that's his work now. Nowadays he is not a teacher.

And, my mom is also nowadays not working. She is at home. Due to some health conditions. So, she took a break of a couple of years. Maybe, she will then work again.

R: And, your parents are meanwhile living in Afghanistan again, right?!

Z: Yes.

R: When did they go back and due to which reason did they go back?

Z: They went back around four to five years ago. We had the feeling that now we can live in Afghanistan. Like now in Kabul city, it's not secure enough. But, it's secure enough to live. You know, my brother got a job in Afghanistan. My father also got a job there. So, they were like: We can't keep going and coming back, this is not easy. So, the family went there. And, also my youngest sister started her education inside Afghanistan.

R: Wow! Okay, this is now an additional question which comes to my mind currently: You said before, I think, already: The acceptance of people who come back from abroad to Afghanistan is quite high within the society. That means, they will might have the capability to change anything in the society.

Z: Yes, yes!

R: I've experienced very, very different views. But, I think it applies mainly to people coming back from the West. That those who have gone to Europe and now return to Afghanistan, are not accepted by the society, at all, because they lived in a land of sin... You know all that stories.

Z: Yes.

R: And, you have a different experience. Do you think, this is due to the land where you live? That you live in an Islamic country like Pakistan? Or do you think, it depends on the difference of rural and urban areas?

Z: It, of course, also depends on where you are coming from. Of course! I lived in Pakistan in a neighboring country, I wasn't quite far away. But, I have heard family members who were coming from the West, from Europe, from America. I have my friends living in America and in Australia, like you can find Afghans anywhere in the world. [Laughs.] So, when they come back to Afghanistan... Like I have an uncle who is – I told you – married to a German woman. When he comes back, he is so much in clash with everything. He says like: “We have to change everything back in our country”, you know. But, this is something not so practical. You know, you cannot just turn the page like that. It is not so easy, you know. It will take time. It will take work. Very hard work! It will take passion!

But, of course, people who are coming back in an idea of bringing a change to Afghanistan, to dedicate their lives, their education, their experiences, they will make the change. But, people who only come to criticize, for those it will be better to go back. So, they won't make the change.

R: Yeah, true.

Z: They won't make the change! I have heard such people! I have met such people! And, they are not even ready to come back. They are not ready to come back. They have the mentality of these countries now, they are living there, and they are now not even ready to send their children ever back to Afghanistan. So, it depends on why you came back to Afghanistan, where you are coming from. And: Are you really coming to make a change? – If you come back, you can make a change. Nowadays, there is this chance in Afghanistan. It's not any more like Taliban time that nobody will be able to speak, everyone will be shut down. It's not like that!

Now, there are chances! For people who seek the chances! In a country like Afghanistan, you should not sit at home and wait until the chances come and meet you. You go and seek these chances! You fight for these chances!

R: This was a great answer.

Quite finally, almost final question: What does freedom mean to you? Try to explain it simply...

Z: Freedom..., Ahm, when you feel accomplished, you feel fulfilled and you feel happy about the way you're living, the way you are doing things, the way you are saying things, and you feel no pressure from anywhere. That's what freedom is. Freedom is what you feel. Freedom is not what you look like. Freedom is not what you do. Freedom is not what the world thinks of you. Freedom is what you have inside here. [Knocks on her heart.] So, when you feel over here [points to her heart] that you can do, you can have any goal, you can do anything you want, anything you think is good for you, others do not define for you what is good for you, what you have to do. – The way you live and the way you do. That is, what freedom is. So, freedom is felt, more than said. [Laughs.]

R: Yeah, true. Finally, as you have already observed before during the other interview: the HONOR question...

Z: Yeah...

R: I cannot grasp the term of honor, honestly speaking, but many, many women in Austria inserted in the questionnaires: "I'm the honor of the family, I'm the bearer of the honor, honor is so important, and the honor is exercised through me." - Can you somehow try to define honor? And can you tell me, if honor is positive for you in your perception? Or is it a burden for you?

Z: First of all, I would say that this question of honor is a very sensitive question in Afghanistan. Because we are so cultural people, there is a religious and cultural mindset in people which makes honor a very big question. [Laughs.]

So, as a woman – of course, women are more responsible about honor and women are the honor of the family, the honor of the whole, not only the family, but relatives even, the honor of the whole place she is living. Do you believe this?

R: Hmmhmm.

Z: So, as a girl belonging to that family, belonging to that place, belonging to that people you have to keep your honor. You – have – to – keep – your – honor. So...

But it has some positive dimension as well which should not be ignored. So, for me, as I told you before, I would never accept an arranged marriage just because of the honor of my family. A person whom I do not understand who he is, what does he want, the way he wants to live,

what does he want me to do in future. I would never go for this because of my honor! But, I would like people, I would like others, I would like the world to see that the person I'm living with, my family is happy with. I am married with him, I considered my culture, I considered my family, and I considered my honor also with it.

In this way, I would live a life of dignity, you know. So, honor also has a touch of dignity in it. So, this is the positive point. Because the more honor will be left, the more awful you live, the more value you have in your society. So, it has this positive touch in it.

But, also, there are some... A lot, actually, negative things which are attached with this honor thing: which comes up as hurdles on the ways of women. Because others, actually, define it so differently in different places. For a rural woman, it's very against the honor of the people – at least for some rural women – if she goes to school. Right?

R: Exactly, yes.

Z: So, she has to sacrifice her EDUCATION. For HONOR. She has to sacrifice, for example, her CHOICE OF MARRIAGE. For HONOR. – This is the negative side of honor. Aaahhhm. And, it's very strong in some areas. Unfortunately. – These are the changes, we have to make!!!
[Laughs loudly.]

R: Yes, exactly, but we are already working on it!

Z: Yes, we have to. I feel, we have to. Actually, I feel, I am participating in this thing. There is a female organization in Afghanistan of which I have membership. I'm not a very active member. But, I hope, when I'm going back to Afghanistan, I will be active. And, my mom, my sister-in-law, my sister, they do all have membership of that female organization. They are all part of that organization! Which is working to educate women about their rights – according to their culture! According to their religion! They are not going against the society. Because if you just reject and criticize everything at once, people will not accept. This is just the thing that happens with people who come from the West. – Why they are not accepted? - Because they only criticize! Because they don't stand aside with people! They stand AGAINST PEOPLE. So, they have maybe good intentions but the way they are dealing is not working. Because they are going against everything. They just clash.

So, the good thing with that organization is that they do not go against people. They do not reject everything at once. They go step by step. They go by the side of people. So, I hope, I can make a change. And, for my part, I will put a brick in a big wall.

R: Yeah, I'm convinced, you will. Thank you so much!

Z: You're welcome.

R: I really enjoyed talking to you. It was fine!

Z: Same here! Thank you so much!

8.1.6. Qualitative interview No. 4 with a former fellow of Medica Mondiale in Kabul
/ Afghanistan, now resident in Vienna / Austria

*Interview with a mother of five from Afghanistan, legal advisor for Afghan women, September
30th 2018, living room of the woman's family, Wienerfeld, 1100 Vienna*

R: Okay, Aufnahme läuft. Es ist ein sehr gutes Gerät. Wir können ganz normal sprechen und man kann darauf alles hören.

N, was macht das Leben in Afghanistan aus? Welche positiven Seiten? Welche negativen Seiten gibt es?

N: Von Frauen?

R: Ja, für Frauen.

N: Ach so, das Leben ist für Frauen zu 90 oder 95 Prozent negativ. Vielleicht fünf oder zehn Prozent im Leben von Frauen sind positive Sachen. Denn wir sprechen nicht über diese 1.000 oder 2.000 Frauen, die in Kabul, der Hauptstadt, leben. Wir sprechen über die Frauen überall auf dem Land. Diese Frauen, die in den Bundesländern leben, sie wissen nicht, wie alt sie sind, sie wissen vielleicht nicht, wie ihr eigener Vater heißt. Sie verstehen nichts von ihrer Familie. Denn sie waren vielleicht 9 Jahre alt, als sie verheiratet worden sind. Sie wissen nicht, wie ihre Brüder, ihre Schwestern heißen. – Wir sprechen über DIESE Frauen. Sie haben kein Recht, ihre Ehemänner nach ihren Wünschen auszuwählen, mit denen sie ihre Leben verbringen möchten. Sie dürfen nicht in die Schule gehen. Sie sehen niemals überhaupt einen Kindergarten. Sie dürfen weder zu einer Kinderbetreuung gehen noch an eine Uni. Sie dürfen auch nicht arbeiten. Wenn in Kabul, der Hauptstadt, eine Frau oder ein Mädchen zur Schule geht, gibt es viele Schwierigkeiten. Die Leute betrachten sie als eine unverschämliche⁴⁴¹ Frau oder ein unverschämliches Mädchen, WEIL sie zur Schule geht. Die Leute sagen: „Wieso gehst du zur Schule? Was machst du dort? Du gehst fremd? Du gehst mit anderen Männern aus? Wieso gehst du in die Schule? Was brauchst du? Du bekommst Essen zu Hause, von deinem Vater oder deinem Bruder. Was willst du draußen? Du musst zu Hause bleiben und alle Hausarbeit machen.“

⁴⁴¹ This term is a newly coined word with which N expresses both: the term “outrageous” [in German: unverschämt] and, simultaneously, the saying “shame on her” [in German: “die sollte sich was schämen”]. As there is, apparently, no German word that fits this setting, the neologism “unverschämlich” will remain during the entire transliteration of the interview in this particular meaning.

Das ist das Urteil der Generationen. Denn die Frauen und Männer hatten zuerst sehr anstrengende Leben. Dann wollten die Männer nicht mehr arbeiten zu Hause und sie hatten entschieden: Mädchen bleiben zu Hause, machen alle Hausarbeit – und wenn sie nach draußen geht, ist es unverschämlich.

Es sind auch die Männer gewesen, die die Frauen zu Tieren gemacht haben. Sie denken, Frauen und Mädchen sind Tiere. Wir können sie zu Hause halten – und so wie die Milch von der Kuh kommt und die Eier von den Hühnern, müssen die Frauen Kinder gebären, die Wohnung putzen, Wäsche waschen und bügeln und sich um die Besuche und die Kinder kümmern – und das Kopftuch tragen und nicht draußen gehen, ohne ihren Mann oder ihren Vater zu fragen. – Sie denken, die Frau ist eine Sache für uns, wir müssen auf sie aufpassen, dass sie nicht weglaufen.

R: Und das gilt für die Mehrheit der Frauen in Afghanistan?

N: Sicher!

R: Aber in Kabul geht es ihnen tendenziell besser, oder?!

N: Ein bisschen besser, ja. Aber nicht viel besser. Denn wenn die Frauen in die Arbeit gehen, dann bekommen sie viel Ärger, wenn sie nach Hause kommen: von ihrem Mann, von ihrem Schwiegervater, von ihrer Schwiegermutter, von ihrer Schwägerin und so weiter. Sie sagen immer: „Wo warst du? Was hast du gemacht?“ – Und eine Frau, die arbeiten geht, muss mehr zu Hause arbeiten als eine Frau, die nicht arbeiten geht. – Aber das ist nicht Leben, ja?!

R: Ja, das ist schrecklich! Sie geben der arbeitenden Frau noch mehr Arbeit, um ihr heimzuzahlen, dass sie nicht da war.

N: Ja! Und das ist schrecklich! Aber trotzdem sind diese Frauen froh, wenn sie arbeiten dürfen.

R: Eigentlich habe ich jetzt gar keinen positiven Aspekt gehört. Du hast jetzt viele negative Sachen gesagt. Aber es gibt fünf bis zehn Prozent positive Dinge im Leben einer Frau in Afghanistan. Welche sind diese Dinge?

N: Die positiven Dinge sind vielleicht, wenn eine Frau so froh ist und vielleicht einfach nichts versteht von den Regeln und Gesetzen oder von Gleichberechtigung. Wenn sie all das nicht versteht, dann ist sie vielleicht zu fünf bis zehn Prozent fröhlicher. Wenn eine Frau in die Schule und in die Uni geht, versteht sie ihre Rechte. Und dann wird sie noch trauriger werden.

R: Ja, genau das habe ich schon in Pakistan gelernt. Wo kommen all diese Regeln her, N? Diese Regeln für „eine Frau muss dies und das machen. Eine Frau muss kochen, putzen, sie muss gut aussehen, sie muss Kinder bekommen...“ – Woher kommt das?

N: Diese blöden Sachen kommen alle von der Gewohnheit. Das ist keine Regel, das ist nicht Kultur, das ist auch nicht Islam. Es ist nicht von der Regierung. – Es sind nur die Urteile von anderen Leuten. Sie urteilen und folgen ihrer Gewohnheit.

R: Aber wenn das alles Gewohnheit ist, dann könnte jede Frau das ja ändern, indem sie ihre Kinder anders erzieht.

N: Ich hab dir das schon gesagt! Die Männer halten ihre Frauen wie Tiere. Frauen sind nur zum Kochen, Putzen und Kinder Kriegen da. Und zum Schminken für ihren Mann. Und wenn ihr Mann sagt: „Du musst das machen!“, dann ist das okay. Wenn SIE selbst etwas für ihre Kinder tun, dann ist es schrecklich und gefährlich für ihre Leben. Der Mann sagt: „Ich darf vier Frauen haben. Wenn du schlau wirst, dann geh raus aus meinem Haus. Ich brauche dich nicht. Ich brauche eine Frau, die nicht alphabetisiert ist und nichts versteht. So eine Frau brauche ich. Wenn du schlau werden willst, dann geh! Tschüss, baba! Ich brauche das nicht!“ – Und das ist gefährlich für Frauen. Wenn die Frau ihren Mann verlässt, dann bekommt sie ihre Kinder nicht, dann bekommt sie auch ihr Eigentum nicht. Sie muss alleine gehen. Egal ob sie ein Kind hat, zwei Kinder, drei Kinder, fünf oder zehn: Alle Kinder müssen bei ihrem Mann bleiben. Das ist Gesetz.

Deswegen wollen die Frauen bei ihren Männern bleiben, obwohl sie als Tiere gehalten werden. Denn sie möchten mit ihren Kindern bleiben.

R: Also von Gesetz wegen gehören die Kinder der Familie des Mannes?

N: Ja, zuerst gehören sie dem Ehemann. In zweiter Instanz gehören sie seiner Familie. Ja.

R: Oh Gott!

N: Ja. In zweiter Instanz gehören sie der Großmutter oder dem Großvater.

R: Und gibt es den Fall – das ist jetzt eine Zwischenfrage, die mir gerade einfällt – gibt es den Fall, dass eine Frau von ihrem Mann weggeht und zurückgeht zu IHREN Eltern? Hat es das schon gegeben? Oder gibt es das manchmal?

N: Ja, es gibt manchmal solche Fälle. Denn wenn die Frau weggeht, dann geht ihr Mann sofort zur Polizei und schreibt eine Anzeige: „Meine Frau ist weg – mit einem anderen Mann. Sie hat mein Geld, mein Gold, alles weggenommen. Sie ist eine Räuberin!“ – Deswegen haben die Frauen furchtbar Angst und können nicht rausgehen. Aber es gibt in Kabul manche Shelter. Shelter? Kennen Sie Shelter?

R: Ja.

N: Wenn Frauen in Gefahr sind, dann gehen manche Frauen – längst nicht alle – in diese Shelter. Aber wissen Sie, das ist der Nachteil des Shelter's, wenn sie vielleicht für zehn Tage in den Shelter gehen und nur einen Tag davon nach draußen wollen, vielleicht etwas einkaufen oder

frische Luft bekommen, dann werden sie getötet werden. Entweder von ihrem Mann oder vom Schwiegervater. Wissen Sie, der Shelter ist keine Garantie. Er ist keine Garantie.

Manchmal kommen auch die Angehörigen in den Shelter und sagen: „Ja, wir entschuldigen uns. Geben Sie uns unsere Frau zurück!“ – Dann bringen sie die Frau nach Hause, um sie dort zu töten.

R: Okay, das ist nicht so einfach.

N: Nein, es geht nicht, wenn die Frauen weggehen.

R: Eigentlich wird der Shelter zu einem Gefängnis, weil die Frau nicht rausgehen kann. Wenn sie rausgeht, wird sie getötet.

N: Ja, stimmt. Und auch wird niemand mehr diese Frau heiraten. Denn sie werden sagen: „Du bist eine unverschämliche⁴⁴² Frau. Wieso bist du dort hingegangen? Man kann nicht auf dich vertrauen. Du kannst nicht wieder mit einem anderen zusammen sein. Denn du bist eine gefährliche Frau, weil du das gemacht hast!“ – Wenn eine Frau zur Polizei geht, dann ist das eine große Sache – es ist verschämlich für diese Frau.

R: Das bringt mich wohl eh schon auf meine letzte Frage: Diese Frage mit der Ehre...

N: Ach so.

R: Das ist doch eigentlich schon so etwas. Wenn diese Frau zur Polizei geht oder sie von ihrem Mann weggeht, dann ist sie ehrlos, oder?!

N: Ehrlos, ja.

R: Das heißt, das Konzept von Ehre verpflichtet die Frau, bei ihren Kindern und bei ihrem Mann zu bleiben. Aber was bedeutet denn eigentlich Ehre genau für afghanische Frauen?

N: Also für mich hat es keine Bedeutung! Aber für andere Leute aus Afghanistan bedeutet Ehre, wenn ich heirate und ich bin ein Mann, dann darf niemand meine Frau sehen. Männer sagen dann zu ihrer Frau: „Du darfst nicht rausgehen! Du darfst nicht lachen! Du darfst nicht ohne Kopftuch zu Hause bleiben! Oder du darfst nicht das machen, das, das, das...“ – Alle Regeln kommen dann mit aller Wucht auf diese Frau. Das ist Ehre!

„Du machst nicht das, das, das, das!“ – Das ist Ehre!

Und kennen Sie diesen Burschen in Wien? Dieser Bursche, der in Wien lebt, im Herzen Europas! Seine Schwester ist weggegangen, denn sie waren zu anstrengend für seine Schwester. Also ist die Schwester weggegangen. Zur Polizei oder sowas. Oder zur Regierung. – Und der Bursche hat sie mit einem Messer...

R: Bakhti hat sie geheißt.

⁴⁴² The newly coined word „unverschämlich“ is kept in its meaning referring to the explanation on page 117 of this transliteration.

N: Ja! Der Bursche hat seine Schwester mit einem Messer getötet!

Aber die Leute haben auf Facebook an ihn geschrieben: „Jaaa! Du hast viel Ehre! Du bist ehrvoll!“⁴⁴³ Ja, du bist brav! Du hast das gut gemacht! Ja, bravo, bravo, bravo!“ – Niemand hat gesagt: „Sie ist auch Mensch, du bist auch Mensch! – Du darfst nicht einen Menschen töten!“

R: Ja, genau. Es kann keinen Grund geben.

N: Ja, es kann keinen Grund geben! Wieso? – Man darf alles machen. Aber in diesem Punkt hat die Regierung ein Gefängnis und eine Regel. Sie machen das! – Warum machst du es?

Ja, aber in unserem Land ist Ehre etwas sehr Schlechtes. Ja, viele Frauen wurden getötet wegen Ehre. Sie wurden getötet, ja. Oder sie heiraten im Alter von 13 Jahren einen 60-jährigen Mann. Das ist Ehre!

Wenn jemand dann ihren Vater fragt: „Warum hast du deine Tochter im Alter von 13 Jahren verheiratet?“ – Dann wird er sagen: „Ich habe Ehre! Ich lasse nicht meine Tochter 18 Jahre alt werden und mit einem anderen Mann fremdgehen! – Ich habe das alles sehr schnell erledigt, denn ICH HABE EHRE! Ich bin ein ehrvoller Mann!“

R: Also sind aber beide Geschlechter verantwortlich für Ehre? Ehre ist nicht nur, was die Frau machen muss, sondern auch die Männer müssen sich um die Ehre kümmern, oder?! Es ist nicht alleine Aufgabe von den Frauen, sondern es betrifft beide?

N: Ja, wenn jemand einen anderen tötet, ist das Ehre. Wenn er zu feige ist, ihn zu töten, dann ist er feige.

R: Und das ist NICHT Ehre?

N: Das ist nicht Ehre, ja.

Ja, er muss alles machen wie ein Mann. – Das ist Ehre.

Immer seine Schwester schlagen, ihre Mutter schlagen, seine Frau schlagen, das ist Ehre!

„Ja, mein Sohn hat viel Ehre! Er schlägt seine Frau jeden Tag!“ – Das ist Ehre!

Das ist nicht respektlos und auch nichts anderes – DAS NENNT MAN EHRE.

R: Zum Abschluss, N, stelle ich dir eine persönliche Frage.

N: Bitte!

R: Ich glaube, du hast eine ganz nette Familie: Deine fünf Kinder und auch dein Mann, sie sind sehr nett.

N: Danke!

⁴⁴³ The neologism „ehrvoll“ [English: „honorful“] expresses not the same like “dignified” [German: “ehrwürdig”]. It rather frames the opposite of “dishonorable” [German: “ehrlos”] as a specific social status that can be acquired by accumulating some kind of *honor points* in the interaction with the society. In the absence of alternative expressions in German and English, this newly coined word is kept in its here described meaning.

R: Das heißt, hast du selbst jemals den Druck bekommen, den viele Frauen haben wegen Ehre und wegen der Familie und wegen aller Aufgaben, die du zu erfüllen hast? Oder hast du für DICH ein gutes Leben leben können? Auch in Afghanistan, nicht nur in Österreich?

War Afghanistan gut für dich? Oder hast du gedacht: „Ah, ich muss wegen der Schwiegereltern und wegen meinen Eltern und wegen meinem Mann... und ich muss das und ich muss das und ich muss das...“?

N: Ja, natürlich, ich bin auch eine afghanische Frau. Obwohl ich studiert habe, habe ich trotzdem viel Erfahrung mit Ehre gemacht. Zuerst musste ich auf die Ehre von meinem Vater und meinem Bruder aufpassen, aber mehr als mein Vater waren meine Brüder sehr anstrengend. Dann wurde ich verheiratet und von da an musste ich die Ehre meines Mannes aufpassen. Und wissen Sie, ich habe eine Erinnerung: Als ich frisch verheiratet war, hatten meine Schwiegermutter und mein Mann etwas mit scharfer Chili gegessen. Weil ich das nicht gegessen habe wegen der scharfen Chili, hat meine Schwiegermutter sofort gesagt: „Sie hat keine Ehre!“ [N lacht laut.]

R: Was???

N: Ja! „Sie ist ehrlos! Deswegen kann sie nicht scharfe Chili essen! Schau, mein Sohn, du hast eine blöde Frau geheiratet!“

R: Das ist verrückt!

N: Glauben Sie mir! Nur wegen einer scharfen Chili, hat sie gesagt: „Ja, diese Frau ist blöd. Sie kann nicht scharfe Chili essen. Das ist ehrlos!“

Meine Schwiegermutter war immer sehr anstrengend für mich. Mehr als mein Mann. Mein Mann war liberal und Demokrat. Er hat mich ohne Kopftuch gelassen. Er hat gesagt: „Du musst in die Uni gehen und studieren. Du musst arbeiten!“ – Aber meine Schwiegermutter hat mich immer unter Druck gesetzt und sagte: „Lass deine Frau nicht ohne Kopftuch! Lass deine Frau nicht rausgehen! Lass deine Frau nicht zur Uni gehen! Denn wenn deine Frau studiert und schlau wird, dann wird sie dich verlassen. Sie wird dich verlassen!“ – Sie hat zu meinem Mann gesagt: „Du hast nur eine Möglichkeit! Wenn deine Frau viele Kinder geboren hat, dann wird sie vielleicht bei dir bleiben. Sie wird wegen ihrer Kinder bleiben. Wenn sie nur ein Kind hat oder vielleicht keines, dann wird sie schlau werden an der Uni und wird weggehen von dir.“ – Warum? – Ich weiß es nicht!

Ja, meine Schwiegermutter war sehr anstrengend und hat mir mein Leben zur Hölle gemacht, aber trotzdem habe ich es geschafft, in die Uni zu gehen und mein Studium abzuschließen. Ich habe vier oder fünf Jahre als Anwältin für Frauen gearbeitet. Ich habe viele Frauen unterstützt!

Ich hatte auch ein Büro. Das heißt, wir hatten legal advisor gemacht. Wenn die Frau ein Problem hatte, kam sie zu uns und wir haben ihr Möglichkeiten aufgezeigt. Wir haben ihr gesagt, es gibt die Möglichkeit, zu Gericht zu gehen und die Scheidung einzureichen. – Wir haben ihr auch angeboten, dass sie kostenlos einen Anwalt von uns bekommen kann. Wir alle haben für die Frauen kostenlos gearbeitet.

Viele Frauen kamen wegen ihrer Ehemänner zu uns. Wir hatten zunächst mit dieser Familie gesprochen. Wenn es große Probleme waren, dann haben wir das Ehepaar geschieden. Wenn nicht, wenn das Problem klein war und sie Kinder hatten, dann haben wir ihnen gesagt: „Es gibt die Möglichkeit, dass du als Frau das machst und er das macht, und dann ist es vorbei.“ – Und viele Leute waren uns so dankbar, dass sie uns viele Geschenke gebracht haben. Obwohl wir gut verdient haben. Aber sie haben Geschenke gebracht und haben gesagt: „Jetzt ist unser Leben sehr normal. Und wir sind glücklich! Danke an euer Büro!“

Wir waren vier Anwältinnen dort und wir hatten noch zwei ... Arbeiterinnen. Ich kann das nicht auf Deutsch sagen...

R: Sekretärinnen?

N: Nein, nicht Sekretärinnen. Aber sie arbeiteten für Frauen, die vielleicht für ihre Kinder Milch oder Pampers oder eine andere Hilfe gebraucht haben.

R: Okay, nicht Rechtsberatung, sondern andere Hilfe.

N: Ja, andere Hilfe. Lebenshilfe vielleicht?

R: Ja, ja, okay, verstehe.

N: Wir hatten vielen Frauen geholfen. Und wir haben auch ein, also ich mit meinem Team, wir haben auch ein Gesetz für Frauen und Kinder abgeschlossen. Aber das war zwar sehr positiv für Frauen und Kinder, aber es ist nicht im Alltag bei Gericht angewendet worden.

R: Okay, also ihr habt einen Gesetzesentwurf gemacht?

N: Nein, nein, nicht nur ein Entwurf. Wir haben es abgeschlossen!

R: Okay, das Gesetz ist also vom Parlament akzeptiert worden?

N: Ja, schon.

R: Aber es ist in der Realität nicht umgesetzt worden?

N: Ja! Ja!

R: Das gibt es leider sehr oft, gell?!

N: Ja.

R: Es gibt gute Gesetze in Afghanistan, sehr gute sogar...

N: Ja, wir haben viele schöne Gesetze, aber sie BENUTZEN sie nicht!

R: Letzte Frage: Wer hat dieses Büro finanziert, in dem du gearbeitet hast?

N: Also, das war eine Organisation von Deutschland. Sie heißt Medica Mondiale.⁴⁴⁴

Es gibt Medica Mondiale in Afrika, in Afghanistan und in noch zwei oder drei Ländern. Ich habe vergessen, wo noch.

R: Medica Mondiale?

N: Medica Mondiale.

Ich habe ein Zertifikat von dort.

R: Ich muss es googeln.

N: Ich zeige dir später das Logo.

R: N, ich glaube, es reicht. Es sind schon 23 Minuten. [Lacht.] Vielen, vielen Dank!

N: Ja, aber es tut mir so weh. [Beginnt zu weinen.] Es tut mir so weh, wenn ich sehe, wie viele Schwierigkeiten Frauen in Afghanistan haben!

R: Ja.

N: Sie haben kein Recht! Wenn sie geboren werden mit all ihren Wünschen, ihren Träumen – und dann sterben sie. Mit ihren Wünschen. [Stimme löst sich in Tränen auf.]

Alles bleibt im Herzen.

Und sie konnten nicht...

Die Frauen konnten nicht schwimmen, konnten nicht Fußball spielen, konnten nicht Rad fahren, konnten nicht Auto fahren.

Alle Wünsche bleiben drinnen.

R: Das ist furchtbar. Das ist wirklich furchtbar.

[20 Sekunden Stille.]

R: Das ist mir noch nie so bewusst geworden wie jetzt gerade: Es kommt auf die Welt, mit der Frau, die da geboren wird, mit dem kleinen Mädchen, kommt es auf die Welt. Und dann wird sie alt und stirbt und es geht wieder von der Welt.

N: Ja. [Trocknet die Tränen.] Sie kommen auf die Welt als Tiere. Und sie verstehen nicht ihre Rechte, ihre Hobbies... Wenn sie 9 oder 10 Jahre oder 13 oder 14 Jahre alt werden, dann müssen sie sofort heiraten. Egal, ob mit einem alten oder jungen Mann: Sie müssen heiraten! – Und wenn sie heiraten, kennen sie den Mann nicht. Das heißt, sie bekommen einen Schock am ersten Tag.

R: Ja, das kann ich mir vorstellen.

N: Ja, und das ist nicht nur von ihrem Mann, sondern sie ist die Frau seiner ganzen Familie. Nicht nur von ihrem Mann. Und wenn sie verheiratet sind, dann kommt der Schwager und sagt:

⁴⁴⁴ For further information on the work of Medica Mondiale, please follow this link: <https://www.medicamondiale.org/en.html> (October 5th 2018).

„Wo ist mein Hemd?“ – Und die Schwägerin kommt: „Wo ist mein Tee?“ – Und die ganze Familie sagt: „Wir haben viel Geld ausgegeben für dich! Es war nicht leicht, dich hierhin zu bekommen! Wir haben viel Geld ausgeborgt! Du bist unsere Sklavin! Du musst das machen, du musst das machen, das, das, das...“

Männer können hässlich sein. Denn er ist ein Mann. Es ist egal.

Aber Frauen müssen hübsch sein. Alles an ihnen! Ihre Figur muss hübsch sein, ihre Augen müssen hübsch sein. Alles!

Und sie muss nur Burschen auf die Welt bringen. Wenn sie schwanger ist, dann sagt der Mann: „Du musst einen Mann bringen! Nicht eine Frau! Nicht eine Frau!“ – Ja, das ist so.

Bei mir war es auch so: Mein erstes Kind war ein Mädchen.

Meine Schwiegermutter hat immer gesagt: „Du bist eine ehrlose Frau! ICH habe vier Buben zur Welt gebracht, DU hast ein Mädchen gebracht. Du bekommst vielleicht sieben Mädchen?! Eine nach der anderen, eine nach der anderen. Du wirst nicht einen Sohn bekommen! Ich werde meinem Sohn sagen, er soll dich verlassen und eine andere Frau heiraten!“

Sie hat mich gezwungen, alles im Haushalt zu machen. Wenn sie gesagt: „Mach das!“ oder „Putz das!“ habe ich das sofort gemacht. Weil ich so Angst hatte, dass mein Mann eine andere Frau nehmen würde.

Deshalb habe ich alles gemacht, was meine Schwiegermutter wollte. Sie hat mich immer gezwungen.

Gott sei Dank, war das zweite Kind EIN BUB!

Der dritte war ja auch ein Bub.

Und dann hat mein Mann gesagt: „Ja, Mama, du hast kein Recht gehabt.“

Aber es war wirklich eine große Chance für mich, zwei Buben zu bekommen. Wenn das zweite und das dritte Kind auch Mädchen gewesen wären, was wäre dann aus mir geworden? Das wäre schrecklich gewesen!

Mein Schicksal wäre ein anderes geworden.

Mein Mann wollte eine andere Frau nehmen, eine zweite Frau. Mit mir. Ja.

Die Frauen haben kein Herz. Kein Herz! Die zwei wie ein Vogel oder ein Hund oder eine Katze bleiben zu Hause und ein Mann kommt einmal zu dieser Frau und einmal zur anderen Frau. Das geht doch nicht!

Ja, wenn eine Frau zwei Männer hat, was machen diese Männer? – Sofort töten! Sie töten den anderen Mann sofort! Aber die Frauen müssen jeden Tag Geduld haben. Sie müssen jeden Tag die andere Frau sehen. Ja, in einer Wohnung zwei Frauen. Eine vielleicht älter, eine vielleicht

jünger – und Männer brauchen immer eine noch hübschere und jüngere Frau. Und die andere ist das Opfer!

Ich HASSE diese Regeln! Ich HASSE diese Ehre! Alles!

Weil es ALLES Frauen betrifft, nicht die Männer! Ich habe nie gehört, dass ein Imam oder ein Mullah etwas für Männer gesagt hätte. Wie: „Sie müssen das und das haben, sie müssen das und das machen...“ Stattdessen sagen sie immer: „Sie müssen auf ihre Schwestern, ihre Frauen und ihre Töchter aufpassen! Die dürfen nicht rausgehen! Die dürfen nicht fernsehen oder Facebook nutzen.“ Die Männer dürfen auch kein Handy für ihre Frauen oder Schwestern kaufen. Immer heißt es: „Mullah-am hat gesagt... und die anderen auch!“

R: Es geht immer gegen die Frauen...

N: Ja, die Männer machen ALLES überall. Alles! Alles! Sie dürfen alles machen. Aber bei uns gibt es halal und haram⁴⁴⁵ auf Islam. Aber für Männer ist alles halal.

[R lacht laut.]

N: Wenn sie etwas machen, ist es immer halal. Weil er ein Mann ist, darf er sowieso alles machen. Aber für Frauen gibt es halal und haram. Aber für Männer ist alles halal. Aber das ist nicht für alle Männer so. Vielleicht fünf oder zehn Prozent der Männer sind ehrlich, sie sind wirkliche Muslime. Sie machen nichts.

Aber 90 Prozent oder zumindest 80 Prozent der Männer machen halal und haram zusammen.

Wenn die Runde zu den Frauen kommt, schreien sie dann: „Nein! Das ist haram!“

Auch hier in Österreich kenne ich viele Männer, die jeden Tag Schwimmen gehen. Wenn die Frau sagt, ich gehe auch, dann sagen sie: „Aber das ist haram! Wenn die anderen Männer dich sehen, was soll ich dann machen? – Es geht um MEINE EHRE! - Und am nächsten Tag werden die anderen Männer zu mir sagen: ‚Hey, du, du hast keine Ehre, du warst mit deiner Frau Schwimmen.‘ – Ich kann das leider nicht machen. Du musst zu Hause bleiben und dich um die Kinder kümmern. Ich gehe Schwimmen, denn ich habe ein bisschen Schmerzen. Ich möchte das machen.“

Ja. [Seufzt tief.]

R: Aber das Beispiel zeigt jetzt auch, dass Ehre auch ein Druck für die Männer ist. Denn die Männer hören dann von den anderen: „Du hast nicht auf deine Frau aufgepasst, deine Frau hat keine Ehre!“ – Und deswegen haben SIE Stress, die Männer.

N: Stimmt. Ja, das stimmt. Aber das ist ein bisschen dumm. Denn SIE müssen das verändern. Sie müssen es ändern!

⁴⁴⁵ Halal and haram are Islamic concepts which allow [halal] and prohibit [haram] things to do, to eat, to think and to say and officially and in the common, widespread perception apply to both genders, female and male, equally.

R: Ja, und sie KÖNNEN es verändern.

N: Ja, sie machen ihre eigenen Leben zu einer Hölle – und auch die von ihren Familien. Warum leben sie nicht im Paradies? Warum nicht?

Die Welt ist ein Paradies! Wenn man es will!

Wenn man sie nur dazu macht, ist sie ein Paradies: Machen sie Urlaub! Gehen sie ins Restaurant! Gehen sie nicht essen mit 100 oder 150 [gemeint ist Geld; Anmerkung]. Sie können nur einen Kaffee trinken mit ihrer Frau, das kostet nicht viel Geld. Sie können auch ins Kino gehen. Oder ins Museum. Oder in den Park mit den Kindern. Man kann auch ein bisschen Kartoffeln und Salat mit in den Park nehmen. Keinen Kebab, kein Fleisch oder andere Sachen, die teuer sind. Man kann glücklich sein.

R: Man muss es wollen! Man muss glücklich sein WOLLEN.

N: Ja, das ist richtig, man muss es wollen. Aber viele Männer möchten mit ihren Familien in der Hölle leben. Sie bringen auch ihre Familien dorthin. Sie wissen nicht, was das Leben ausmacht, was es auf der Welt zu sehen gibt. Aber alles, was es hier gibt, ist FÜR UNS. Gott hat das alles für uns gegeben! [Beginnt zu weinen.]

Und sie wissen es nicht! Oder: Sie wissen es schon, aber sie wollen nicht.

R: Sie wollen nicht.

N: Ja, sie wollen nicht.

R: N, vielen, vielen Dank, das war großartig.

N: [Lacht unter Tränen.] Danke Ihnen auch!

R: Es war großartig.

N: Danke!

8.1.7. Qualitative interview No. 5 with a pharmaceutical assistant, Vienna / Austria

Interview with a pharmaceutical assistant and mother of one cheerful daughter, October 13th 2018, meeting in the parc Preßgasse, 4th district of Vienna

R: So, das Gerät läuft jetzt. Liebe K, du bist ganz alleine mit deiner Tochter von Mashad bis nach Wien gegangen.

K: Mhhhm.

R: Wann war das eigentlich genau? Und magst du das näher beschreiben? Wie lange hat es gedauert?

K: Es hat einen Monat gedauert. Es war 2015 im Oktober und es war ziemlich kalt. Und wir haben uns von meinen Eltern verabschiedet. Mein Papa hat furchtbar geweint. Er hat gedacht, es ist ur-schwer. Wir sind dann im Kofferraum von einem Bus gefahren. Wir waren da zwei

Nächte und zwei Tage drin. Und wir sind einfach durchgefahren bis Tabris, das ist eine Stadt [im Iran; Anmerkung] an der Grenze zur Türkei. Der Bus hat uns dorthin gebracht und als wir dort ausgestiegen sind, haben meine Knie furchtbar weh getan, weil wir die ganze Zeit so sitzen mussten. [Zeigt zusammengekauerte Haltung mit ihrem Kind an der Brust in den Armen.] Wir durften nicht laut reden. Gar nichts. Es war da total dunkel. Für ein Kind war es so schwer.

Tochter: Haben wir ein Sackerl?

[K beantwortet die Frage mit einem kleinen Plastiksackerl.]

K: Dann war es Nacht. Wir haben angefangen zu gehen. In die Berge. Meine Tochter war damals vier Jahre alt und 20 Kilogramm schwer. Und eine Vierjährige kann nicht so viel gehen. Man kann sie auch nicht tragen. Insbesondere auf den Bergen. Und ich hatte noch einen schweren Rucksack dabei. Um 5 war es schon dunkel und wir haben angefangen hinaufzugehen. Um 8 Uhr in der Früh waren wir dann in der Türkei. Das heißt, wir sind die ganze Nacht hinaufgegangen.

[R seufzt.]

K: Ja! Und ich habe meine Tochter um meine Schultern mit einem sehr langen Band – ich hatte sie fest... - wie heißt das? –

R: Festgebunden?

K: Ja, festgebunden, damit sie nicht von meinem Rücken fällt. Es war so schwer. Ich konnte nicht weiter. Die Soldaten haben geschossen. Und dann hatte ich Angst, meine Tochter wird [stockt] sterben. Ich *musste* es [stockt] entweder durchstehen oder [stockt] sterben. Oder nach Afghanistan abgeschoben werden?

R: Wahnsinn.

K: Ja. Und dann sind wir in der Türkei angekommen. Wir waren 1 Woche in einem Stall. Der Stall war nass. Und die ganze Zeit nur Kekse und Wasser. Es war so schwer! Kein Badezimmer. Das Klo war total schmutzig und furchtbar. Man konnte nicht wirklich aufs Klo gehen. Und im Stall war es sehr kalt, keine Decke, kein Bett, kein Polster, gar nichts. Man musste einfach am Boden sitzen und nicht reden.

R: Oh Gott.

K: Ja. Eine Woche. Und danach sind wir mit einem Bus bis nach Istanbul gefahren. Bis Istanbul sind wir auch durchgefahren. Und dann waren wir in einem ganz, ganz kleinen Zimmer mit 30 Männern. Alle zusammen in einem Zimmer.

R: Ich hätte Angst gehabt.

K: Ich habe auch Angst gehabt! Es waren alles Männer. Ich war die einzige Frau mit einem Kind. Es war ur-schrecklich! Die Männer haben solche Blicke gehabt. Ich habe gedacht, oh

Gott, wie schauen sie mich an! Da wollten immer Männer vergewaltigen. Mich und mein Kind. Die haben einfach Lust gehabt, das zu machen.

R: Und ich kann mir vorstellen, wie du es an ihren Augen sehen kannst.

K: Ja, genau.

R: Das ist schrecklich. Aber euch ist nichts passiert?

K: Nein, gar nichts. Zum Glück. [Lacht.]

Dann sind wir von Istanbul bis Izmir auch mit einem Bus gefahren. Auch dieser Bus war übertoll. Ich glaube, in diesem Bus waren 500 Leute.

R: Oh Gott.

K: Ja. Stell dir vor, du bist eine muslimische Frau. Da darfst du nicht neben einem Mann sitzen, aber du warst so [zeigt zusammengekauerte Haltung]. Außerdem war mein Kind auf meinem Schoß. Wir saßen die ganze Zeit. Mit Rückenschmerzen. Knieschmerzen.

R: Alles Schmerzen.

K: Genau. Und so stressig. Nervige Männer. Und das Kind auch. Sie hat jede Stunde geweint: „Ich habe Hunger. Ich will spielen.“ – Immer musste ich sagen: „Das geht nicht.“ [Stockt.] Ein Kind braucht [stockt] einen ruhigen Tag, um im Bett zu liegen oder auf den Spielplatz zu gehen, aber das geht nicht. Es war viel zu kalt. Keine Ruhe. Kein gutes Essen. Kein Zimmer zum Ausruhen. In einem kleinen Zimmer tausend Männer. Keine Frau oder eine Familie.

R: Wahnsinn.

K: Ja, es war ur-schrecklich. Und dann ins Meer. Ich glaube, es war Oktober. Wir mussten mit einem Boot fahren und es gab nur ein Boot. Und 75 Personen sind eingestiegen. Und in der Mitte vom Meer haben Leute auf dem Boot begonnen um einen Platz zu streiten. Dann ist das Boot umgekehrt.

R: Ja, das wackelt dann ganz kräftig...

K: Nein, es ist wirklich umgekehrt. Wir waren alle im Wasser. Mitten in der Nacht war das. Es war so kalt.

R: Ihr könnte beide schwimmen?

K: Nein, nein, ich konnte nicht schwimmen. Niemand konnte schwimmen. Nur der Mann, der Anführer, konnte ein bisschen schwimmen. Aber Gott sei Dank, hatte ich zwei Schwimmwesten gekauft. Aber es war sehr schlechtes Material.

R: Und dann seid ihr wahrscheinlich von Küstenwache gerettet worden?!

K: Ja. Und dann waren wir drei oder fünf? Ich konnte nicht mehr. Wir sind ganz lange im Wasser geschwommen. Ich habe meine Tochter verloren im Wasser. Jemand hatte mir geholfen, damit ich an den Strand komme und ich bin noch einmal ins Meer gegangen, um

meine Tochter zu finden. Ich wollte nicht ein Leben ohne meine Tochter. Und ich habe ein paar Leute auch gerettet. Und zum Schluss. Zum Schluss habe ich meine Tochter gefunden, Gott sei Dank.

Ja, sie war furchtbar krank. Dort war das Rote Kreuz. Aber sie durften nicht helfen. Sie dürfen nicht helfen, solange die Flüchtlinge im Wasser sind.

R: Oh Gott.

K: Ja. Es gab hier Strand und auf der nächsten Zeile... Es war wie die Wienzeile. Dort war das Rote Kreuz. Aber wir mussten einfach bis dorthin gehen. Sie durften nicht nach vorn kommen. Und dann sind wir hingegangen.

R: Diese Regel für das Rote Kreuz. Ist das eine Regel von der Türkei?

K: Ich glaube schon. Und dann sind wir dorthin gegangen. Und dann hat uns das Rote Kreuz Second-Hand-Kleidung geschenkt. Wir haben unsere Kleidung umgetauscht. Denn die war ja voll nass und es war voll kalt. Und ein bisschen Essen. Da war ein Toastbrot. Mit den Schnecken. Schnecken? Schnicken?

R: Schinken?

K: Ja, mit Schinken. Und ein bisschen Käse.

R: Putenschinken hoffentlich. Nicht Schweineschinken.

K: Ja. ... [Beginnt zu lachen.] Ich weiß nicht. Wir haben das gegessen.

R: Es war sicher Putenschinken. Soviel haben sie schon verstanden.

K: Ja. Und dann haben wir das gegessen. Und dann haben wir in einem Zelt geschlafen. In Griechenland. Kirimi? Kiritimi? Kirimiti? ... Diese Insel heißt Kirimiti.

R: Ich muss das googeln.

K: Kirimiti. Oder so ähnlich, glaube ich. Ich erinnere mich nicht so gut...

R: Mytilene?

K: Ja, Mytilene! Mytilene war die Insel! Ja, ungefähr.

R: Ich werde einmal nachsehen, wie die Inseln dort heißen.

K: Ja, es war sehr schrecklich! Mit tausend gefährlichen Männern. Mit einem kleinen Kind, das auch krank war. Mit so vielen... mhhhm.

R: Und vor allen Dingen alles so wahnsinnig gefährlich! Und du hast ja vorher gewusst, dass das gefährlich wird. Also musst du dir Österreich oder Europa generell ganz, ganz toll vorgestellt haben. Denn andernfalls machst du das ja alles nicht.

K: Mhhhm.

R: Also, was hast du erwartet? Was hast du gehofft, dass du findest in Europa?

K: Also... Mein Mann ist gestorben und dann gehört das Kind... Es geht automatisch zu der Familie von meinem Mann.

R: Das ist ein islamisches Gesetz, hast du mir vorhin gesagt?!

K: Ja, das ist ein islamisches Gesetz.

R: Das heißt, das gibt es nicht nur in Afghanistan, sondern auch im Iran.

K: Ja, auch im Iran. Und das ist so: Das Kind geht automatisch zu den Großeltern und ich habe es voll schrecklich gefunden, weil das Kind verliert gleichzeitig Mutter und Vater. Ne?

R: Mhhmmm.

K: Verliert ein ganz normales Leben. Sie wird die Schule verlieren. Sie darf nicht in die Schule gehen, weil für ein Flüchtlingskind im Iran kostet die Schule etwas. Es ist nicht gratis! Ne? – Und dann zwei ältere Menschen. Sie können nicht arbeiten. Das heißt, sie können nicht für den Ausweis zahlen. Sie können nicht für die Schule zahlen. Das heißt, sie bleibt die ganze Zeit zu Hause und dann die zwei älteren Menschen kümmern. Und das heißt, sie muss eine Bedienerin sein. Die ganze Zeit!

Und ich habe das schrecklich gefunden. Und dann wenn die zwei älteren Menschen, die Großeltern, sterben, dann bekommt sie automatisch so einen Mann. Zum Heiraten. Was heißt, sie kann sich einen Mann für ihr Leben nicht aussuchen. Wenn sie ihren Mann nicht versteht, dann muss sie es einfach aushalten. Und ihr ganzes, ganzes Leben wird wirklich schrecklich. Ich musste eine Lösung finden, um mein Kind zu retten!

R: Ach, du bist toll, K!

K: Ja, ich hab auch gehört, dass man in Europa in Freiheit leben kann. Man kann arbeiten. Man kann ... Ich hab mir vorgestellt, ich kann mit meinem Kind wohnen, leben, ganz normal. Ich kann arbeiten. Ich kann die Sprache lernen. Ich kann nicht gut Deutsch, aber ich hab's wirklich...

R: Doch, sehr gutes Deutsch! Wirklich.

K: [Lächelt.] Danke.

R: Und haben sich deine Vorstellungen erfüllt. Also, ist Österreich jetzt so ungefähr, wie du dir das gedacht hast, bevor du gegangen bist?

K: Eigentlich schon. Mein Ziel war nicht Österreich, sondern einfach generell Europa. Und, ja, ich bin angekommen und konnte nicht mehr weitergehen. Ich war auch selbst krank. Ich konnte es nicht mehr. Ich hab mir gedacht: Na, ich kann nicht mehr einen Fortschritt gehen. Ich muss irgendwo jetzt sitzen. Und bleiben. Und ich bin geblieben. Und ich hab einfach versucht, so Deutsch zu lernen. Und eine Ausbildung zu machen.

R: Das ist einfach toll.

K: Danke.

R: Was hatten wir noch geplant? Wir hatten noch geplant: Du hast vorhin schon angesprochen, du hast dir vorgestellt, dass man in Freiheit leben kann. Was bedeutet Freiheit für dich? Was ist deine eigene Form von Freiheit?

K: Ich finde, Freiheit, das heißt, wenn man arbeitet und verdient genug, um ein normales Leben zu haben. Ne? Und das ist die Freiheit, wenn ich die ganze Woche arbeite, ohne Angst zu haben um mein Kind. Jetzt am Wochenende zum Beispiel mit meinem Kind auf diesem Spielplatz sein zu dürfen. Und mein Kind spielt wie ein normales Kind. Und ich bleibe ganz ruhig. Und dann tief atmen und sagen: „Es ist alles schon vorbei! Ne?“ – Ich habe keine Angst, keinen Stress, mein Kind zu verlieren. Keine Angst, um ihr zukünftiges Leben. Sie hat schon jetzt ein ganz normales Leben. Sie geht in die Schule. Alles ist normal.

R: Dann ist diese Frage jetzt eigentlich unsinnig. Aber ich stelle dir die Frage trotzdem. Ich stelle dir die Frage, was ist das Wertvollste in deinem Leben?

K: [Lächelt.] Das Wertvollste in meinem Leben ist meine Tochter. Sie ist mein ganzes Leben. Was ich habe in einem ganzen Leben, das ist eine Tochter. Das. Ne? – Sie geht in die Schule jeden Tag. Sie wächst ganz normal heran. Sie studiert. Alles. Mit der Zeit. Ne? Sie heiratet. Sie bekommt Kinder und ich arbeite die ganze Zeit und unterstütze meine Tochter.

R: Wow.

K: Mhhmm.

R: Und das sind solche Chancen, die im Iran oder auch in Afghanistan – wie zum Beispiel zur Schule zu gehen, sich ganz normal zu entwickeln, am Spielplatz zu spielen usw. – das sind so Chancen, die in Afghanistan oder im Iran nur die Männer beziehungsweise die Buben, die männlichen Kinder, und dann später die Männer haben. Aber woher kommt das, dass Männer schon ab ihrer Geburt – nur weil sie Männer sind – mehr Rechte haben als die Frauen? Kommt das vom Islam? Oder kommt das von der Tradition? Woher kommt das?

K: Eigentlich weiß ich auch nicht, woher das kommt. Aber es ist GAR NICHT islamisches Gesetz. Es ist gar nicht islamisches Gesetz. Aber es ist einfach so erziehend... Wie heißt das?

R: Erzogen?

K: Ja, in der Familie.

R: Ja, okay, die Kinder werden einfach so erzogen, aber es sind doch die Frauen, die die Kinder erziehen, oder?! Also eigentlich haben dann doch die Frauen die Macht, alles zu machen und die Kinder anders zu erziehen, oder?!

K: Ja. Aber sie verstehen nicht. Ich glaube, das sind die ungebildeten Frauen.

Parkwartin: So, ich sperr jetzt zu!

R: Oh, ist es denn schon 19 Uhr?

Parkwartin: Ja, gleich, aber wenn das Licht brennt, dann gehen die Mäuse schlafen.

R: Wir machen grade ein Interview. Wir machen noch zwei Sätze fertig.

Parkwartin: Ja, ich komm dann da hin, also wenn Sie da rausgehen, ham Sie noch 1 Minute.

R: Gehen wir da raus?

K: Ja.

R: Okay, danke.

Wir waren an einem wichtigen Punkt: K, wenn du sagst: Es ist so, weil die Gesellschaft so erzogen ist. Das ist eine Sache der Erziehung. Dann müssten ja die Frauen alle Macht haben, das zu ändern, weil sie die Kinder erziehen.

K: Ja, aber sie sind die frühe, die letzte Generation. Sie waren einfach ungebildet. Sie haben gar nicht gewusst, dass ... es würde bei uns als Mädchen auch passieren... sie haben einfach den Bub erzogen wie ...

R: Den Buben erzogen wie einen Bub und das Mädchen erzogen wie ein Mädchen?

K: Ja, genau!

R: Und das machen sie, weil sie einfach nicht gebildet sind.

K: Ja.

R: Und deshalb, weil sie nicht gebildet sind, können sie sich gar nicht vorstellen, dass es ganz, ganz anders sein kann.

K: Ja, genau!

R: Das ist Wahnsinn, K!

K: Ja, das ist Wahnsinn.

R: Bildung.

K: Ja, Bildung ist wirklich sehr, sehr wichtig.

R: Das ist der Schlüssel. Aber du hast schon sehr viel gemacht für deine Tochter. Sie wird einmal Matura machen und studieren...

K: [Lächelt.] Ja.

Tochter: Bitte komm, Mama!

R: Vielen, lieben Dank, liebe K!

K: [Lächelt.] Biiiiitte!

8.1.8. Qualitative interview No. 6 with a former fellow of Voice of America in Kabul
/ Afghanistan, talk in the rooms of her cultural association in Vienna

Interview with a female trainee of TV production at oe24TV, unattached, no children, well-experienced TV-journalist of Voice of America, October 14th 2018, talk in the rooms of her cultural association in Vienna, with interviewee No. 4 giving company

R: So, das Gerät läuft. Ich spreche heute mit N, mit der ich schon einmal gesprochen habe, und mit T [Nachname]. Spreche ich [Nachname] richtig aus?

T: Ja, [Nachname], ja, sehr gut.

R: Moment, [Nachname]. Also hatte ich das doch falsch ausgesprochen.

T: Ja, wir sagen [Nachname], aber Deutsch ist richtig [Nachname].

R: Also, T [Nachname], wenn ich das jetzt richtig versuche auszusprechen. Sie ist seit vier Monaten als Videojournalistin bei oe24 angestellt.

Und wir kamen vorhin jetzt auf das Ding mit dem Namen. Die Frauennamen haben wir besprochen, weil ich das ja schon ungewöhnlich fand, dass eine Frau aus Afghanistan T heißt mit Vornamen. Damit sind wir dann drauf gekommen, T, dass das ja auch mit deiner Familie ein bisschen was zu tun hat. Weil die Familie eine doch gebildetere Familie ist und die ja doch tendenziell, so ist deine Beobachtung, tendenziell in Afghanistan eher dazu neigen, westliche Namen – oder zumindest nicht islamische Namen, vielleicht auch persische – zu geben. Magst du das für mich jetzt bitte noch einmal kurz zusammenfassen? Welche Namen tendenziell gegeben werden von welchen Familien. Und dann ganz, ganz kurz zum background deiner Familie ein bisschen etwas sagen?

T: Okay, sehr gut. Die Namen haben zu tun mit Bildung, meiner Meinung nach. Mit Bildung, mit Hintergrund von Familien und so weiter. Und auch mit ethnischen Gruppen, meine ich. Weil die persischen Leute, die ausgebildeten persischen Leute wollen die persischen Namen, die alten persischen Namen geben. Zum Beispiel Bakhtash oder Siovasch. Oder Manija. Mit [dsche]. Alles mit [dsche]. Sie wollen alte persische Namen geben, aber die afghanischen Leute, die unausgebildet sind, oder manche, die ein bisschen religiös sind, die wollen zum Beispiel islamische Namen aus dem Koran geben und so weiter. Das hat ein bisschen mit Bildung zu tun auch, auch mit ethnischer Gruppe und auch mit Bildung.

Also zum Beispiel meine Familie ist ausgebildet. Meine Mutter und mein Vater sind ausgebildet. Mein Vater hat in Deutschland studiert und meine Mutter hat genau auch studiert. Und dann waren sie sehr ausgebildet. Mein Vater hat in Potsdam studiert. Sozialismus hat mein Vater studiert. Genau.

Und deswegen die haben internationale Namen für uns gegeben. Zum Beispiel meiner Schwester haben sie Lisa gegeben, mir T, meinen zwei Brüdern hat meine Mutter alte persische Namen gegeben. Zum Beispiel Kambis und Paris. Sie sind die alten Könige von Persien. Das ist der Hintergrund von diesen Namen in Afghanistan.

R: Vielen, lieben Dank, T! Da habe ich nur noch eine kurze Zwischenfrage: Was haben deine Eltern da gemacht? Das ist ja hoch spannend: Dein Papa hat Soziologie studiert?

T: Sozialismus! Mein Papa hat Sozialismus studiert!

R: Also wirklich das politische System Sozialismus?

T: Ja, genau, das politische System.

Mein Vater war ein Politiker und mein Vater war auch ein Journalist. Mein Vater hat in den letzten Jahren als, ich glaube in den letzten 17 oder 15 Jahren vor seinem Tod, hat er als Journalist gearbeitet.

R: Und deine Mama? Was hat sie studiert?

T: Meine Mutter hat – wie kann ich sagen? Ich weiß es nicht auf Deutsch -, aber meine Mutter war ein – wie kann man teacher sagen?

R: Ja, Lehrerin!

Sie hat Lehramt studiert.

T: Lehramt studiert, genau.

R: Und auch als Lehrerin gearbeitet?

T: Ja, meine Mutter hat als Lehrerin gearbeitet bis die Mujahedin gekommen sind. Aber nach den Mujahedin hat meine Mutter interessiert, sich nicht mehr zu arbeiten. Leider. Weil die Gesellschaft und das System dann sehr schlecht waren. Die Frauen mussten dann Kopftuch tragen, die Frauen mussten diesen Hijab tragen. Deshalb hat sich meine Mutter nicht interessiert, so nach draußen zu gehen und so weiter. Und deswegen hat meine Mutter das nicht weiter gemacht.

R: Das ist so schade und das ist kein Einzelschicksal, wie ich weiß. Das war 1992 als die Mujahedin an die Macht gekommen sind.

T: Genau, 1992. Und 1996 sind die Taliban gekommen.

R: Ja, und spannend ist, dass die Mujahedin von einigen in Afghanistan ja positiv gesehen werden. Also grade Ahmad Sha Masood. Ja, jeder denkt sich: ‚Oh, der Löwe von Panshir. Er ist so toll!‘ – Aber es gibt aus feministischer Perspektive sogar gegenteilige Berichte, nämlich sogar dass er ... also ... er hat auf alle Fälle von Vergewaltigungen von Frauen gewusst.

T: Richtig!

R: Er hat es gewusst und toleriert, dass seine Männer Frauen vergewaltigen und zwar systematisch.

T: Während der Mujahedin-Regierung wurden in den ersten paar Jahren viele Frauen in Kabul - in Kabul im Speziellen weil in Kabul waren viele Frauen sehr demokratisch und so – viele Frauen wurden vergewaltigt. Ja. Und die Frauen haben auch... Manche konnten nicht in allen Bereichen arbeiten. Zum Beispiel als Piloten hatten wir keine Frauen mehr. Oder beim Sport waren die Frauen nicht tätig. Als Sängerinnen haben die Frauen nicht mehr gearbeitet. Als Flugbegleiterinnen auch nicht.

Das bedeutet, die Frauen haben verloren. Viele verloren ihre Arbeit, als die Mujahedin nach Afghanistan gekommen sind. Und die Frauen mussten Kopftuch tragen. Sie mussten sich verhüllen. Sie können nicht zum Beispiel einen kurzen Rock tragen oder ohne Kopftuch nach draußen gehen. Oder ärmellose Kleidung tragen...

R: Vor dem Hintergrund welcher Ideologie haben die Mujahedin das gemacht? Die Mujahedin waren ja schon betont islamisch, oder?!

T: Genau, ja, sie haben afghanische Regierungen gebracht in Afghanistan. Unsere Regierung wurde islamisch und deswegen wurde alles verändert.

R: Okay, im großen, globalen Kontext ist das dann schon wieder genau diese Konstellation der Sowjetunion, die zwar zum diesem Zeitpunkt schon zerbröckelt, ja, 1989 fällt die Mauer in Berlin usw., aber du hast immer noch dieses Sowjetunion-Konstrukt, eben dein Vater hat Sozialismus sogar noch studiert, du hast den Kommunismus und da dagegen hat sich aufgebaut: der Islam.

So.

Das sind diese zwei Pole. Und dann hat man gesagt: Okay, wenn wir die Kommunisten aus Afghanistan rausbringen, dann kommen natürlich die Islamisten.

Das erschien wie eine logische Konsequenz.

Und daraus sind dann die Taliban entstanden...

Dann haben wir dieses Thema jetzt zusammengefasst.

Was mir dazu noch einfällt, T, du bist sehr, sehr gebildet.

T: Danke!

R: Ja, also so objektiv wie möglich meine ich das ernst. Mich würde interessieren: Hat dein Vater das aktiv gefördert? Wer in der Familie hat deine Ausbildung am meisten gefördert?

T: Mein Vater. Denn mein Vater hat sich auch gebildet. Und er wollte, dass die Frauen so viel Freiheit haben. Zum Beispiel hat er immer für mich meine Reden geschrieben. Als ich sieben

Jahre alt war, hat mich mein Vater immer zu großen Veranstaltungen mitgenommen und hatte eine Rede für mich geschrieben. Und ich bin auf die Bühne und habe gesprochen.

R: Wow!

T: Ab diesem Zeitpunkt hat mein Vater angefangen, mich auszubilden. Bis jetzt. Und deshalb bin ich eine Moderatorin geworden. Weil mein Vater mich von Kindheit an immer auf die Bühne gebracht hat. Er hatte so einen Charakter.

Meine Mutter war auch sehr gut. Meine Mutter wollte auch, dass ich studiere, dass ich sehr schöne Kleidung trage. Zum Beispiel: Ich darf NIE einen Rock tragen. Das [zeigt auf ihre Kleidung] ist der erste Rock, den ich mir in meinem Leben gekauft habe! Weißt du das?

[N und R lachen und beglückwünschen.]

T: Meine Mutter wollte nicht, dass ich Rock trage, weil das ist nicht modern.

R: Konservativ.

T: Ja, konservativ! Wir müssen immer Jeans tragen. Jeans tragen und wie ein Mädchen sein, nicht wie eine alte Frau mit Rock. Meine Mutter wollte das nicht. Wenn ich in Afghanistan einen Rock wollte, dann hat meine Mutter immer Witze gemacht: ‚Warum trägst du das? Bist du eine alte Frau?‘ – Damit ich das nicht mehr will.

Meine Mutter war auch sehr modern. Sie wollte, dass wir schöne Kleider tragen und so weiter. Und mein Vater hat mir in der Ausbildung sehr geholfen.

Meine Mutter hat uns auch als Kinder immer unterrichtet. Wir waren alle Kinder von meiner Mutter, alle, waren immer von erster bis zwölfter Klasse auf der ersten Position in der Klasse. Wir waren immer erste. Nicht zweite Position.

Aber als die Taliban gekommen waren, mussten wir nach Pakistan flüchten. Ja, und dort gab es ein bisschen Schwierigkeiten. Aber trotzdem: Dort hat mein Vater auch viele kulturelle Veranstaltungen gemacht. In der Schule und so weiter.

Auch dort hat mein Vater für mich geschrieben und ich war auf der Bühne und habe etwas präsentiert. Oder gesprochen über etwas. Da hat das alles angefangen bis jetzt.

Und mein Vater hat auch mich engagiert: Ich war elfte Klasse in der Schule. Wir lernen bis zwölfte Klasse. In der elften Klasse hat mein Vater begonnen, dass ich für newspapers, für Magazine schreibe. Und mein Vater hat mir beigebracht, wie man [Artikel] schreibt.

Ich habe meine erste Geschichte in der elften Klasse geschrieben und der Frauenzeitung gegeben. Und dann habe ich begonnen, mich für Journalismus zu interessieren.

In Afghanistan ist es so: Wir können nicht selbst entscheiden, auf welche Universität wir gehen. Weil wir früher nur eine Universität in Afghanistan hatten, die Kabul Universität. Früher war das so, heute gibt es viele Universitäten. Früher gab es nur diese eine Universität, das ist die

Kabul Universität. Von überall aus Afghanistan mussten die Studierenden in diese Universität gehen. Und das war sehr schwierig! Und da gab es eine große Aufnahmeprüfung. Und bei dieser Aufnahmeprüfung wählen wir zum Beispiel fünf oder sechs Universitäten [gemeint sind offenbar ‚Studiengänge/-programme‘; Anmerkung], zum Beispiel Journalismus oder Law oder Geschichte und so weiter. Und ich habe vier ausgewählt. Das erste war Medizin, das zweite war Politik, das dritte war Wirtschaft und das vierte war Journalismus. Ich bin auf das vierte heruntergefallen und die haben mir das vierte gegeben. Ich wollte aber nicht das studieren. Journalismus. Und ich wollte, ich wollte Law. Ich interessiere mich zwar für Journalismus, aber ich wollte Law studieren und politische Wissenschaft.

R: Weil es so angesehen ist, oder?!

T: Genau!

R: Ja, in Österreich auch.

T: Ja, und dann hat mein Vater gesagt: ‚Nein, du kannst ruhig Journalismus studieren, denn Journalismus hat eine Verbindung mit Politik.‘ – Dann habe ich mich eingetragen und so weiter.

R: Das ist absolut genial, T! Und jetzt bist du in Österreich. – Sehr erfolgreich!

T: Dankeschön!

R: Interessant wäre jetzt eigentlich noch die Wünsche, die Träume. Oder?

N [lachend]: Ja!

R: Träume. Ideen. Was wünschst du dir für dich? Wo siehst du dich in Zukunft? Ist da noch so ein großes Ziel?

T: Das ist ein bisschen schwierig. In Österreich kann man manchmal nicht erreichen, was wir wollen. Es ist ein bisschen schwer für eine Asylwerberin. Das ist ein bisschen schwer.

Wenn es in meinem Land wäre, dann könnte ich vielleicht eine Ministerin sein und so weiter. Ich hatte immer dieses Ziel.

Aber hier ist das ein bisschen schwer.

Ich möchte ein Online-Fernsehen machen in fünf Jahren zum Beispiel. Ich will ein Online-Fernsehen für geflüchtete Menschen aus Afghanistan machen. Ich will das für ganz Europa. Ich habe schon angefangen, manche Aktivitäten in diesem Bereich [zu setzen]. Zum Beispiel unterrichte ich hier in meinem Verein [Interkulturelles Entwicklungszentrum; Anmerkung] eine Journalismus-Klasse. In fünf Jahren habe ich das Ziel, das Online-Fernsehen aufzubauen. Das ist mein erstes Ziel. Und dann...

[N lacht.]

R: N bewirbt sich gleich.

T: Genau, ich will all diese ausgebildeten afghanischen Frauen, die in Österreich nichts machen können. Ich will diese Frauen oder Männer in diesem Fernsehen engagieren.

Das andere Ziel. – Wie soll ich sagen? – Der andere Grund ist, dass ich diese afghanischen Asylwerberinnen und Asylwerber oder anerkannte Flüchtlinge der österreichischen Gesellschaft präsentieren will. Denn wir haben genug ausgebildete oder wir haben genug talentierte Flüchtlinge, geflüchtete Menschen aus Afghanistan hier. Aber die haben ihre Wege verloren!

Die haben ihre Wege... Sie wissen nicht, von welchem Weg wir können anfangen. Das ist sehr schwierig. Weil sie sind alleine, es gibt keinen Berater, Betreuer oder Familie. Die Kinder oder die Jugendlichen haben keine Betreuung, um ihre Wege zu finden. Und deswegen will ich diese talentierten geflüchteten Menschen präsentieren – für die österreichische Gesellschaft.

Und der andere Grund ist, dass geflüchtete Menschen leider immer ein negatives Image hier in Österreich haben. Denn über die kleinen Kriminalitätssachen berichten die Medien, aber wenn sie sehr erfolgreich sind in anderen Bereichen, wird das nicht gesehen, es wird nicht berichtet. Und deswegen will ich solch positive Nachrichten in die Medien bringen. Und ich sage: Okay, es gibt fünf Prozent negative Nachrichten, aber 95 Prozent positive Nachrichten!

Eine kleine Kriminalität wird sehr groß berichtet, sehr international oder national berichtet, aber eine sehr große positive [Sache] nicht. Auch in einer kleinen Zeitung wird nicht berichtet.

Zum Beispiel ein Kollege, ein afghanischer Mann, er heißt Amir Zahel. Er hat für Österreich eine goldene Medaille in Kickboxen gewonnen. Bei der Europameisterschaft. Im Namen von Österreich! Aber ich habe noch keine Sendung gesehen, die über Amir Zahel etwas berichtet. Warum?

Wenn sie eine kleine Kriminalität berichten, warum berichten sie dann nicht über einen großen Erfolg.

Das ist – wie soll ich sagen? – ein bisschen unfair meiner Meinung nach. Und deswegen will ich diese talentierten Leute in die Medien bringen.

Denn ich kann nicht alleine in den Medien etwas machen. Ich kann nicht. Ich bin nur alleine. Was soll ich machen?

Wenn wir zum Beispiel viele ausgebildete Journalisten in den Medien tätig machen, dann können wir zum Beispiel überall in allen Medien arbeiten.

R: Ja.

T: Zum Beispiel ich kann nur in meinem Fernsehen [oe24TV; Anmerkung] ein bisschen etwas ändern. Zum Beispiel wenn ich mit den Leuten spreche, wenn sie mein Talent sehen, wenn sie mein Aussehen sehen [T trägt das Haar prinzipiell offen und meist figurbetonte Kleidung;

Anmerkung], wenn sie alles überall sehen. Dann sagen: „Aha, wir haben so etwas gedacht von Afghanistan. Aber das ist auch so. Aha!“

N: Oh ja!

T: Also, das ist so. Ich kann ein bisschen Meinungen ändern, aber ich bin nur alleine. Wenn ich zum Beispiel viele Journalisten ausbilde und sie dann in den österreichischen Medien präsentiere, dann können wir vielleicht etwas machen.

R: Wow, T, letzte Frage: Weil N vorher sagte, ihr tut es so Leid, dass so viele Frauen zu Hause sind.

N: Aha, ja. Mir tut es sehr weh. Immer.

R: Und mir geht es auch so. Und mir fällt auch auf, dass du Recht hast, N, dass halt viele – wie du sagst – zu Hause sitzen. Und das hat nichts damit zu tun, dass sie nicht gescheit sind. Aber sie sitzen trotzdem zu Hause.

N: Richtig.

R: Und da denkt man sich schon, woher kommt denn das? Warum verkriechen sich die so zu Hause? Und eine Erklärung, ja, habe ich schon selbst: Frauen sind traditionell für die Erziehung der Kinder, den Haushalt etc. etc. verantwortlich – die Männer sehen das so und die Frauen glauben ihnen das auch. Ja, dann bleibt man mehr zu Hause. N, du weißt das, wenn man dann mal ein paar Kinder hat und einen Ehemann und muss sich um alles kümmern.

N: Ja, stimmt.

R: Ist schon klar! Das kann ich auch nachvollziehen.

Was mich interessiert ist: Woher kommt denn das?

Und, T, da hast du eigentlich vorhin ganz interessante Sachen dazu gesagt.

N: Genau.

T: Ja, richtig. Unser Problem war seit diesen circa 40 Jahren im Krieg, dass die islamischen Regierungen nach Afghanistan gekommen sind. Diese Regierungen haben verursacht, dass die meisten Frauen zu Hause geblieben sind. Weil zum Beispiel in den abgelegenen Gebieten keine Sicherheit herrschte. Wenn keine Sicherheit gewährleistet ist, wie kann eine Frau dann nach draußen gehen? Wie kann sie arbeiten? Oder zur Schule gehen? Oder studieren?

Also, Sicherheit ist eines dieser Probleme.

Das zweite war, dass diese Regierungen sehr konservativ waren. Die haben verursacht, dass die Frauen Kopftuch tragen müssen, dass sie sich verhüllen müssen. Und deswegen wollten manche Frauen nicht draußen arbeiten. Zum Beispiel meine Mutter war eine von diesen Frauen. Meine Mutter will nicht zum Beispiel mit Hijab und so nach draußen gehen zum Arbeiten. Gut? Aber manche Frauen waren so. Manche Frauen haben ihr Land verlassen und sind in andere Länder

gereist, denn sie wollten nicht zum Beispiel in einem sehr konservativen Land arbeiten. Und manche Arbeiten waren auch verboten für Frauen in islamischen Regierungen. Zum Beispiel manche Frauen konnten nicht mehr als Sängerinnen arbeiten. Oder als Flugbegleiterinnen. Oder als Pilotinnen oder als Taxi- oder Busfahrerinnen durften sie nicht mehr arbeiten. Deswegen sind viele Frauen zu Hause geblieben.

Und das andere war, dass islamische Regierungen versucht haben, durch Propaganda durchzusetzen, dass die Männer verursachen, dass die Frauen nur für zu Hause da sind. Nicht in der Gesellschaft.

R: Genau. Es geht mir um diese Trennung: öffentlich und privat. Das heißt, es hat begonnen mit dieser islamischen Regierung im Jahr 1992 oder schon vorher?

T: Nein, 1992 hat es begonnen. Und es hat auch von der Regierung keine gesellschaftlichen oder kulturellen Programme für Frauen gegeben. Sie haben das nicht unterstützt. Sie haben das nicht gefördert.

Und deswegen – von 1992 bis jetzt [2018; Anmerkung], das dauert noch immer! – und deswegen ist unsere Gesellschaft verändert. Die Männer wurden konservativer. Zum Beispiel mein Vater und meine Brüder sind unterschiedlicher Meinung. Denn meine Brüder sind in einer islamischen Regierung aufgewachsen. Mein Vater war nicht unter einer islamischen oder konservativen Regierung. Also diese zwei Generationen haben unterschiedliche Meinungen. Und deswegen verursachen unsere neuen Generationen, dass die Frauen nicht aktiv in der Gesellschaft sein dürfen. Weil wenn – zum Beispiel – eine Frau für ihre Rechte kämpfen will, dann entweder tötet der Mann seine Frau oder er lässt sich scheiden. Oder er macht Probleme für diese Frau. Also die Frau muss ruhig bleiben, muss zu Hause bleiben, muss nicht aktiv sein in der Gesellschaft. Also all das kommt von unseren Regierungen. Die Generation ist immer von den Regierungen verändert worden.

R: Zwei Sätze noch. Das ist nämlich hochinteressant: Dein Vater war viel liberaler als es deine Brüder sind.

T: Richtig.

R: Wann ist der Vater geboren? Ungefähr. Und wann sind die Brüder ungefähr geboren?

T: Meine Brüder sind vier bis fünf Jahre jünger als ich.

R: Okay, das heißt, sie sind circa 1990 geboren?

T: So etwas. Und mein Papa ist circa 1945 geboren.

R: Liebe T, damit wars das. Vielen Dank! N, vielen Dank für deine Begleitung.

N: Gerne.

T: Gerne. Gerne.

R: Vielen Dank fürs Reden, für die Offenheit. Für alles! Vielen Dank!

T: Danke. Danke dir auch.

8.2. Form of the Questionnaire in English

Questionnaire

This questionnaire is part of the research project on “**Patterns of consciousness formation among women belonging to the Dari-speaking Afghan Diasporas of Austria and Pakistan**”.

The questionnaire consists of two parts:

- A. Remembering your life in Afghanistan: daily tasks, most valuable aspects
- B. Registration of your basic data

This questionnaire can be filled anonymously. I guarantee for the safety of all your data!
Thank you for supporting my research!

A. Remembering your life in Afghanistan

1. Within your last 2 years in Afghanistan, which were your main, daily tasks in the household?

.....

.....

1.1 How much of your daily homework was dedicated to your children? Please, mark the applicable with a cross.

- ☐ less than 5 hours per day
- ☐ approx. 5 hours per day
- ☐ more than 5 hours per day
- ☐ I hadn't (yet) children back then.

1.2 Did you have to do other care work? Please, specify for whom you cared. [Example: **for my mother, 5 years long**]

.....

.....

1.3 How much time per day did you spend with care work mentioned above? Please, mark the applicable with a cross.

- ☐ less than 3 hours per day
- ☐ approx. 3 hours per day
- ☐ more than 3 hours per day

2. Did you live in a vital qawm? Please mark the applicable with a cross.

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

2.1 How many persons did belong to it?

- ☐ approximately 10 persons
 - ☐ approximately 20 persons
 - ☐ approximately 30 persons
 - ☐ more than 30 persons
- 2.2 How many blood relatives were among them?
- ☐ less than the half of the group
 - ☐ approximately the half of the group
 - ☐ more than the half of the group

3. Which of the following groups were the most present in your ordinary life?

- ☐ Family
- ☐ Qawm
- ☐ Village Community
- ☐ Ethnic group
- ☐ Afghans in general
- ☐ None of these

4. Which of the following groups were the most valuable to you (during your life in Afghanistan and **regardless** of your recent perception)?

- ☐ Family
- ☐ Qawm
- ☐ Village Community
- ☐ Ethnic group
- ☐ Afghans in general
- ☐ None of these

5. How much time per day did you spend with neighbors?

- ☐ less than 3 hours per day
- ☐ approx. 3 hours per day
- ☐ more than 3 hours per day

6. How much time per day did you spend with your husband?

- ☐ less than 3 hours per day
- ☐ approx. 3 hours per day
- ☐ more than 3 hours per day
- ☐ I haven't been married back then.

7. How many times have you been in the capital Kabul?

.....

7.1 For how long? – Multiple answers possible.

- ☐ a few days only
- ☐ between 2 and 12 weeks
- ☐ between 4 and 12 months
- ☐ more than 1 year

8. Have you ever travelled **alone** through Afghanistan?

- ☐ Yes, often.

- ☐ Yes, seldomly.
- ☐ Yes, one time.
- ☐ No, never.

8.1 If you like to specify, which was/were the incentive(s)?

.....

.....

9. For how many years have you attended a school?

.....

9.1 Have you graduated from your school?

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

10. Within the last 2 years you spent in Afghanistan, did you exercise a profession outside the house?

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

10.1 If yes, which one?

.....

11. Have you been part of a women's solidarity group? For example, for sports, organizing meetings etc.

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

11.1 If yes, please enter a short description. [like **women's football club**]

.....

12. How much time did you have for prayer each day?

- ☐ altogether 25 minutes
- ☐ altogether approximately 1 hour
- ☐ more than 1 hour

13. How many times per week did you go to the mosque?

- ☐ once per week
- ☐ 1 to 3 times per week
- ☐ 5 times per week
- ☐ daily

14. Have you ever felt to be disadvantaged because of your gender?

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

14.1 If you like to specify, please describe the situation(s):

.....

.....

.....

15. Which aspects of your ordinary life fulfilled the image of a **traditional** life?

.....

.....

.....

16. Which aspects of your ordinary life fulfilled the image of an **emancipated** life?

.....

.....

.....

17. Within your last 2 years in Afghanistan, how often have you listened a (national/religious/hero...) narrative?

- ☐ approximately once per week
- ☐ approximately once per month
- ☐ a few times per year
- ☐ very seldomly or never

17.1 You might remember the theme(s)?

.....

18. Did you have leisure time weekly?

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

19. Did you spend parts of that time with reading Afghan poetry?

- ☐ Yes, regularly.
- ☐ Yes, approximately every second week.
- ☐ Yes, approximately once per month.
- ☐ No.

20. Have you ever written a poem yourself?

- ☐ Yes.
- ☐ No.

21. Finally, you are asked to describe yourself in terms of character traits: In just one sentence, which is / are your most individual feature(s)?

.....
.....
.....
22. Which circumstances of ordinary life make you feel good?
.....
.....
.....

B. Registration of your data

Date of Birth Day Month Year

City / Place of Origin

Latest Place of Residence
in Afghanistan
Mother Tongue

Foreign Languages

Ethnic Belonging

Religious Belief

Please, specify if Sunni or
Shi'a

Date of your arrival in Month Year
Austria

Number of Children

Number of Children living
in Austria

Number of relatives in
Austria

Please, specify who.
[husband, mother, ...]

8.3. Semi-guided interviews: Questions and Declaration of Consent

8.3.1. Qualitative interview questions

Today, I would like to get an insight into your perception of the world. Think of the most self-evident things that you encounter day by day, please.

Which are the differences between a woman's life in Pakistan and your life according to Afghan traditions?

For you personally, regardless of all exterior expectations, which aspects of your daily life are the most valuable to you?

Who is the most worthwhile person of your life?

Which positive characteristics distinguish your husband?

What does freedom mean to you?

Finally, I would like to know more about your perception of honor? Is honor positive for you?

Is it a burden? How is honor maintained? Which family member – apart from you – is responsible for maintaining honor?

8.3.2. Form for the Declaration of Consent on publishing the interview

Declaration of Consent - Interview

Herewith, I agree to the use of my data and answers for the research project in the context of the Master thesis of Mechthild Geyer. The Master thesis on *Patterns of Consciousness Formation among women belonging to the Dari-speaking Afghan Diasporas of Austria and Pakistan* is part of her degree program Global History and Global Studies at the University of Vienna.

Mechthild Geyer with her signature binds herself to the duty to delete all the sound material taken from our conversation by voice tracer after having finished the research project for her Master thesis. She guarantees that she won't use my assertions for any other project except of the Master thesis in the degree program Global History and Global Studies at the University of Vienna.

.....

Place and Date

.....

Interviewee

.....

Mechthild Geyer, MSc

8.4. Form for the Declarations of Consent of the project's participants on networking with the study's author

Declaration of Consent on Networking

Herewith, I, the undersigned,, consent to cooperate with Mechthild Geyer in future with respect to her research on Consciousness Formation within the Afghan Diaspora.

For that purpose, I guarantee with my below signature that I will network with Mechthild Geyer via Facebook and that I will keep up this connection until expressly cancelled.

Mechthild Geyer with her below signature warrants that she will treat all information acquired through our Facebook-Network as confidential and will not publish any of this information which facilitates conclusions on my real identity without my explicit consent.

Facebook-Nickname:

Mobile number:

Signature:

.....
Mechthild Geyer, MSc

.....
place, date

8.5. Abstract in English

The present study deals with patterns of consciousness formation that distinguish women who belong to the Dari-speaking Afghan diasporas of Austria and Pakistan. The most remarkable aspect of their consciousness appeared to be the collectivistic organization of their societies of origin. Furthermore, women from Afghanistan do identify the most with traditional gender roles that locate women into the private sphere and ascribe care work to their main tasks. This tradition is, first and foremost, maintained by a patrilocal power structure that, partially, degrades women to objects rather than self-reliant agents. The diaspora societies bear great chances in this regard, as they enable Afghan women to present themselves as subjects of their own history. This process is strongly related to the promotion of education of women, as – how this and former studies have shown - illiteracy among Afghan women is currently on a very high level.

This research project is based on a mixed methods approach in order to encompass either the societal expectations towards Afghan women with a quantitative inquiry and to grasp the individual opportunities of subversion of the hegemonic system with a qualitative inquiry as well. The author is based in Austria and made a one-week research stay in Pakistan for study purposes. The quantitative inquiry made use of questionnaires in the languages Dari, English and German. The qualitative inquiry is based on semi-structured interviews with six Afghan women in English and German and with two female Pakistani experts.

8.6. Abstract in German

Die vorliegende Studie setzt sich mit Formen von Bewusstseinsbildung bei Frauen auseinander, welche zur Dari-sprechenden afghanischen Diaspora in Österreich und Pakistan gehören. Der wesentlichste Aspekt ihres Bewusstseins ist die kollektivistische Organisation ihrer Herkunftsgesellschaften. Zudem identifizieren sich Frauen aus Afghanistan stark mit traditionellen Gender-Rollen, die die Frau in der privaten Sphäre einer Gesellschaft verorten und ihr diverse Pflegearbeit zuschreiben. Diese Tradition wird in erster Linie durch eine patrilokale Machtstruktur aufrechterhalten, die Frauen teilweise zu Objekten degradiert anstatt sie als selbstständig Handelnde anzuerkennen. In dieser Hinsicht bergen afghanische Diaspora-Gesellschaften großartige Chancen, da sie Frauen ermöglichen, als Subjekte ihrer eigenen Geschichte in Erscheinung zu treten. Dieser Prozess steht in direktem Zusammenhang mit der Förderung von Frauen-Bildung, da die Analphabetinnen-Rate sehr hoch ist, wie vorhergehende Studien ebenso gezeigt haben wie diese.

Dieses Forschungsprojekt basiert auf einem mixed methods approach, um sowohl mit der quantitativen Methode die gesellschaftlichen Erwartungen an Frauen zu erfassen, als auch die individuellen Möglichkeiten der Subversion des hegemonialen Systems mithilfe der qualitativen Methode zu begreifen. Die Autorin lebt in Österreich und hat einen einwöchigen Forschungsaufenthalt in Pakistan absolviert. Die quantitativen Daten wurden mit Fragebögen in den Sprachen Dari, Deutsch und Englisch erhoben. Die qualitative Erhebung erfolgte mithilfe von semi-strukturierten Interviews mit sechs afghanischen Frauen in den Sprachen Englisch und Deutsch sowie mit zwei pakistanischen Expertinnen.